

41

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Council Meeting Feb. 13, 2017

From: Cathe Steele
Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 12:35 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Council Meeting Feb. 13, 2017

Re Motion 8, we support implementing Province wide tax on foreign buyers.

Catherine & Peter Steele

42

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Property tax on foreign buyers

From: Stephen Saunders
Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 12:53 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Property tax on foreign buyers

I am opposed to this tax. Toronto flip flops every time mayor speaks. Look how well it's going in Vancouver. Why not look at new roads in Markham . Why build horrible looking town houses where the buyer needs to have medical to ensure getting up to top floor and back won't cause a heart attack. Thanks to Karen for providing this input. Steve

\

Hau, Lucy

43

Subject: FW: Foreign Buyer Tax

From: David Allison
Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 1:08 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Subject: Foreign Buyer Tax

Cc: "krea@markham.ca" <krea@markham.ca>

To the City of Markham:

Please urge our councillors to DEFEAT this motion. We do not need or want governmental intrusion and imposition of taxes for the purpose of reducing the value of our homes.

Please ensure a recorded vote.

Thank you

David Allison,

Hau, Lucy



Subject: FW: foreign buyer tax

From: Stuart Young
Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 1:22 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: foreign buyer tax

I am not in favour of the tax.

Regards,

Stuart Young

45

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Foreign Buyer Tax Motion

From: piat crisologo

Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 1:47 PM

To: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham; Bavington, Kitty

Subject: Foreign Buyer Tax Motion

Please record my **opposition to this tax**. It is unfair and discriminatory. My neighbours and I are strongly against this measure. Preserve the value of our homes.

P. Crisologo
Markham.

Hau, Lucy

46

Subject: FW: Support for Foreign Buyers Tax

From: Roger Correia

Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 2:10 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Support for Foreign Buyers Tax

I fully support introducing a Foreign Buyers Tax.

The house across the street has sat empty for over a year. It is owned by foreign investors.

Roger Correia

Hau, Lucy

47

Subject: FW: REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENT A FOREIGN BUYERS TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO

From: Angie Karas

Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 2:37 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENT A FOREIGN BUYERS TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO

To whom it may concern,

I am writing to express my strong support for this motion. However, if the Government of Ontario does not implement a foreign buyers tax across the Province, then the City of Markham must levy its own foreign buyers tax.

Thank you,

Angie Karas

48

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: land transfer tax

From: B & G Langhorst
Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 2:44 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: land transfer tax

We are in support of the motion requesting that the City of Markham be given provincial permission to charge foreign buyers an additional land transfer tax or a foreign buyers tax.

Beth & Gunter Langhorst

49

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Foreign Investor's tax

From: al

Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 3:45 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Subject: Foreign Investor's tax

If has been proven to be effective in Vancouver, then by all means IMPLEMENT IT HERE WITH HASTE.

It is unfortunate that it takes Governments such a long time to address a serious problem which the public has been aware of for several years i.e. house prices being artificially inflated to make home ownership impossible for families.

Al Eppich Markham

Sent from Windows Mail

Hau, Lucy

50

Subject: FW: Foreign Buyers Tax

From: Jackie Sheridan
Sent: February-09-17 4:23 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Foreign Buyers Tax

Dear Ms. Rea,

I am in favour of implementing a foreign buyers tax in Markham.

Kind Regards,

Jackie Sheridan

Hau, Lucy

51

Subject:

FW: TAX IMPLEMENTATION

From: Pat Young

Sent: February-09-17 4:57 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: TAX IMPLEMENTATION

HELLO

YES I AGREE WITH PUTTING A FOREIGN BUYERS TAX FOR THE CITY OF MARKHAM

PATRICK YOUNG

52

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: re tax on foreign buyers

From: Linda G.
Sent: February-09-17 5:03 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: re tax on foreign buyers

Hello

The foreign buyers tax needs to be instituted immediately. Houses are being sold with multiple offers at over inflated prices, every where. People are over extending themselves to pay these exorbitant prices and if interest rates ever went up , many would lose their homes.

