HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING TOWN OF MARKHAM Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre Wednesday, October 14, 2009

<u>Members</u> Regional Councillor Joe Virgilio Susan Casella Ted Chisholm Judith Dawson Councillor Carolina Moretti Sylvia Morris Denise Sabatini-Fuina Ronald Waine <u>Regrets</u> Councillor Valerie Burke

Deirdre Kavanagh James Makaruk Richard Morales Barry Nelson, Chair

<u>Staff</u>

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner Kitty Bavington, Committee Clerk

Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

Ronald Waine, Acting Chair, convened the meeting at 7:25 p.m. by asking for any declarations of interest with respect to items on the agenda. Councillor Carolina Moretti declared a conflict of interest in regard to Agenda Items # 4, 5, and 15, as her son lives on Peter Street, and did not participate in debate or vote on the matters.

1. <u>APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)</u>

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

2. MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 9, 2009 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on September 9, 2009 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION 216 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE REAR ADDITION TO VARLEY ART GALLERY (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning P. Fu, Manager of Capital ROW S. Hague, Asset Management

John Ryerson, Director of Culture, Garth Norbraten, Architect, Elizabeth Plashkes, and Bill Pickering, members of the Varley McKay Art Foundation were in attendance.

Mr. Ryerson gave a brief overview of the project. The Committee examined a 3D model of the building and made several comments regarding the visual impact of the heating/cooling structure on the roof. Timing of the project was discussed, with respect to delays that may be caused by further review, and Mr. Ryerson advised that the project is on target for an early spring start.

An amendment to the staff recommendation was proposed, delegating approval to the Architectural Subcommittee to review the screening material associated with the rooftop structure, and it was lost.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Site Plan Application in support of the proposed rear addition to the Varley Art Gallery;

THAT the proposed brick on the addition should match the brick on the main building in terms of colour and size;

AND THAT Heritage Section staff be authorized to provide any additional comment on design details, if required, on behalf of Heritage Markham.

4. HERITAGE PERMITS

APPLICATIONS APPROVED BY STAFF
ON BEHALF OF HERITAGE MARKHAM
26 COLBORNE STREET HE 09 123501
125 JOHN STREET HE 09 125202
161 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE HE 09 124015
27 VICTORIA AVENUE HE 09 125203
187 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE HE 09123534
48 WASHINGTON STREET HE 09 124247 AND HE 09 124772
14 PETER STREET HE 09 123998 (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Councillor Carolina Moretti declared a conflict of interest in regard to Agenda Item # 4, as her son lives on Peter Street, and did not participate in debate or vote on the matter.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memo concerning Heritage Permit Applications Approved by Staff on Behalf of Heritage Markham as information.

CARRIED

5. INFORMATION
45 PETER STREET, 20 PETER STREET,
111 & 131 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE
61 ROUGE STREET
TREE REMOVAL PERMITS
APPLICATIONS APPROVED BY STAFF (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Councillor Carolina Moretti declared a conflict of interest in regard to Agenda Item # 5, as her son lives on Peter Street, and did not participate in debate or vote on the matter.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memo concerning Tree Removal Permit Applications approved by staff as information.

 DESIGNATION AND HERITAGE EASEMENT NICHOLS FARMHOUSE AND LOUIS NICHOLS HOUSE 10519 AND 10521 WOODBINE AVE. FILE NO. 19TM-06007(16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning G. Day, Planner II

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommend to Council that the Nichols Farmhouse (10519 Woodbine Avenue) and the Louis Nichols House (10521 Woodbine Avenue), be approved for designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> as properties of cultural heritage value or interest;

AND THAT Heritage Markham recommend to Council that the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to enter into Heritage Easement Agreements for each of the houses, to fulfil the Conditions of Draft Approval for Subdivision 19TM-06007.

CARRIED

HISTORICAL PLAQUES
 MARKHAM HERITAGE ESTATES INTERPRETIVE PLAQUES
 PHASE 1 (16.11)
 Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the staff memo regarding the Markham Heritage Estates Interpretive Plaques as information.

CARRIED

8. DOORS OPEN PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING NOTES: EVENT WRAP-UP MEETING, SEPTEMBER 23, 2009 (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

Receive as information.

9. INFORMATION HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICTS MINISTRY OF CULTURE (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

Receive as Information.

CARRIED

10. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received:

- 1) Markham Economist & Sun, Saturday, September 12, 2009. Article on historic cemeteries.
- 2) Ontario Heritage Trust: Heritage Matters, September 2009. Special addition on places of worship.
- 3) Community Heritage Ontario: CHO News, October 2009.
- 4) Built Heritage News: Notice of lecture, Toronto The Age of Industry, November 10, 2009.
- 5) Ontario Heritage Trust: unveiling of a provincial plaque commemorating Jean Lumb, October 24, 2009.

11. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION FILE NO. A/89/09
28 WALES AVE., MARKHAM PROPOSED VARIANCES TO PERMIT CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW ACCESSORY BUILDING (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning R. Cefaratti, Committee of Adjustment

The Heritage Planner reported that this proposal had been before the Committee on September 9th, and had been referred to the Architectural Sub-Committee for a site visit. The requested minor variances were not accurate and were subsequently revised. The Sub-Committee determined that there would be minimal impact to the streetscape and to neighbouring properties, and supported the variances.

A member of the Architectural Sub-Committee expressed concern for the massing of the garage in the residential area, and its potential impact on future buildings on the vacant lot to the rear. The Committee discussed the setback requirements, comparable garage heights, and the potential redevelopment of the dwelling on the property.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the requested variance to permit a lot coverage of 11% for the proposed accessory building at 28 Wales Avenue;

THAT Heritage Markham supports the requested variance for a height of 19 ft to the midpoint of the roof for the proposed accessory building at 28 Wales Ave.;

AND THAT Heritage Markham is satisfied that the existing accessory building at 28 Wales Ave. has no heritage value and has no objection to its demolition.

