

MEMORANDUM

TO:

Chair and Members of the Development Services Committee

FROM:

Jim Baird, Commissioner of Development Services

PREPARED

BY:

G. Duncan/R. Hutcheson, Heritage Planning

DATE:

November 23, 2010

SUBJECT:

Site Plan Control Application (SC 10 111677)

20 Peter St., Markham Village - Exterior Cladding

Outcome of Site Meeting

At its meeting of November 16, 2010, Development Services Committee directed staff to meet with the owners of 20 Peter Street to compare findings on the exterior siding issue, and report back to Council on November 23rd. Regional Councillor Jim Jones and Ward 4 Councillor Carolina Moretti had noted their desire to attend the site visit. Staff extended the meeting invitation to all members of the Development Services Committee that were present at the DSC meeting.

With the owner's consent, staff arranged a site visit for Thursday, November 18th. The property owners (Kirk and Paula Tobias), their consultant (Charters Kenny), Heritage Section Staff, and Regional Councillor Jones and Ward Councillor Moretti were in attendance.

The main matters to be discussed included the originality and condition of the existing exterior wood siding, and potential health and safety issues relating to the presence of mould. The owner also discussed the restoration of the original windows.

Siding

The owner's consultant carried out a detailed tour of all areas of the house to highlight the nature of his evidence to support his position, and that of the owners, that the beaded-edge siding on the east, north and portions of the west wall were not original and not installed in a weathertight manner. During the progress of the tour, staff provided their opinion in response to the consultant's evidence. Based on the physical and archival evidence, staff remain of the opinion that the existing wood sidings on the house are original to the initial construction in the 1890s and that the sidings are in a condition capable of being restored.

 The conclusion at the end of the site visit was that both parties "agree to disagree" on the issue of the originality and restorability of the existing beaded-edge wood siding.

Mould

For the purpose of the inspection, most of the drywall and insulation had been removed to allow a thorough inspection of the underlying structure. At the site visit, the owner's consultant showed a fragment of drywall that had been removed from the living room. The back side of the drywall fragment had black mould near the bottom. The rest of the drywall that had been removed from the interior had been disposed of, therefore it was not possible to assess the extent of the black mould within the structure as a whole. Staff did not observe any significant water stains, black mould or other deterioration on the structural studs or plank sheathing.

The consultant also showed the back of a piece of the beaded-edge siding that had an area with what was described as a type of mould or fungus, and black staining that was described by the consultant as an indication of the presence of black mould. The owners were not receptive to a staff suggestion that more of the siding be removed to assess whether the mould was isolated or whether it was more widespread.

 Staff and members of Council observed a small area of black mould on the back side of a piece of drywall that had been removed from the living room, and a white coloured area of mould or fungus on a piece of exterior siding removed from an outside wall.

Windows

The owners also discussed that preservation and restoration of the existing original wood windows on the heritage building. While they are concerned about the amount of deterioration that may be found as the windows are examined in more detail, they are willing to ensure best efforts to retain and restore the heritage windows provided the extent of material to be replaced is not excessive. Staff agreed to continue to work with the owners on window assessment.

Conclusion

Town Heritage staff maintain their position that the beaded-edge siding is original and restorable, and given widely accepted standards of heritage conservation practice and the policies of the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan, the requirements of the site plan agreement should be followed by the owner. With respect to the mould issue, staff suggest that remediation of any affected areas is technically possible, and steps could be taken during the restoration process to ensure that future mould issues can be avoided through appropriate construction methods.

Should Council decide to allow the removal and replacement of the beaded-edge siding, staff recommend that consideration be given to requesting the owner use a beaded-edge material to reflect the character of the existing siding and help differentiate the original elevations from the additions at 20 Peter Street.