It is crazy out there and mostly foreign buyers are buying them. Our millenials will never be able to own a home unless their parents help them, which is few. This is so sad. I also strongly think that all of the GTA needs this tax, not just certain cities, like Markham or Richmond Hill, as this would inflate the other areas of the GTA and deflate the other smaller areas. It has to be across the board. (GTA). Thanks.

Regards

Linda

Hau, Lucy

53

Subject: FW: Foreign Buyers Tax

From: Ed Bulgin
Sent: February-09-17 6:03 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Subject: Foreign Buyers Tax

Karen, in general I totally support you on the majority of proposals you put forward and I feel you do an excellent job as our councilor but I feel there are several assumptions being made in this proposal which from my perspective aren't substantiated by sound data.

- Young couples are finding it difficult to buy their first in Markham or Toronto but looking out to Ajax, Whitby or Oshawa homes are considerably more affordable and with Go train service, hwy 401 and hwy 407 readily accessible getting to the GTA is not an impossible burden to overcome. My wife and I moved to Markham 50 years ago not because it was our first choice of places to live but because we were just starting out it was affordable compared to North York which was our preferred location. At the time I commuted to the west end of the city and we survived.
- "an increase in foreign buyers" Do we have any accurate data on just what percentage of buyers are from off shore or is this more of a gut feel? How are we determining how much influence off shore buyers have on house prices?
- Is it possible government policy regarding the maintaining of low interest rates could be a more influential factor in supporting high house prices and personal debt?
- How many jobs depend on this current residential home building activity, be it new homes or in fill homes?
- People with money to invest will find other places to put their money and if off shore buyers are as big an influence on our housing industry as you suspect it could be detrimental to our economy in the long term.

I am by no means an expert on economics or the housing industry but I'm sure you have heard people refer to the fact that when governments artificially attempt to control markets, the end results often aren't ideal and I support that philosophy based on 75 years of watching us go through several scenarios.

I repeat that I am very impressed with the work you have done as our councilor but I have some reservations about this proposal in it's current format. If it is introduced across the province it could be detrimental to some areas that may depend on foreign investment and if not implemented everywhere could unfairly disadvantage other areas.

Regards,

Ed Bulgin

Hau, Lucy

54

Subject: FW: Foreign Buyers Tax motion

From: alacoe.mactavish

Sent: February-09-17 6:46 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Foreign Buyers Tax motion

Hello,

Please note that I live in Markham and received Councillor Karen Rea's Ward 4 Report outlining the motion put forward to implement a foreign buyers tax for the Province of Ontario. I 100% support this important motion.

Thank you for bringing this to light.

Sincerely,

Alacoe MacTavish

55

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Additional Land Transfer Tax to foreign buyers

From: TOM CHAN
Sent: February-09-17 6:55 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Additional Land Transfer Tax to foreign buyers

Hi,

I am writing this email to support an additional Land Transfer Tax applied to purchases by foreign buyers. Thanks for your attention.

Regards

Tom Ka Leung Chan

Hau, Lucy

56

Subject: FW: Foreign buyers tax

From: David Sweeney
Sent: February-09-17 8:58 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Foreign buyers tax

Please note that I am in favour of the Motion that has been tabled requesting the Province to implement a foreign buyers tax.

David Sweeney

57

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Not in favour of foreign buyer tax

From: John Campbell
Sent: February-09-17 6:51 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Not in favour of foreign buyer tax

John Campbell
Senior Vice President-Sales

58

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Defeat the foregn tax motion

From: Piat Allison

Sent: February-10-17 10:57 AM

To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Defeat the foregn tax motion

Why do we in Markham have to get on the bandwagon too. Let's stop this nonsense now. The value of our homes must be protected. Please do not let this foreign tax motion be passed. I hope that it will be a recorded vote so we can all see which councillors are listening to the people.

Piat.

Markham.

59

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: My opinion regarding request on 15% foreign buyer tax

From: Jun Liu

Date: Friday, Feb 10, 2017, 11:47 AM

To: Councillor, Amanda Collucci - Markham <ACollucci@markham.ca>

Subject: My opinion regarding request on 15% foreign buyer tax

Hi, Amanda,

I am a resident in your ward 6 in Markham and am writing to you about one of the motion items on next council meeting on Feb 13 regarding imposing foreign buyer tax across Ontario. I'd like to say this will be a very bad move!!