CARRIED

 12. DEMOLITION PERMIT APPLICATION FILE NO. 09 123178 000 00 DP 73 OLD KENNEDY ROAD PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF HOUSE & ACCESSORY BUILDING (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner advised that this property had been referred to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee. The building was found to be worthy of preservation and it was recommended for Heritage designation.

The Committee discussed the transition of the Old Kennedy/Milliken Main Street area. It was noted that many properties were demolished prior to the creation of Heritage Markham and the Committee has been trying to preserve what is left. The structures in this area possess emerging cultural heritage value and can easily be incorporated into the new residential community.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the proposed demolition of the house at 73 Old Kennedy Road #09 123178 000 00 DP;

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the accessory building located at 73 Old Kennedy Road;

AND THAT Heritage Markham recommends that Council designate the house and three specimen trees at 73 Old Kennedy Road under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> to ensure their preservation and integration into any future redevelopment of the property.

CARRIED

 DEMOLITION PERMIT APPLICATION FILE NO. 09 123709 000 00 ND
 93 OLD KENNEDY ROAD
 PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF HOUSE & ACCESSORY BUILDING Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner gave an overview of this project, and explained that due to the time frame involved in the demolition permit process, a site visit has been undertaken with the Architectural Review Sub-Committee. Staff has determined that the house does possess cultural heritage value and could be incorporated into the community, and recommend that the demolition permit application be denied.

Henry Chu, representing the owners, suggested that the proposed demolition and redevelopment of the property is consistent with other changes to properties in the area, specifically, 83 Old Kennedy Road. Mr. Chu stated his opinion that the Heritage Registry is inconsistent with respect to vernacular style, and that the small size of the building and the low basement will make it difficult to utilize effectively without making a significant investment.

The Committee discussed the potential preservation and development of the property, and emphasised their mandate to preserve heritage buildings.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the proposed demolition of the house at 93 Old Kennedy Road #09 123709 000 00 ND;

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the two accessory buildings located 93 Old Kennedy Road;

AND THAT Heritage Markham recommend that Council designate the house at 93 Old Kennedy Road under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> to ensure its preservation and integration into any future redevelopment of the property.

CARRIED

14. AWARDS HERITAGE MARKHAM AWARDS OF EXCELLENCE FINALIZATION OF NOMINATIONS (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Susan Casella assumed the Chair for this item. Due to the availability of the Mayor and Deputy Mayor, the date of the presentation has been changed to Wednesday November 25, 2009.

The Senior Heritage Planner advised that the awards list has been prepared for the Committee's endorsement. Two dwellings at Markham Heritage Estates (14 Alexander Hunter Place and 11 Heritage Corners Lane) have been successfully restored and have been added to the list. Heritage Markham has been giving awards to original residents in Markham Heritage Estates whom have completed restoration project.

A Committee member who is a resident of Heritage Estates, reminded the Committee that the owners of 14 Alexander Place did not complete the restoration in compliance with the approved plans, and did not stop work when requested by the Town. Although the Town's approval was eventually obtained for the work, it may not be appropriate to include it in the Awards of Excellence.

Staff advised that the awards are a recognition of preservation or restoration, and although the site plan process may have been difficult, none of the heritage features were compromised and the restoration was of a high quality.

The Committee discussed the criteria for the awards, and noted that Heritage Markham had dealt with the difficulties at 14 Alexander Hunter Place, approving the revisions to the plan. It was also noted that awards had been denied in the past, in similar circumstances.

A motion to approve the staff recommendation with the deletion of 14 Alexander Hunter Place was lost.

The Committee separated the motion for the nominations and voted on them separately.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham approve the nominations for the 2009 Heritage Markham Awards of Excellence for the following projects:

- 5 George Street
- 29 James Walker Court
- 135 Baythorne Drive
- 8953 Woodbine Avenue
- 26 Church lane
- 5954 Highway 7
- 6050 Highway 7
- 15 Station Lane
- 124 Main Street Unionville
- 11 Heritage Corners Lane

CARRIED

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not approve 14 Alexander Hunter Place for the 2009 Heritage Markham Awards of Excellence.

CARRIED

15.	BUILDING	PERMIT APPLICATION	
	FILE NO. 09	FILE NO. 09 125683 40 PETER STREET MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT PROPOSED DETACHED TWO-CAR GARAGE	
	40 PETER ST		
	MARKHAM		
	PROPOSED		
	Extracts:	R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning	
		L. Beattie, Building Department	

Councillor Carolina Moretti declared a conflict of interest in regard to Agenda Item # 15, as her son lives on Peter Street, and did not participate in debate or vote on the matter.

The Senior Heritage Planner briefly described this application and recommended delegation of approval authority to Heritage Section staff.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed two car garage for 40 Peter Street and delegates approval authority to Heritage Section staff provided the design submitted with the Site Plan Control application is substantially the same as the design submitted for Building Permit.

16. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION FILE NO. 09 125734 42 JOSEPH STREET MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT WINDOW REPLACEMENT Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner introduced this item, explaining that polices for the preservation of original or early windows are very clear. Staff support retention of the windows if salvageable, and recommend that staff and the Architectural Review Sub-Committee meet with owner to discuss options.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the retention of the existing historic wooden windows if salvageable at 42 Joseph St.;

THAT members of the Architectural Review Sub-Committee arrange a site visit with the owner of 42 Joseph St. to determine if the original windows can be restored and reconditioned and to suggest possible alternatives to replacement that will improve the thermal efficiency of the existing historic windows.

AND THAT final approval of the heritage permit application to replace the existing historic wooden windows at 42 Joseph St. be delegated to Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.