

BA Consulting Group Ltd. 45 St. Clair Avenue West, Suite 300 Toronto, Ontario M4V 1K9 416.961.7110(phone) 416.961.9807(fax) www.bagroup.com bagroup@bagroup.com

Memorandum

To:

Jim Baird Commissioner of Development Services Town of Markham

Fax: (905) 479-7768

Copy:

Dave Clark Town Architect Town of Markham Fax: (905) 479-7768

From:

Reachel O. Knight Ralph Bond

Date:

May 19, 2005

Project:

6111.06

Markham Paid Parking
Implementation Plan-Phase One
P:\61\11\06\Memos\Town of Markham-Paid Parking
Programs-ROK.doc

Page 1 of 2

Subject: Parking Rates and Fine Structure

Further to the discussions at the May 17 Development Services Committee (DSC) presentation, we have prepared this memorandum to briefly outline the rationale for the proposed parking rates and fines. As requested by DSC, we have provided in Table 1 a comparison of the parking rates and fines at comparable municipalities.

Table 1
Paid Parking Program Comparison

			Parking Fines	
	Meter Rate/	Parking Time	Voluntary	Set
City	Hour	Limit	Payment	Fines
	\$1.00 to	2 hours*/3		
Toronto	\$3.00	hours**	N/A	\$30.00
Mississauga	\$1.00	2 hours	\$20.00	\$25.00
Oakville	\$1.00	2 hours	N/A	\$8/\$30***
Oshawa	\$1.00	2 hours	\$10.00	\$15.00
Kingston	\$1.50	2 hours	\$10.00	\$15.00

^{*}Parking Time Limit 2 hours maximum from 08:00 to 18:00

Rate Structure

When developing a rate structure it is important to price the parking stalls according to the needs of the expected parkers. For example, industrial and commercial employment centre needs are normally focused around the 9 to 5 workday. As a result, the parkers coming into these districts normally have a longer duration of stay. Low priced flat rates normally function well in this environment because it accommodates the long stay parker and decreases violations related to non-payment because the rate is reasonable.

In areas, where the parking stalls are convenient and the adjacent uses such as retail and restaurant create high to moderate turn over, a relatively high hourly parking rate, sometimes with parking duration restrictions is required. The use of such rates and regulations ensures space availability and increases potential earnings.

^{**}Parking Time Limit 3 hours maximum from 18:00 to 21:00

^{***\$8} Fine for parking at an expired metered/\$30 Fine for parking past the 2-hr time limit

When examining the short stay rates for the comparable cities noted above the average rate was \$1.00/hour (excluding City of Toronto Downtown Core rates). The long stay meter on-street rates for the City of Toronto range from \$4.00 to \$6.00. These rates were put in place to compete with off-street competitor rates that ranged from \$6.00 to \$8.00 daily.

In Markham, the Ferrier/Acadia area is the only area which is located in an active retail/commercial environment that will generate relatively high turnover due to the presence of restaurant uses. Therefore we have recommended that rates be set at \$1.00 per hour in this location. The Cox Boulevard on-street parking is expected to generate short-term duration demand for visitors to the adjacent residential development and the proposed rates are also \$1.00 per hour. The parking located on the Clegg Boulevard extension, north of the Hilton Hotel will also service demand from visitors and possibly employees in the Hotel, once the hotel starts charging for parking later this year. In this area we have proposed a flat rate of \$2.00 as a starting point. This rate might be adjusted or the duration of stay limited, once we confirm the paid parking details for the Hilton Hotel.

In contrast, the on-street parking provided in the Allstate area is expected to capture only longer term duration employee or student demand. Seneca College which will begin operation in September 2005, will implement paid parking at a rate of \$4.00 per day for students. In addition, the on-site supply of parking at Seneca will not be fully utilized during the first year of operation and the on-street parking will not be as convenient in terms of walking distance. In order to capture some of this demand, the on-street parking rate must be set below the Seneca rate. We have proposed a rate of \$2.00 per day which could increase to \$3.00 and possibly \$4.00 as the College's on-site parking fills up.

Enforcement/Fine Setting

Compliance with on-street paid parking regulations vary among the type of parkers and can be managed through effective enforcement. Short stay high turn over parking normally has lower compliance whereas long stay parking normally has high compliance. Therefore enforcement practices should be developed around this notion by patrolling short term areas (\$1/hour) more frequently than the long term (\$2/day) areas.

When setting parking fines it is important to select a rate which is high enough to deter people from trying to avoid paying for the parking; but at same time not appear as if the Municipality is gouging the customer. Fines are typically set up in such a way that there is a voluntary fine that is paid within a week of receiving an infraction and a set fine that is paid after the voluntary time period; the voluntary fine is less than the set fine. However, the voluntary rate should be set high enough so that even if the parker has a small chance of being ticketed, it will cost at least the same as or preferably more than paying for parking at the posted rate.

In the initial phases of introducing paid parking in Markham, we feel it is important to conduct enforcement activities at a light to moderate level in order to minimize negative public feedback. Often, it is not the amount of the fine that angers people, but the frequency of ticket issuing and the perceived low tolerance of enforcement personnel for what customers view as minor infractions. In our opinion, it is advisable to have a higher fine amount and less enforcement than a lower amount and higher enforcement levels. With this in mind, we recommend that the fine structure be set the same as the City of Mississauga rate of \$20 for voluntary payment and \$25.00 for the set fine, and enforced at a light to moderate level. Each year, parking rates, enforcement procedures and fines should be reviewed and adjusted to reflect actual operating experience.