Some simple reasons are:

- A. Effectiveness of this tax is questionable - even in Vancouver, the policy still couldn't make the housing price low enough for young buyers;
- B. The potential proposal is going to hurt the single largest assets of existing homeowners' households.
- C. The current issue with housing price is reflective of the demographic change, which is more obvious in the latest released 2016 census - suggest the councilors all get familiar with that!
- D. Technically how to define "foreign buyers"?

From an economist's perspective, I can write on and on regarding the cons of this proposal but a strong argument is also coming from the recent relax of the similar policy by Vancouver - they are credited for correcting the mistakes and now we see here in Markham, the same premature idea is brought up again!!

Please as a councilor, speak against the proposal. Should u have any questions, let me know.

Jun Liu, CFA,FRM

Sent from my iPhone

60

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENTENT OF A FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX

From: Siobhan Covington

Sent: February-10-17 12:38 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENTENT OF A FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX

I fully support the motion proposed to request the Provincial Government to implement a foreign buyer's tax.

The reasons to support are succinctly outlined in the motion.

Foreign buyers are partially responsible for the significant increase in home prices in the GTA. This is making home ownership unattainable for vast numbers of young people trying to enter the housing market. Often these homes are left vacant for long periods of time contributing to the lack of rental inventory available and diminishing neighbourhoods. Foreign owners to not contribute to communities through Federal or Provincial taxes.

Housing prices are at a very dangerous and unsustainable level.

Council, thank you for addressing this very important issue of keeping Ontario livable for those who reside and work here.

Regards.

Siobhán Covington

President

Old Markham Village Ratepayers Association

61

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW:
Attachments: comments to foreign buyers tax.docx

From: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Sent: February-10-17 6:18 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Subject:

Hi Kitty
Here are the comments that I received through my website.
I have removed everyone's personal information and copied and pasted their remarks only.
Can this be included ?

Thanks

Karen Rea

Ward 4 Councillor
City Of Markham
101 Town Centre Blvd
Markham, Ontario, L3R 9W3
905-477-7000 ext 7751

Please help support my 360° Experience and donate using the following link:

<https://360kids.akaraisin.com/84CF4A18DFEE494681320AFC4C630DAB/KarenRea>

This e-mail contains information that may be privileged and/or confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, any disclosure, distribution, copying or other use of this e-mail or the information contained herein or attached hereto is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify this sender immediately and delete this e-mail without reading, printing, copying or forwarding it to anyone. Thank you for your co-operation.



the young generation can no longer dream of being a homeowner it is gravely sad

our housing has put our younger generation out of the market very gravely sad

Everywhere I go, whether it is walking the dog, the chiropractor, the hospital or shopping, everyone is fed up with the foreign investors and the big monster homes. It is definitely a reoccurring theme.

We should also have a way of finding out where the funds are coming from when houses are paid for in full without a mortgage. I know of more than one foreign university student who bought homes paid in full with family money from overseas. In one instance, the student has now graduated and at the age of 25 owns 3 homes worth between 1.2 and 3 million bought as investments by family overseas.

We are currently deciding where to move. We are not liking the direction our community is taking. Our neighbours, we are a tight bunch. We help each other out and we use to have amazing sense of community. Unfortunately, as people move out, the new people moving in add nothing to the community. Most are foreign investors or shady realtors. They tear down homes and disrupt our way of life. Some homes have renters - who let the weeds grow taller than my 5' 3" frame. In other cases the homes sit empty except that occasionally we see a very expensive car parked in the garage and some young fellow puttering about. Then, 'poof' they are gone. Unscrupulous realtors purchase from seniors low. Then 6 weeks later, the homes are flipped. They are robbing these poor seniors. Then the house sells. Then it sits empty. I walk my dog in the neighbourhood and I see this often. Two of our former neighbours, who sold, were lied to. "I am buying this house for my parents. They are in China but are coming here. They would love your garden." or "We love your house. It is perfect for my son/daughter who is getting married." Both former neighbours feel deceived. They never would have sold their homes to investors or someone that wanted to destroy our street. So, we are in the process of saying 'farewell' to Markham. I will miss some aspects but I do not trust my new neighbours.

