

**HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING
TOWN OF MARKHAM
Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre
Wednesday, November 11, 2009**

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke
Susan Casella
Ted Chisholm
Judith Dawson
Deirdre Kavanagh
James Makaruk
Richard Morales
Councillor Carolina Moretti
Sylvia Morris
Barry Nelson, Chair
Regional Councillor Joe Virgilio
Ronald Waine

Regrets

Denise Sabatini-Fuina

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning
George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner
Kitty Bavington, Committee Clerk

Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

Barry Nelson, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:15 p.m. by asking for any declarations of interest with respect to items on the agenda. There were none declared.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

CARRIED

2. MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER 14, 2009
HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on October 14, 2009 be received and adopted as amended.

CARRIED

3. HERITAGE MARKHAM BUDGET 2010 (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
V. Shuttleworth, Director of Planning and Urban Design
-

The Manager of Heritage Planning briefly reviewed the budget items.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham endorses a Heritage Markham budget for 2010 in the amount of \$9235.00;

AND THAT the budget for 2010 be forwarded to the Development Services Commission for consideration by Council.

CARRIED

4. DEMOLITION PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NO. 09125846 DP
93 JOHN STREET
DEMOLITION OF FRAME HOUSE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
C. Doyle-Dimou, Applications Administrator
-

The Senior Heritage Planner introduced this item and gave a brief background of the proposal.

David Jordon, 125 John Street, representing the property owner, addressed the Committee. He advised that he is President of the Thornhill Conservation District Ratepayers Association, and that the owner is also a member. It is his opinion that the community supports the proposal, and that the existing house can be replaced with a significantly nicer house.

The Committee requested clarification regarding the support of the community, and Mr. Jordon responded that he has had numerous discussions with many residents and many of them support the proposal. He stated that he believes he can safely speak for the body of the association. It was further clarified by the Committee that there are two ratepayers groups in the area, but only one covers the heritage conservation district exclusively.

Evelin Ellison, 48 Julia Street, spoke in opposition to the proposal. Ms. Ellison advised that she is Vice-President of the Ward One South Ratepayers Association, but is not speaking on behalf of the Association. She displayed photographs of preserved heritage homes in the area, and new houses being built, and stated her concern that valuable heritage houses are being demolished and replaced with incompatible large new houses. Large mature trees are also being lost.

Marion Matthias, 33 Colborne Street, spoke in opposition to the proposal. Ms. Matthias advised that she is a member of the community, and contrary to Mr. Jordon's statement, many residents were not consulted, and many do not support it. Ms. Matthias referred to the house originally being identified as a Class 'B' (compatible or contextual value) in an earlier proposed classification system for the District, but that it had been changed to a 'C' (other buildings in the District) in the final approved District Plan. Ms. Matthias suggested that there are too many demolition permit applications, and that the mandate of Committee is preservation, not demolition.

Several Committee members indicated that: they do not support the demolition: more buildings constructed in the twentieth century are becoming valued properties; this dwelling was constructed as part of the Veteran's assistance program following WW2 and is historically significant; and the large property would accommodate an addition and improvements to the existing dwelling without demolition.

Staff advised that the Heritage District Conservation Plan reviewed all the Heritage buildings in Thornhill, and categorized them into 'A' (significant), 'B' (emerging heritage value) and everything else was classified as 'C', which would be dealt with on a case-by-case basis. Class 'C' can include buildings that are sympathetic to the District by virtue of scale or design qualities and buildings that are not sympathetic.

It was noted that the Heritage District Conservation Plan may need to be revised to address Class 'C' houses, in order to provide clarity to the public and consistency. It would be a decision of Council to adopt stronger criteria that would provide the tools to properly preserve the buildings.

Joseph Mozzaffari, owner, addressed the Committee, and advised that he has lived in the dwelling for over seven years, and is a member of the community. He stated that he did not buy it to demolish it, build a new one, and then sell it. Mr. Mozzaffari stated that the house is too small for his family, and that he intends for his parents to move in. There is no basement, and the crawlspace and ceiling beams are sagging and cannot be repaired.

The Committee suggested that the Architectural Review Sub-Committee perform a site visit, however, due to the 90-day time limit for demolition permit applications, the applicant was requested to withdraw his application and re-submit it, in order for the time frame to begin again. This would give the Sub-Committee sufficient time to inspect and report back to Heritage Markham, prior to forwarding the application to Council. If Council does not make a decision on the application within the 90 day time frame, the application is considered to be approved. The applicant can appeal Council's decision to the Ontario Municipal Board.

The Committee deferred discussion of this matter until later in the meeting, to allow the owner an opportunity to consider the request.

