

**HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING
TOWN OF MARKHAM
Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre
Wednesday, February 10, 2010**

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke
Susan Casella
Ted Chisholm
Judith Dawson
Deirdre Kavanagh
Jeanne Ker-Hornell
James Makaruk, Vice Chair
Richard Morales
Sylvia Morris
Barry Nelson, Chair
Ronald Waine

Regrets

Councillor Carolina Moretti
Regional Councillor Joe Virgilio

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning
George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner
Kitty Bavington, Committee Clerk

Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

Barry Nelson, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:20 p.m. by asking for any declarations of interest with respect to items on the agenda. There were no declarations made.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

CARRIED

2. MINUTES OF JANUARY 13, 2010
HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of Heritage Markham meeting held on January 13, 2010 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
23 CHURCH STREET
MARKHAM VILLAGE
PROPOSED ALTERATIONS
AND ADDITIONS TO 23 CHURCH STREET (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

The Heritage Planner reviewed the proposal and the recommendations of staff. Elevations were reviewed and clarification was provided to the Committee regarding window proportions and design.

The Committee indicated support for the general architecture of the proposal, with some detail modifications that can be worked out with staff. One item noted was the removal of the brackets above the garage doors.

Jackie Gardiner, applicant, was in attendance. Ms. Gardiner advised that many changes had already been incorporated, and she indicated agreement to the suggestions.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed addition and remodelling of 23 Church St. in Markham Village provided:

- That the proposed new windows be altered in their proportions to produce historically accurate window pane divisions;
- That the pent gable on the existing north facing gable be deleted;
- That the decorative brackets of the proposed veranda be eliminated, or the design of the porch post/columns changed to a style better suited to decorative brackets;
- That the proposed sidelights of the entrance door reflect a more traditional configuration of glazing and solid lower panels.

AND THAT the owner enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the Town containing the usual provisions regarding materials, windows, colours, etc.;

AND THAT final approval of the Site Plan application to remodel the existing house and construct an attached two car garage with living space above at 23 Church Street, Markham Village be delegated to Heritage Section Staff provided that the design reviewed by Heritage Markham is not significantly altered.

CARRIED

4. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION
FILE NO. SC 09 112454
100 JOHN STREET
DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN AS-BUILT
CONSTRUCTION AND APPROVED DRAWINGS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

The Heritage Planner reviewed the concerns expressed by the Committee at a previous meeting, regarding discrepancies between the approved plan and the as-built house at 100 John Street. Staff provided a report evaluating the changes, and discussed the impacts with respect to the Thornhill Heritage District Conservation Plan. Discussions included the comments and concerns identified during the design stage, such as: the siting and setback of the house; preservation of existing mature vegetation; building height that is compatible with adjacent dwellings; and, Arts and Crafts style that is compatible with the neighbourhood. Staff reviewed the discrepancies in detail.

Mr. David Shakker, applicant, was in attendance. He outlined the difficulties and the delays he had experienced, and explained that his objective was to be environmentally-friendly. He advised that he has achieved the majority of design features of the approved plan, with minor changes that, in his opinion, improved the plan. The Committee expressed appreciation for Mr. Shakker's attendance, but was dismayed that changes had been made without consultation with the Committee. Mr. Shakker indicated that he was willing to discuss the changes and to work to resolve the issues.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the report produced by Heritage Section Staff on the discrepancies between the approved drawings and as-built house at 100 John Street;

AND THAT the Architectural Review Subcommittee be convened as soon as possible, to review the altered items in detail with Mr. Shakker, and determine remedies;

AND THAT, to prevent further delays, the Architectural Review Subcommittee be authorized to approve amendments to the plan, to be reported by staff at the next meeting.

CARRIED

5. INFORMATION
47 PETER STREET
OLDER HOUSE FOR SALE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the inclusion of 47 Peter Street on the Markham Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

CARRIED

6. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
12 DAVID GOHN CIRCLE
PROPOSED DETACHED GARAGE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a brief overview of this proposal. The Committee indicated support regarding the size and scale, but noted an inconsistency between the styles of the garage doors and the window above.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the applicant be requested to work with staff to achieve a traditional style to reflect an urban barn.

CARRIED

7. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
300 MAIN STREET NORTH
PROPOSED REAR ADDITION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the design of the proposed addition for 300 Main Street North and the relocation of the carriage house/town barn, subject to the attic dormer windows being restored and an increased Letter of Credit to ensure the carriage house/town barn is successfully relocated on a new foundation;

AND THAT final approval of a future Site Plan Control application be delegated to Heritage Section staff provided the design is substantially in keeping with the current elevations.