feel Markham should be doing something like Vancouver to slow the real estate market. I live on XXXXXXXX Dr. and all the houses in my area are being bought up by non residents and used as rentals or left vacant. In the rentals are often more than 1 family and are not being kept up and the vacant houses are not either. The house next to me has been vacant since the end of the summer. I have heard that the non resident owners want to use them as student rentals for non resident students once the university opens. Our children and grandchildren will never be able to afford to live in the area competing with cash bully offers and that is wrong, I also agree with your idea for senior residents on the St. Joseph school property. Many of the condos such as Swan Lake are just too expensive for many of our seniors to afford and there is nothing like you are suggesting now that the cottages behind Union Villa are being vacated.

Not only should we have the tax implemented, but purchasers should be required to live in Ontario.

No to the 15%. 10% is better and a guarantee that the house not be left vacant

I believe that a tax would help to reduce the artificial inflation of the housing prices in this area by speculator. However we still have the problem of houses sitting empty as people buy them and then go "home" for a significant portion of the year.

Something has to change. We need to make a conscious effort to ensure that our children (including those born here) have the opportunity to live here!!!!!!

Something has to change. We need to make a conscious effort to ensure that our children (including those born here) have the opportunity to live here!!!!!!

Any measure that would curtail the obscene and artificial escalation of housing prices (including my own) is long overdue and should have been undertaken long before reaching the current state of absolute unaffordability for the next generation !!

foreign investment in Canadian real estate is skewing the market, and making it un-affordable for our young people.

A land speculation tax may be more effective, i.e., a tax on anyone flipping or not using the property.

And also the vacancy tax for homes left vacant with out a reasonable excuse

This tax on foreign investors will help to allow seniors like me to get a break on the high property tax that I have to pay or be forced to sell and move from the city I lived for 25 years and want to live when I retire. but can't afford to with the increase in cost of living in Markham.

Young adults who have grown up in this area are not able to afford housing due to the rapidly increasing prices of homes. Imposing this tax would help to level the playing field.

This is long overdue. Vacant properties and those rented out with out upkeep by the owners needs to be addressed and this might be the way. Also is vacant property taxed at a different rate?

Yes, we have to keep the investors out, so that people who want houses and a Markham neighbourhood to live in, can afford it.

Do this and more. The house prices are ridiculous and I am very skeptical of the purchasing from foreign investment. Killing my neighbourhood. I am appalled.

Investment in long-term job creation is a different matter. I prefer banning foreign home ownership outright.

How does taxing the few foreign buyers in the Toronto market make someone earning \$40,000, or \$60,000 or \$80,000 afford a house for \$800k? The reason why people cannot afford houses is because the money they have after income tax, gas tax, health tax, HST, house tax, outrageous Hydro bills, heating, protected insurance companies, protected telecom companies etc etc - is zero. Not a single politician has said anything about the real reason prices have gone up - the supply of new houses is being restricted by the density restrictions from the province, and no new land developments are being approved for detached homes. It also is being exacerbated by a "small detail" that all politicians seem to conveniently miss - the intake of 400,000 new immigrants (not including refugees) every year. I am always willing to pay attention to a sensible conversation.

The tax should be held on the sale of the house. A capital gains tax that many foreigners are not claiming or paying. Also, vacancy tax should be charged for homes not occupied.

You have raised the issue of vacant properties in our city and I know of at least one circumstance where the property is occupied by a foreign student who can't seem capable of even putting out the garbage let alone doing any other basic maintenance on the property. In my view we need to tighten up on property standards and one only has to drive through the Cornell neighbourhood to see examples of poorly maintained front yards. I don't know if the Vancouver action has been effective in curbing absentee vacant ownership but I support any initiative that would deter absentee ownership where the property is left vacant and poorly maintained

Something has to be done ASAP or local kids will never be able to own a home!

