

**HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING
TOWN OF MARKHAM
Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre
Wednesday, May 14, 2008**

Members

Joyce Nelson-Watt, Chair
Judith Dawson, Vice-Chair
Susan Casella
Ted Chisholm
Deirdre Kavanagh
James Makaruk
Sylvia Morris
Barry Nelson
Denise Sabatini-Fuina
Councillor Valerie Burke
Councillor Carolina Moretti
Councillor Joe Virgilio

Regrets

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning
George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
Candy Davidovits, Committee Secretary

Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

The Chair convened the meeting at 7:20 p.m. by asking for any declarations of interest with respect to items on the agenda. Disclosures of interest were declared by the following members:

Joyce Nelson-Watt disclosed a conflict on Items 19 and 20 as the applicants are her neighbours.

Councillor Carolina Moretti disclosed a conflict on Item 19 as her son lives on Peter Street.

Councillor Carolina Moretti disclosed a conflict on Item 22 as her son works for Fieldgate Homes.

Sylvia Morris disclosed a conflict on Item 25 (Addendum Agenda Item 2) as one of the applicants, Carolyn Pannell, does work with her.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda and addendum agenda be approved.

CARRIED.

2. ADOPTION OF MINUTES
FOURTH HERITAGE MARKHAM MEETING
APRIL 9, 2008 (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on April 9, 2008, be received and adopted.

CARRIED.

3. DESIGNATION PROPOSAL
TO RECOGNIZE AND PROTECT VINEGAR DIP (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham defer this item at the request of Diane More to the next meeting of the Committee to be held on June 11, 2008.

CARRIED.

4. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NO. 08 114308 DP
12 EUCLID STREET
REPLACEMENT OF AN EXISTING HOUSE (DEMOLITION PERMIT)(16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

The following persons addressed the Heritage Markham Committee in support of this application:

- Ms. Maria Gatzios, MCIP, RPP, Gatzios Planning and Development Consultants Inc., on behalf of the current owner and the potential purchaser;
- Mr. Evan Mr. McDonald, current owner of the property; and
- Mr. Mac Cosburn, potential purchaser.

Mr. Cosburn indicated that the dwelling does not meet the needs of his family and he was not interested in adding a complementary addition. He stated that he will be willing to work with staff and the Committee on achieving a new complementary dwelling of approximately 3000 sq. ft. and willing to work to preserve the natural vegetation.

Issues as to whether the dwelling was of architectural and contextual value to the heritage district were extensively debated.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the demolition of the existing house at 12 Euclid Street be allowed provided that the applicant:

- gives an undertaking to build a new house that is not greater than 3,000 square feet; and
- takes great efforts to protect the trees on the property.

CARRIED.

5. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NO. HE 08 112403

22 JOHN STREET

SIDING REPLACEMENT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

The following persons addressed the Heritage Markham Committee in support of this application:

- Mr. David Jordon, agent for the owner; and

- Mr. Steven Medwecky, property owner.

Staff presented illustrations of the subject dwelling prior to the removal of the original front windows, front door and transom. Issues raised by the Committee included the importance of preserving original materials on heritage buildings; the need to improve/restore the existing condition of the dwelling; and that heritage buildings often have a weathered patina which demonstrates their age.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham request the applicant to resubmit his Heritage Permit to include the restoration of the front windows and door to their original state, with the guidance of Heritage Staff;

AND THAT Heritage Markham further requested that the applicant:

- try to maintain as many of the original siding boards as possible when repairing the wood siding on the house;
- re-install any original boards that can be removed and restored on the front wall of the house; and
- install any new siding boards on the sides of the house.

CARRIED.

6. DESIGNATION

FILE NO. 07 128266 HP

7943 9TH LINE

INTENTION TO DESIGNATE UNDER PART IV OF THE ONTARIO
HERITAGE ACT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the designation of the Sylvester Tomlinson House located at 7943 9th Line under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act;

AND THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the Sylvester Tomlinson house be placed on the new foundation applied for in Building Permit #07 128266 HP and restored according to the approved drawings.

CARRIED.

7. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
9506 HIGHWAY #48
PROPOSED RESTORATION PLAN (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
N. Surti, Project Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed back entrance and porch for the Albert Wideman House;

THAT the three turned posts of the front verandah be spaced evenly like the historic verandah at 7833 Reesor Road;

THAT the restoration plans include textual details of the restoration (ie. Replica chimney to be reintroduced, existing windows to remain, etc.);

AND THAT final approval of the restoration plan be delegated to Heritage Section staff.

CARRIED.

8. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NO. 08 113390 DP
PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF HERITAGE OUT-BUILDING (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the outbuilding located at 4228 19th Avenue provided the owner advertises the structure for relocation or salvage in the local newspaper or provides proof of a salvage contract for the building satisfactory to Heritage Section Staff

CARRIED.

9. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NOS. 08 114800 001 00 DP AND 08 148000 0000 DP

5126 ELGIN MILLS ROAD

PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF HOUSE AND BARN (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed demolition of the house located at 5126 Elgin Mills Road;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the barn complex at 5126 Elgin Mills Road, provided that the owner advertises the barns for relocation or salvage in the local papers or provides proof of a salvage contract for the barns to the satisfaction of Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED.

10. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT CONSENT APPLICATION
FILE NO. B/08/08
157 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE
VEHICULAR AND PEDESTRIAN ACCESS EASEMENTS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Consent Application B/08/08.

CARRIED.

11. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NO. 08-112894 HP
107 JOHN STREET
PROPOSED NEW WINDOWS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive Building Permit 08 112894 as information (staff delegated approval);

AND THAT Heritage Markham requests the new owner of 107 John Street to undertake the following:

- Replace the upper window on the north elevation as per the approved site plan drawings
- Replace/modify the main floor windows on the north elevation (west side) to include pane divisions according to the approved site plan.

CARRIED.

12. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION
189 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE
REVISED LANDSCAPE/COMMERCIAL PATIO (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed landscape enhancements at 189 Main Street, Unionville (Unionville Arms), but recommends that the staircase railings have a traditional upper and lower rail treatment.

CARRIED.

13. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NO. 08 113604 HP
5 JAMES WALKER COURT
REAR YARD DECK (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memo concerning a Building Permit for a rear yard deck at 5 James Walker Court as information.

CARRIED.

14. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION
144 MAIN STREET NORTH
COMMERCIAL RESTAURANT PATIO (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memorandum concerning the Heritage Permit application for 144 Main Street North, approved by Heritage Section staff on behalf of Heritage Markham, as information.

CARRIED.

15. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS
1 HERITAGE CORNERS LANE, 10 COLBORNE STREET, 125 JOHN STREET, 10 ALEXANDER HUNTER PLACE
HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS APPROVED BY STAFF (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memorandum concerning the Heritage Permit applications approved by Heritage Section staff on behalf of Heritage Markham as information.

CARRIED.

16. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)
Extract: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received as information:

1. Architectural Conservancy of Ontario: ACORN Journal, Spring 2008 Issue;
2. Old House Journal, May/June 2008 Issue;
3. Society for the Preservation of Historic Thornhill: Newsletter, May 2008;
4. Town of Markham Notice of Public Meeting: Second Suites (secondary residential units);
5. Town of Markham Notice of Public Meeting: Zoning Amendment and Draft Plan of Subdivision, 7085 Fourteenth Avenue;

6. Ontario Ministry of Culture: Letter advising of the Waiving of Tariff Fees for Historical Research at Land Registry Offices;
7. Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals Article: "Planning for Built Heritage Conservation in Ontario"; and
8. Heritage Canada Foundation: AGORA Heritage Discussion Group.

CARRIED.

17. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION
FILE NO. A/47/08
29 JAMES WALKER COURT
FRONT YARD GARAGE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to Minor Variance Application A/47/08.

CARRIED.

18. MARKHAM HERITAGE ESTATES
12049 HIGHWAY 48
RELOCATION OF DWELLING FROM WHITCHURCH-STOUFFVILLE
THOMAS BRUELS HOUSE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The issue of whether the dwelling was insulated with ureaformaldehyde was raised and if it was to be removed. Councillor Moretti indicated she had further information on this issue and would be consulting with staff.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

That this Item be received as information.

CARRIED.

19. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION
FILE NO. SC 08 114454

8 PETER STREET
PROPOSED 2 STOREY REAR ADDITION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed design of the addition to 8 Peter Street subject to:

1. further clarification of the window size and placement on the addition (north elevation); and
2. confirmation that a traditional wood window will be used for the new window on the south elevation;

AND THAT final approval of the proposed design be delegated to Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED.

Councillor Moretti, having declared a disclosure of interest with respect to Item 19 due to the fact that her son lives on Peter Street, did not participate in the discussion or voting on this item.

Joyce Nelson-Watt, having declared a disclosure of interest with respect to Item 19 due to the fact that the applicants are her neighbours, did not participate in the discussion or voting on this item.

20. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
12 HERITAGE CORNERS LANE
PROPOSED RESTORATION PLAN FOR THE JOHN KOCH HOUSE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

Ms. Holly MacDonald, applicant, addressed the Heritage Markham Committee in support of the application.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham is generally satisfied with the proposed exterior restoration plan for the John Koch House, with the exception of the need to redesign the kitchen window on the south elevation to a type typical of the period and style of the house;

THAT the placement of the dwelling on the lot be revised to move it slightly to the north and to the west to have a better interface with the dwelling to the south;

THAT when a Site Plan Control application is submitted, the adjustment of minor details, and approval authority be delegated to staff;

AND THAT the Site Plan Agreement is to contain provisions regarding heritage designation, heritage easement, materials, colours, etc. as outlined in the approved Restoration Approach.

CARRIED.

Joyce Nelson-Watt, having declared a disclosure of interest with respect to Item 20 due to the fact that the applicants are her neighbours, did not participate in the discussion or voting on this item.

21. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NOS. 08 115119 001 00 DP AND 08 115119 000 00 DP
6881 HIGHWAY #7 EAST
DEMOLITION OF TWO OUT-BUILDINGS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed demolition of the two heritage outbuildings located at 6881 Highway 7 East identified as Buildings A and B, provided that the owner:

- erects an 8 ft. chain link security fence around the Burkholder House;
- reboards the Burkholder House to protect it from animal infestation and weather damage; and
- advertises the two outbuildings for salvage or relocation according to Town policy, or produces a salvage contract for the two buildings satisfactory to Town Staff.

- That building C, one of the smaller sheds, be advertised for relocation to a site in the Town of Markham, if possible.

CARRIED.

22. HERITAGE ESTATES ELIGIBILITY

4551 ELGIN MILLS ROAD EAST

ARCHIBALD FENWICK HOUSE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT in view of the heritage significance of the Archibald Fenwick House at 4551 Elgin Mills Road East and the serious level of threat to it, Heritage Markham recommends that Council declare it eligible for relocation to Markham Heritage Estates;

THAT Heritage Markham confirms that the Archibald Fenwick House meets the criteria for relocation to Markham Heritage Estates as indicated in the Markham Heritage Estates Study (2004) and is on the list of the 16 most significant and most threatened buildings in Markham;

AND THAT the property owner be contacted to discuss the potential relocation of this vacant building to Markham Heritage Estates to secure their cooperation in making the house available for relocation.

CARRIED.

Councillor Moretti, having declared a disclosure of interest with respect to Item 22 due to the fact that her son works for Fieldgate Homes, did not participate in the voting on this item.

23. AWARDS

HERITAGE COMMUNITY RECOGNITION PROGRAM 2008 (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has the following nomination for the Heritage Community Recognition Program:

Built Heritage: Nigel Connell, past president of SPOHT.

CARRIED.

24. PLAQUES FOR BUILDINGS IN THE MOUNT JOY PORTION OF THE
MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning;
G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Markham Village Conservancy would like to implement an interpretive plaque program for heritage buildings within heritage conservation districts. An initial pilot project would focus on the Mount Joy area of Markham Village.

The following persons addressed the Heritage Markham Committee representing the Markham Village Conservancy:

- Donna Wigmore who circulated some historical information and photographs relating to Peter Street as well as details relating to the proposed plaques; and
- Elizabeth Plashkes.