CARRIED

8. OMB HEARING
26 ALBERT STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE
APPEAL OF MINOR VARIANCE APPLICATION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

Receive as information.

CARRIED

9. INFORMATION
HERITAGE DISTRICT NEWS (NEWS LETTER) (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The winter 2010 newsletter to property owners in heritage conservation districts was received by the Committee.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

Receive as information.

CARRIED

10. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
PRE 09 129201
361 MAIN STREET NORTH
PROPOSED REAR ADDITION AND DETACHED GARAGE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham generally supports the design for the proposed rear addition and detached garage at 361 Main Street North, with the following design comments to be addressed by the applicant prior to the submission of a site plan control application:

- The L-shaped verandah should have the roof treatment modified to a more traditional form, so the eaves do not extend past the face of the wall;
- The shed-roofed extension on the north elevation appears to be an exterior entrance to the basement of the addition. This is not fully illustrated on the plans. This entrance affects the traditional form of the end wall of the addition, and would have less impact if it was relocated to the rear of the addition;
- The metal chimney on the heritage house should be replaced with a traditional brick chimney (functional or false) in keeping with the 1890 period of the building;
- The siding of the addition should differ slightly in profile or colour from the siding on the heritage house to differentiate the old from new;
- The garage siding should be more barn-like (i.e. wider) rather than matching the house, to differentiate it as an accessory building.
- The size of the paved area in front of the garage should be reduced to the minimum required to access the garage door and to provide for a turn-around, in order to preserve as much green space on the lot as possible, and to reduce storm water run-off;

AND THAT the existing garage is not of heritage interest.

CARRIED

11. REQUEST FOR INFORMATION
292 MAIN STREET NORTH
PROPOSED REAR ADDITION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Committee received addendum information that included revised site plan and elevation drawings. Staff advised that the concerns regarding height have been addressed.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham generally supports the design of the proposed addition for 292 Main Street North, in view of the height being lowered;

AND THAT provided the design can be revised as recommended, final approval of the future site plan control application be delegated to Heritage Section staff.

CARRIED

12. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

That the following correspondence be received:

- A) Heritage Canada Foundation: Heritage Magazine, Vol.x11, No. 3, 2009. See article on Heritage Conservation Districts;
- B) Ontario Heritage Foundation: Heritage Matters Magazine, January 2010 Issue;
- C) Markham Historical Society Newsletter: "Remember Markham", Jan 2010 Issue;
- D) Toronto Historical Association Newsletter, February 2010.

CARRIED

13. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
10093, 10295, 10825, AND 11471 NINTH LINE
NINTH LINE ROAD WIDENING – YORK REGION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Senior Heritage Planner explained the proposed widening of the Ninth Line and discussed the Heritage properties that will be impacted.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the Region of York consider modifying the proposed road alignment to allow the heritage house at 11491 Ninth Line to remain on its existing site prior to considering other options for the removal of the building to make way for the roadwork;

AND THAT Heritage Markham does not object to the demolition of the fire-damaged house at 10093 Ninth Line, but recommends that Region provide documentation of the building (interior/exterior photographs) and measured floorplans prior to its removal.

CARRIED

14. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION
FILE NO. SC 09 126459
10761 WOODBINE AVENUE
RESTORATION OF HERITAGE HOUSE
AND COMMERCIAL ADDITION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
G. Sellars, Senior Planner
-

The Senior Heritage Planner introduced this item. The Committee received addendum information that included a revised design for the link between the heritage building and the new commercial building.

Elena Bevilacqua, owner, and Marlene Slopach, Architect, were in attendance, and advised the Committee that the Architectural Review Sub-committee's comments had been addressed, where possible. Ms. Slopach displayed drawings and explained the revisions with respect to the porch, the roof line, and other aspects. With respect to the two style options for roofline of the dormer over the porch, the Committee was flexible.

Ms. Slopach discussed her concern for the impact of the porch revisions and the resulting modifications to the building footprint, on the stormwater flow. She also suggested the lowered roof affects the pitch and may cause problems. The Committee endorsed the revisions to the porch, and delegated the roof issue to staff. Staff provided clarification to the applicant with respect to the Heritage easement agreement and the Part IV designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The Committee thanked the applicant for working with the Town and staff.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham generally supports the design for the restoration plan and proposed additions to the heritage house at 10761 Woodbine Avenue, but recommends that the applicant revise the plans to:

- Create a deeper side porch on the link, between 5 and 6 feet deep,;
- Alter the side porch roof to a more traditional profile with the roof springing from the wall face of the link and the edge of the eaves to not project past the wall face of the heritage house;
- Lower the roof height of the link so that if possible, it will be no higher than the roof of the heritage house;
- Copy as closely as possible the brick detail on the chimneys of the restored house, based on the historical photograph;

AND THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the house at 10761 Woodbine Avenue be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act and that the owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the Town of Markham as conditions of site plan approval for the proposed development.