The young people in our community can no longer afford housing its time to stop the insanity

I am opposed to any form of additional taxes on homes for 2 reasons: 1) they don't work as foreign buyers can set up a numbered company for under \$1,000 and purchase homes through them and 2) anytime the government gets involved with the free market they screw it up. Let the market sort itself out.

I have lived in Markham my entire life as have my parents. I cannot afford to buy a house. My mother currently lives on her own in a house she has been in for 58 years. I think it is ridiculous that houses all around her are being torn down and monster homes are being built and about the only people who seem to be able to afford these houses at the ridiculous prices are "foreign investors". Yes, my mother could get over a million dollars for her property, but she would not be able to stay in Markham because of the exhorbi

Houses are meant to be lived in. Vacant houses are unsightly and unsafe.

What other ideas are out there to help protect affordable housing. Young people starting out have no way of buying a house, or townhouse in Markham with prices as they are. Yes it is good for all us Seniors still living in our homes but my son will have to move to the north even to afford rent on a 3 bedroom home.

A 15% tax will not stop foreign investments but will increase the price of resale properties. Instead, increase the property tax by 50 or 100% and put it to good use like providing inexpensive senior housing .

I'd also like to see a duty or tax on vacant buildings

housing prices are soaring and something needs to be done, or our children will not be able to afford anything in the future

But not as much as BC. To my understanding, foreign investors were buying BC and leaving units vacant. I do not see the vacancy here in Markham but I do see lots of foreign investment driving the real estate beyond the reasonable financial limits. I think a moderate foreign tax can calm the market and allow for local competitiveness.

62

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Foreign buyers tax

-----Original Message-----

From: Anastasios Ioannidis

Sent: Thursday, February 09, 2017 4:45 PM

To: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Foreign buyers tax

I fully support the foreign buyers tax.

Tom Ioannidis

63
Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: ward 4 report

From: Hans Boehnke
Date: Saturday, Feb 11, 2017, 8:42 AM
To: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham <KRea@markham.ca>
Subject: RE: ward 4 report

Hi Karen

I am in favour of the motion #8
Thanks for being such a good councillor.

Hans

Hau, Lucy

64

Subject:

FW: FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO

From: Debbie Burton **Sent:** February-11-17 2:23 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham; Bill Burton

Subject: FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO

We are in support of the motion tabled requesting the Province of Ontario to implement a foreign buyers tax (similar Vancouver's 15% property charged). We agree that the implementation would "*help to cool an over-inflated market*". We already see it happening in our area with the growing number of vacant properties.

Thanks

Debbie and Bill Burton

65

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Support for Foreign Buyer's Tax

From: Michael Hayes

Sent: February-11-17 3:13 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Support for Foreign Buyer's Tax

I support the Motion 8 (1) in favour of establishing a Foreign Buyer's Tax in Ontario.

Michael Hayes

66

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Motion for Ontario to implement a Foreign Buyer's Tax

From:]

Sent: February-12-17 7:04 AM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Motion for Ontario to implement a Foreign Buyer's Tax

Pursuant to Councillor Karen Rea's Quarterly Report, I have read, and am in complete agreement with, a Motion to the Province to implement a Foreign Buyer's Tax similar to the one implemented in Vancouver for all other reasons outlined in motion.

Sincerely,

Lee Anne Kuyt

67

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Foreign buyer tax.

-----Original Message-----

From: CICCHINI [<mailto:spy511@rogers.com>]

Sent: February-12-17 1:38 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Subject: Foreign buyer tax.

Hi all. This is a law which has worked in BC. If we don't do something our streets will be filled with empty homes.

Paul Cicchini Jr.

68

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Item 8 Council Meeting February 13, 2017

From: Elisabeth Tan
Sent: February-12-17 2:02 PM
To: Mayor & Councillors; Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Anthony Tan
Subject: Item 8 Council Meeting February 13, 2017

Dear Mayor & Councillors,

We are in support of below motion (Council Meeting February 13, 2017), since the extra tax did have an impact in Vancouver to slow down home sales to foreign investors:

8. NOTICES OF MOTIONS

- (1) REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENT
A FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO
SIMILAR TO THE CITY OF VANCOUVER (13.2),

We are hoping, you will support Karen Rae's motion.