The proposed plaques are oval in shape and made from aluminium with raised brushed aluminium lettering with a leatherette texture blue background. The plaque text would include the original owner, occupation and date of construction as well as the district name. The cost is approximately \$400 per plaque (including tax). The MVC is requesting a grant of \$3,300 from the Heritage Reserve Fund to cover a portion of the costs for 22 plaques. The MVC and the property owner would fund the remainder.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham support this program, in principle;

THAT this matter be referred to Council for consideration;

AND THAT Heritage Staff submit a report to Council on a design for the historical plaques than can be applied Town-wide.

CARRIED.

25. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NO. SC 07 126320

PROPOSAL TO DEMOLISH PART OF A DESIGNATED HERITAGE HOUSE
JOHN REESOR HOUSE
1 KALVINSTER DRIVE
CORNELL COMMUNITY (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Project Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a presentation on this application.

Mr. Brian Clements and Ms. Carolyn Pannell, the applicants, addressed the Markham Heritage Committee in support of this application.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the deputation by Brian Clements and Carolyn Pannell concerning the rear wing of the John Reesor House, and refer this matter to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for a site visit and recommendation.

CARRIED.

Sylvia Morris, having declared a disclosure of interest with respect to Item 25 due to the fact that she does work with Carolyn Pannell, did not participate in the discussion or voting on this item.

26. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION SC 07 126230
PROPOSED NEW HOUSE WITH ATTACHED TWO-CAR GARAGE
IRINA GORDON
179 JOHN STREET
THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
Carolyn Stobo, Legal Dept.
George Duncan, Project Planner
-

The Manager of Heritage Planning explained to the Committee that the Ontario Municipal Board (OMB) has elected to hear all of the application at one hearing June 18, 2008(demolition, site plan approval and variance applications). The Town's Legal Department has asked staff to provide any site plan conditions that would be applied should the OMB choose to support the applications. Heritage Markham had previously elected to not provide comment on the site plan application drawings as the Committee did not support the demolition.

The Committee agreed to provide comment on the proposed dwelling. The building's architectural style and its vertical emphasis given the high topography of the property were discussed as issues of concern.

Ms. Marion Matthias addressed the Heritage Markham Committee in opposition to the demolition of the house at 179 John Street.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the approval of a new dwelling to replace the existing dwelling at 179 John Street, Thornhill, and does not support the design of the proposed new dwelling, but has the following comments on the site plan elevation and drawings should the Ontario Municipal Board decide to support the demolition and approve the new dwelling:

- Standard site plan comments would apply (brick size/colour, externally applied muntins on windows, etc) as per the Heritage District Plan;
- The arched window on the east elevation is not appropriate and should be replaced by a rectangular 2/2 window;
- Windows on the west side are proposed to be multi-pane casement. Although it would appear they will not be readily visible, they should be consistent with the east and north elevations (2/2 traditional windows); and
- The size of the building should be revised to comply with depth provision of 16.8 m as per the zoning by-law.

CARRIED.

27. HERITAGE GRANTS
COMMERCIAL FAÇADE IMPROVEMENT GRANT PROGRAM
2008 SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEW (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham delegates its review and commenting roles on the 2008 Commercial Façade Improvement Grant submissions to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee.

CARRIED.

28. EXTENDED ABSENCE OF MEMBER - 2008

BARRY NELSON (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the anticipated absence of Barry Nelson from three consecutive Heritage Markham meetings during June, July and August 2008 due to business commitments outside of the country;

AND THAT his seat on the Committee not be declared vacant.

CARRIED.

29. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION
189 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE
REPAIRS TO UNIONVILLE ARMS (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Manager of Heritage Planning advised the Committee that during the renovation of the Unionville Arms, the building was demolished except for its façade and small portions of the north and south side walls needed to support the façade.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the laying of charges under the Ontario Heritage Act related to the demolition of the building at 189 Main Street, Unionville.

CARRIED.

30. 2008 DOORS OPEN EVENTS (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Susan Casella distributed information to the Markham Heritage Committee regarding the Doors Open Whitchurch-Stouffville event to be held June 7, 2008 from 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. and a publication from the Ontario Heritage Trust containing information on 2008 Doors Open events in Ontario.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive this item as information.

CARRIED.

The meeting adjourned at 10:20 p.m.