When the discussion resumed, Mr. Jordon and Mr. Mozzaffari requested clarification on time frames and fees. The Committee advised that the re-submission can occur at any time. Since the withdrawal and re-submission is being done at the request of the Committee, with the support of the Ward Councillor and staff, there should not be any fees required for the re-submission.

Joseph Mozzaffari, owner, agreed to withdraw the demolition permit application, and requested a condition that there would not be a fee to resubmit the application.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

WHEREAS the Committee has requested the owner to withdraw the demolition permit application for 93 John Street, and the owner has agreed to do so to allow additional time for the consideration of the application;

THAT the Architectural Review Sub-Committee perform a site visit and report back to Heritage Markham at the December 9th meeting.

CARRIED

5. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATIONS
APPROVED BY STAFF ON BEHALF OF HERITAGE MARKHAM
FILE NOS. 09 125518 HP, & 09 124633 NH
12 GLEASON AVENUE, & 218 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the memorandum on Building Permit applications for 12 Gleason Avenue and 218 Main Street, Unionville, as information.

CARRIED

6. INFORMATION
BUTTONVILLE HERITAGE
CONSERVATION DISTRICT ADVISORY COMMITTEE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the information be received.

CARRIED

7. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION
FILE NO. A/105/09, 23 WASHINGTON STREET
MINOR VARIANCE FOR MINIMIZING FLOOR AREA (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
R. Cefaratti, Committee of Adjustment
G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to Minor Variance Application A/105/09 for 23 Washington Street.

CARRIED

8. MINOR VARIANCE APPLICATION
FILE NO. A/104/09
UNIONVILLE BAPTIST CHURCH
DAYCARE USE IN PASTOR'S RESIDENCE
243 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE
UNIONVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
R. Cefaratti, Committee of Adjustment
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to Minor Variance Application A/104/09 for daycare/day nursery uses in the residence associated with the Unionville Baptist Church at 243 Main Street, Unionville;

AND THAT the owner be required to go through the Site Plan Control process as a condition of approval.

CARRIED

9. DESIGNATIONS

BY-LAW AMENDMENTS

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham acknowledges the need to amend the legal description in the designation by-laws for the following properties and has no objection:

- 33 Artisan Trail (formerly 10372 Woodbine Ave-relocated)
- 37 Artisan Trail (formerly 10271 Woodbine Ave- new address)
- 39 Artisan Trail (formerly 10327 Woodbine Ave- relocated)
- 99 Thoroughbred Way (formerly 9804 McCowan Road - new address)
- 7 Bewell Drive (formerly 7449 Ninth Line - new address)
- 15 Bewell Drive (formerly 7447 Ninth Line - new address)
- 70 Karachi Drive (formerly 7555 Markham Road - relocated)
- 1 Kalvinster Drive (formerly 6937 Hwy 7 - new address)
- 28 Pike Lane (formerly 9451 Ninth Line - new address)
- 8 Greenhollow Court (formerly 9516 Ninth Line - new address)
- 11 Heritage Corners Lane (formerly 9251 Hwy 48 - relocated)
- 819 Bur Oak (formerly 9483 McCowan Road- relocated)
- 99 YMCA Blvd (formerly 7966 Kennedy Rd - new address)
- 20 Mackenzie's Stand Avenue (formerly 8083 Warden Ave)
- 2665 Bur Oak Ave (formerly 7006 16th Ave- new address)

CARRIED

10. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

That the following correspondence be received:

- 1) Ontario Historical Society: OHS Bulletin, October 2009. See articles on Thornhill and Heritage Trees.
- 2) Ontario Genealogical Society: Scanning.
- 3) Heritage Canada Foundation: Heritage Day 2010.
- 4) York Region: Trunk Sewer Odour Control Facility.

CARRIED

11. UNAUTHORIZED BUILDING ALTERATION

22 JOHN STREET

NEW EXTERIOR CLADDING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner discussed the proposal, advising of past improvements made to the property. The new owner has recently made changes without a Heritage Permit, and has been notified. The Committee is being requested to provide direction on how to approach this issue.

The Committee discussed other instances of renovations with Heritage Permits, and the actions that have been taken in the past, with respect to charges under the Ontario Heritage Act, and fines levied. It was agreed that the Town should be consistent in any action taken and that a charge should will be laid. Staff advised that in all cases, they try to work with the owner to resolve the issue.

Marion Matthias, 33 Colborne Street, suggested caution when dealing with John Street, and noted several other properties in the area where violations had occurred without permission and without seeking the advice of Heritage staff.