Regards,

Elisabeth & Anthony Tan
Ward 4 Residents

Hau, Lucy

69

Subject: FW: Sales tax on real estate by foreign investors

-----Original Message-----

From: Brenda Swenor
Sent: February-12-17 2:51 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Sales tax on real estate by foreign investors

I would like to voice my agreement to a bill to implement a housing tax to foreign investors.

It is obscene how prices are escalating-negating our children and first time buyers being in a financially safe position to buy a home.

Our modest homes in Markham which would be perfect for a lot of new buyers are being sold at astronomical prices which they cannot possibly afford. Let's do something to make it fairer for our community (children/first time buyers) to afford to buy a home. There is so much greed in the marketplace right now we have to do our best to be ethical and fair to our local buyers' hopes for home ownership.

With thanks.

Brenda Swenor

70

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Support for Motion #8 Foreign Buyers Tax

From: Flora Li
Sent: February-12-17 10:26 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Support for Motion #8 Foreign Buyers Tax

Hello,

My name is Flora Li and I am a resident of Markham (Ward 4). I am writing in support of a foreign buyers tax for Toronto, similar to Vancouver.

Housing is an important element in providing safety and security for people. When the housing market is overheated, it signals a deterioration in a community's well-being. Foreign buyers can negatively skew community programs, education and general dynamics of a community. By implementing an additional tax, it can serve to deter foreign buyers and at the same time, provide tax dollars to be reinvested in our communities.

I think that in addition to a tax during purchase, if it is found that the property is not in use or resold during a short period of time, an additional tax should be charged as penalty.

All in all, I am in support of this motion.

Thank you,

Flora Li

71

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Foreign buyer tax

-----Original Message-----

From: steven allman

Sent: February-13-17 5:38 AM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Foreign buyer tax

Hello. I'm a resident of ward 4. Im writing to express my family's support for the foreign buyer tax proposal.

Regards

S. Allman

72

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Motion 8

-----Original Message-----

From: Elena Pecchia

Sent: February-13-17 7:05 AM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Motion 8

I am in support of Motion 8 . Please consider it very seriously.

Elenora Pecchia



**Ontario Real Estate
Association**



**Toronto
Real Estate
Board**

SERVING GREATER TORONTO REALTORS®

February 13, 2017

Mayor Frank Scarpitti
City of Markham
101 Town Centre Boulevard
Markham, Ontario
L3R 9W3

Dear Mayor Scarpitti,

On behalf of the Members of the Toronto Real Estate Board, from across the GTA, and the Members of the Ontario Real Estate Association, we are writing with regard to Motion 1, included on the Council Meeting agenda for February 13, which requests the Government of Ontario to implement a foreign buyer's tax.

For the reasons that we have outlined below, we urge Markham City Council not to consider this. A foreign buyer's tax would do little to address the growing affordability challenges in the Greater Toronto Area, and could have negative consequences for our broader economy. **As such, we strongly recommend that this motion not be approved by Markham Council.**

Foreign Buyers in the GTA

Until recently, there has been little or no reliable data on how much of the market foreign buyers actually make up. For this reason, TREB recently commissioned Ipsos Public Affairs to survey our members with regard to the number of transactions that they facilitated for foreign buyers. **This survey shows that only an estimated 4.9 per cent of GTA transactions, in which TREB Members acted on behalf of a buyer, involved a foreign purchaser. The vast majority of foreign buyers purchased a home as a primary residence (40% in GTA, 45% in York Region), to rent out to tenants in an extremely tight GTA rental market (25% in GTA and 21% York Region), or for another family member to live in (15% in GTA, 12% in York Region).**

According to our research, most foreign buyers are looking to buy a family home for personal use, to supply the rental market or for family members. This is essential to Ontario's economic success and the cultural vibrancy of Canada. We encourage you to consider this in the context of sound public policy and reliable data.