CARRIED

15. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

8303 WARDEN AVENUE

RELOCATE AND PARTIALLY DEMOLISH A

DESIGNATED PROPERTY (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
S. Heaslip, Senior Project Coordinator

The Committee received addendum information that included an updated recommendation. The Manager of Heritage Planning reviewed the recent Heritage Impact Assessment prepared for this property. The house will have to be temporarily relocated, and this process will involve partial demolition. Staff reviewed the recommendations regarding preparation of a strategy and plan for the preservation of the building. This development will be brought back before the Committee at future stages.

Mr. Peter Swinton, representing the applicant, was in attendance.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports all six recommendations of the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Wayne Morgan, Heritage Planner, as revised December 2009, concerning the treatment of the Sheridan-Paterson Farm House within a future redevelopment proposal;

AND THAT as per the Heritage Impact Assessment recommendations, the owner prepare a strategy and plan for the conservation of the heritage resource undertaken by a qualified conservation architect with the strategy being prepared and approved by the Manager of Heritage Planning prior to the demolition/relocation of any parts of the heritage resource;

AND THAT the heritage resource be protected during the temporary relocation, storage and restoration process through a Heritage Letter of Credit;

AND THAT the ultimate location of the relocated heritage resource on Block C of the applicant's draft plan of subdivision (19TM-06015) be determined as part of site plan approval (pursuant to Section 41 of the Planning Act);

AND THAT the conditions pertaining to the heritage resource (relocation, protection, and restoration) be included in both the conditions of draft subdivision approval and site plan agreement for the site, and include the requirement for a Heritage Letter of Credit and the requirement that the owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement;

AND THAT the owner immediately secure the heritage resource in accordance with municipal and heritage standards (boarding, fencing, signage) to prevent further vandalism and deterioration, and inspect the property on a regular basis to ensure the building remains secured.

CARRIED

16. PRESENTATION

PRESERVING OUR EARLY 20TH CENTURY ARCHITECTURE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Mr. Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner, provided a presentation entitled "Preserving Our Early 20th Century Architecture". The committee discussed emerging heritage issues and commented on the value of educating the public. Suggestions were made such as Heritage Markham holding an information night in each of the districts, and making presentations in schools. It was noted that SPOHT has an outreach program, and the Heinzman House has also worked on a similar project, and that both resources could be helpful. The Committee acknowledged that providing a forum to receive feedback from the community would be an additional benefit.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the presentation by Mr. Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner, entitled "Preserving Our Early 20th Century Architecture", be received;

AND THAT James Makaruk be appointed to Chair an Educational Subcommittee, to develop an educational presentation on Heritage in Markham, that can be taken out into the community.

CARRIED

17. MINOR VARIANCE APPLICATION A/07/10
PROPOSED NEW HOUSE
90 JAMES SCOTT ROAD
MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
R. Cefaratti, Committee of Adjustment
-

The Heritage Planner explained the application for multiple variances, and discussed the staff recommendation.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the requested variances for reduced front and second storey side yard setbacks for the proposed new house at 90 James Scott Road;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the requested variances to permit an increased Maximum Net Floor Area Ratio, Maximum Lot Coverage, Maximum Building Depth and a projection of the porch steps into the front yard for the proposed house at 90 James Scott Road.

CARRIED

18. MINOR VARIANCE APPLICATION A/08/10
PROPOSED NEW HOUSE
100 JAMES SCOTT ROAD
MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
R. Cefaratti, Committee of Adjustment
-

The Heritage Planner explained the application for multiple variances, and discussed the staff recommendation.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the requested variances for reduced front and second storey side yard setbacks for the proposed new house at 100 James Scott Road;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the requested variances to permit an increased Maximum Net Floor Area Ratio, Maximum Building Depth and a projection of the porch steps into the front yard for the proposed house at 100 James Scott Road.

CARRIED

19. NEW BUSINESS

- A) The Committee recognized and congratulated Susan Casella for receiving the Ontario Heritage Trust 2009 Heritage Community Recognition Program - Lifetime Achievement Award. The award recognizes her outstanding volunteer contributions to preserving, protecting and promoting community heritage.
- B) In recognition of the recent 200th Anniversary of the Governor General's Horse Guards, Susan Casella displayed an artefact found on the Button property many years ago. It was identified as a portable, military cooking utensil. It was noted that Markham will be hosting a number of anniversary events to celebrate this military unit throughout 2010.

The meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m.