The Committee indicated that it was not in favour of the changes made to the building, as it has lost its look of authenticity.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham advise the new owner of 22 John Street that the Town's Heritage Permit application process was not followed;

AND THAT the loss or covering up of the original siding material is contrary to the Thornhill Heritage District Plan as the siding and trim were capable of being restored;

AND THAT the owner is requested to apply for a Heritage Permit for the completed work.

CARRIED

12. AWARDS

HERITAGE MARKHAM

AWARD OF EXCELLENCE 2009

EVENT PLANNING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner outlined the event, requesting that as many Heritage Markham members as possible attend and assist in presenting the awards.

All members present indicated their availability, except for Ted Chisholm, and Ronald Waine, who is tentative. Denise Sabatini-Fuina was not in attendance.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham volunteers for the 2009 Heritage Markham Awards of Excellence are to include:

Councillor Valerie Burke

Susan Casella

Judith Dawson

Deirdre Kavanagh

James Makaruk

Richard Morales

Councillor Carolina Moretti

Sylvia Morris

Barry Nelson, Chair

Regional Councillor Joe Virgilio

Ronald Waine (tentatively).

CARRIED

13. 2009 COMMERCIAL FAÇADE
GRANT PROGRAM
8 MAIN STREET NORTH,
254 MAIN STREET NORTH, AND
149 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE
FAÇADE GRANT APPLICATION
AUTUMN 2009(16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner advised that there is a surplus of \$12,000 in the Grant Program budget, so staff re-advertised the program and received two new applications. He explained the two proposals: 8 Markham Main St. N. to replicate the missing front veranda; and 149 Main St. Unionville to make improvements to the rear yard facing the original Kennedy Road road allowance. The owners would be required to enter into agreements with the Town.

Staff support both applications and advised that, because not all the requested grant money is usually used, there should be sufficient funds to cover both requests. If not, the two requests should be funded proportionately.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the grant application for 8 Markham Main St. N. to replicate the missing front veranda and 149 Main St. Unionville to make improvements to the rear yard, but recommends that the owner of 254 Markham Main St. N. re-submit an application for the Facade Grant program in the spring of 2010;

AND THAT the remaining amount of money left in the 2009 Heritage Façade Grant Program be divided equally between the applicants for 8 Markham Main St. N. and 149 Main St. Unionville, if there are not sufficient funds to completely cover the projects;

AND THAT Heritage Markham supports both 8 Main St. N. and 149 Main St. Unionville entering into façade easement agreements with the Town in order to be eligible for the Town of Markham Commercial Façade Improvement Grant Program;

AND THAT Heritage Markham's support for the 2009 Commercial Façade Grant Applications is conditional on the applicants meeting the eligibility requirements of the program;

AND THAT final approval of Heritage Permit applications, Sign Permit applications, and Building Permit applications required to carry out the proposed work or alterations described in the 2009 Commercial Façade Grant Applications be delegated to Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED

14. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

FILE NO. A/103/09, 58-72 MAIN STREET NORTH (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner reviewed the development proposal for this property and the related Minor Variance applications, advising that new variances have been added. The variances were described and discussed. The Committee indicated concurrence with staff's position that the variances would have minor impacts, and noted the developer's cooperation with the Town and staff.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the requested variances for the proposed redevelopment of 58-72 Main St. N Markham Village;

AND THAT Heritage Markham's support of the requested variances is based on existing site specific conditions of the subject property, and that future minor variance applications for commercial properties located in Markham Village will be reviewed on a case by case basis.

CARRIED

15. YEAR END RECEPTION (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Staff noted that if the Year End reception is held in January, the receipts for the event will have to be submitted immediately following the event, in order to be included in the 2009 budget. A discussion regarding invitees was deferred.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham will hold its Year End Reception in the Council Lounge on the 4th Floor, on Wednesday, January 13, 2010, following the Heritage Markham meeting;

And that the Reception will be organized by Ron Waine, Judith Dawson, and Deirdre Kavanagh;

And that the Heritage Markham meeting will commence at 6:30 p.m. on that date.

CARRIED

16. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
PROPOSED RENOVATIONS

JAMES D. HARRINGTON HOUSE/CORNERSTONE COMMUNITY
CHURCH

9642 NINTH LINE, GREENSBOROUGH COMMUNITY

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
Edward Mak, Project Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham refer the proposed renovations to 9642 Ninth Line to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for review and comment.

CARRIED

17. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
WINDOW REPLACEMENT
HAWKINS HOUSE, HABITAT FOR HUMANITY
41 BITTERSWEET STREET, CORNELL COMMUNITY
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham refer the window replacement at 41 Bittersweet Street to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for review and comment, with authority to approve.

CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m.