Housing Supply Factors are a Real Concern

The demand side of the price growth equation should not be considered in a vacuum. Instead, both demand and supply issues should be considered as contributors to the growing affordability challenge. Of particular importance is what could be done at the local and provincial levels to bring more supply into the marketplace. For example, the provincial government should work with its municipal counterparts to look at ways in which the supply of housing could be increased. Areas of research could include:

- Revisiting land use designations in built-up areas to allow for a broader array of home types to be built. It is important to recognize that more than three-quarters of households in the GTA continue to be pointed at some form of low-rise home type.
- Look at ways to streamline the development approvals process.
- Look at ways to streamline the permit process.
- Look at ways to incent land owners to develop.

Looking at the GTA in particular, 2016 saw 113,000 residential sales (including condominium apartments) through TREB's MLS® System. This second consecutive record sales year was up against approximately 150,000 new listings – a decline compared to 2015. This illustrates the amount of competition between buyers that currently exists in the marketplace today, which has prompted double-digit annual increases in low-rise home prices (MLS® Home Price Index and average prices) and high single-digit increases in condominium apartment prices. **With this in mind, even if a demand-focused policy were to reduce sales by between five and ten per cent, we would still experience seller's market conditions in the GTA, quite possibly with the continuation of double-digit price increases for low-rise home types.**

As discussed above, the only sustainable way to bring about more balance, and thereby more moderate annual rates of price growth, in the marketplace would be to develop new or modify existing policies to allow for a greater supply of listings. At current sales levels, we would need to see approximately 200,000 to 210,000 new listings per year to achieve a balanced market, based on historic norms. This would require an additional 50,000 to 60,000 new listings per year.

Mayor Tory and City of Toronto Staff Oppose

Given that the motion before Markham City Council references a City of Toronto motion asking Toronto staff to review the possibility of a Toronto foreign buyer tax, it is important for Markham City Council to have the full picture on this aspect. Firstly, the motion, which was moved by Councillor Jim Karygiannis, only asked for staff to review and report back on a potential Toronto foreign buyer tax. This was in no way an expression of support for such a tax, in principle, by Toronto City Council. Secondly, City staff have reported on this issue during the City's recent budget process, and it is important to note that the staff report raised numerous concerns with

implementing such a tax. Thirdly, on numerous occasions, Mayor Tory has been on record as opposing the implementation of a foreign buyer's tax, as has Premier Wynne.

Legal Concerns Have Been Raised in B.C.

Notwithstanding the very different British Columbia real estate market, an Ontario foreign buyer's tax could be subject to some of the same legal challenges that have arisen there. With this in mind, it is not clear that the B.C. foreign buyer's tax will survive potential legal challenges based on international trade agreements, the limits of provincial jurisdiction, and discrimination.

In summary, REALTORS® encourage Markham City Council to reject this motion and ask you to promote Markham as a welcoming destination for all those looking for a better future.

Thank-you for your consideration of our views.

Sincerely,



Larry Cerqua
President
Toronto Real Estate Board



Ray Ferris
President
Ontario Real Estate Association

c.c. Markham City Council
Premier Kathleen Wynne
The Hon. Charles Sousa, Minister of Finance
The Hon. Bill Mauro, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing
Patrick Brown, Leader, Ontario Progressive Conservative Party
Andrea Horwath, Leader, Ontario New Democratic Party
Lynn Dollin, President, Association of Municipalities of Ontario
Clark Sommerville, President, Federation of Canadian Municipalities
Ontario Home Builders Association
Building Industry and Land Development Association

Submitted by:

Christiane Bergauer-Free & Ian Free

Re: Markham Council Meeting, February 13, 2017
Agenda Item #7

Foreign Tax Motion: Karen Rae Feb.13.17

- Agree to the motion.
- Would also like to see some request to the Federal Government in order to track foreign ownership, which would enable the Federal Government to collect their Income and Capital Gains Tax from Non-Resident Sales.
- Would request from the Federal Government to make it Mandatory for Withholding Tax of 15% on any Sale by Non Residents on closing (They can get this back by filing a tax return and paying any outstanding tax)
- Would request from the Federal Government/Provincial/Municipal governments to institute 'Vacancy Tax' on any Vacant Foreign Owned Housing (Vacancies deteriorate and destroy established neighbourhoods/communities.....concerns = safety, environmental (rodents), quality of living value, services etc.)
- Would request all Foreign Ownership Sales be monitored, reported and recorded by the Municipality (s) to the Provincial and Federal Governments to maintain records for purpose of Taxations and Investments and possible criminal/fraudulent activities.

75

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: New submission from Rea Contact Form

From: Kevin Li

Sent: Monday, February 13, 2017 4:59 PM

To: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: New submission from Rea Contact Form

Hi Karen,

Just want to say thank you very much when I saw the following
REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENT
A FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO
SIMILAR TO THE CITY OF VANCOUVER (13.2)

It's time to take actions to allow our children to have their affordable homes.

Our houses are for our people who live, work in our city and pay income taxes to our governments and polices, fire fighters, etc. should not for foreigners who buy houses and do nothing for our governments, polices... The money we paid for our house is after taxes dollars. The money the foreigner paid for houses is not. Not fair.

Again, thank you for your great job.

Kevin

75

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Strongly support in the motion to implement a foreign buyer's tax across the province of Ontario.

From: Mingren Li
Sent: February-13-17 5:47 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Strongly support in the motion to implement a foreign buyer's tax across the province of Ontario.

Good afternoon,

I am writing to strongly support in the motion moved by Councillor Karen Rea and seconded by Councillor Alan Ho

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF ONTARIO TO IMPLEMENT A FOREIGN BUYER'S TAX
ACROSS THE PROVINCE OF ONTARIO
SIMILAR TO THE CITY OF VANCOUVER (13.2)

I, my wife and my daughter strongly support in the motion because

First, our children are or will be the main force in building the future of our country. To work and live, they need affordable houses;

Second, our houses are for our peoples who live and working in our country and pay income taxes to our governments, polices, fire fighters, not for foreigners who buy our houses and do nothing for our people, governments, police, fire fighters...

Third, The money we paid, are paying or will pay is after income taxes dollars, but foreigner buyer' s are not. They never pay a single cents income taxes, It's not fair for us.

Thanks,

Kevin

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: I support foreign tax motion

From: Liz and Ralph
Sent: Monday, February 13, 2017 6:28 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty
Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: I support foreign tax motion

Hello,

I want to let you know I support the motion requesting the to implement a foreign buyers tax similar to Vancouver.

I've copied Karen Rea on this email.

Elizabeth Brown

77

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: ward 4 report

From: Luyang Yan

Sent: February-13-17 4:32 PM

To: Bavington, Kitty

Cc: Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham

Subject: Re: ward 4 report

Thank you for the report! Have been following all the time and love it!

Regarding the foreign buyer tax implementation, I'm writing to express my prudent non-support before more details/conditions become available.

Thanks & regards,

Luyang (Ryan)

78

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Ontario Foreign Buyers Home Buyer Legislation.

From: paul dean
Sent: February-13-17 4:16 PM
To: Bavington, Kitty; Councillor, Karen Rea - Markham
Subject: Ontario Foreign Buyers Home Buyer Legislation.

This e-mail will serve as my support for the City of Markham to pass a resolution requesting that province implement legislation requiring that foreign buyers of residential real estate in the province of Ontario are subject to an automatic foreign buyers tax of 15% on the purchase price of a home.

Foreign buyers are purchasing large numbers of homes across Markham and throughout Ontario for speculative purposes only. In some cases individuals are purchasing multiple numbers of homes with no intent whatsoever to actually reside in these homes. The homes sit empty for months or years at a time. This benefits no one but the foreign buyer, The municipality loses taxes and the price of real estate is driven up so much that many first time home buyers are priced out of the housing market. Many of these homes sit empty for months at a time thus impacting negatively on many residents, school enrollment, municipal tax revenue etc. The province of British Columbia took action with the desired results. Let's do the right thing now and ask the province to pass similar legislation now

Paul

Paul Dean