



Report to: General Committee

Meeting Date: February 5, 2018

---

**SUBJECT:** 2018 Municipal Election - Award of Proposal # 179-R-17 for Optical Scan Vote Tabulation (Part 1) and Online Voting System (Part 2)

**PREPARED BY:** Carlie Turpin, Manager, Elections, Ext. 2083  
Martha Pettit, Deputy Clerk, Ext. 8220  
Rosemarie Patano, Senior Construction Buyer, Ext. 2990

---

**RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1) THAT the report titled "2018 Municipal Election - Award of Proposal # 179-R-17 for Optical Scan Vote Tabulation (Part 1) and Online Voting System (Part 2) be received; and,
- 2) THAT the contract for Part 1 - Optical Scan Vote Tabulation including support & services, be awarded to the sole bidder, Election Systems & Software (ES&S), in the amount of \$67,609.34 (inclusive of HST); and,
- 3) THAT the contract for Part 2 - Online Voting System including support & services, be awarded to the sole bidder, SCYTL Canada Inc., in the amount of \$372,645.12 (inclusive of HST); and,
- 4) That the award for Part 1 & Part 2 be funded from the Contracted Services Election account (#310-311-7882) in the amount of \$440,254.46; and further,
- 5) THAT Staff be authorized and directed to do all things necessary to give effect to this resolution.

**PURPOSE:**

The purpose of this report is to obtain approval to award the following contracts for the 2018 Municipal Election:

- Part 1 - Optical Scan Vote Tabulators (including support & services)
- Part 2 - Online Voting System (including support & services)

**BACKGROUND:**

The City issued RFP # 179-R-17 for Optical Scan Vote Tabulators and an Online Voting System for the 2018 Municipal Election. The RFP was divided into two parts: Part 1, the Optical Scan Vote Tabulators, and, Part 2, the Online Voting System, which included both business and technical requirements supporting the following election goals:

- Compliance with the Municipal Elections Act, 1996;
- Ensuring secrecy and confidentiality of the voter's choices;
- Protecting and improving the integrity of the election process;
- Ensuring certainty of results;
- Enhancing the efficiency of the voting process;

- Providing for greater access to independence in the voting process for persons with disabilities;
- Advance the City's role as a leader in e-democracy and supporting Markham's Digital Strategy;
- Promote sustainable election practices in line with Markham's Greenprint Strategy;
- Providing a high level of customer service to electors.

The business and technical requirements included a number of dimensions focused on security, accessibility and functionality. The criteria were developed based on previous Markham elections and following a review of similar recent Municipal Election RFPs. ITS staff researched and incorporated into the RFP a number of detailed technical requirements around security, functionality, ease of use, ability to leverage Voters' List data on a real-time basis as well as overall voting data integrity. The technical requirements defined address the principles of the Municipal Elections Act and support the following conditions: voter privacy, voter authentication, secrecy of intermediate results, integrity of final election results, control of a Central Electoral Authority, auditability and conventional e-security measures.

#### **BID INFORMATION:**

Advertised, place and date	ETN
Bid closing date	August 31, 2017
Number picking up documents	4**
Number responding to bid	2*

\*As allowed under the bid document, bidders were not required to bid on all parts of the RFP. Of the two bids received, the City received one submission for Part 1 and one submission for Part 2.

\*\* Purchasing contacted bidders who downloaded the document and did not submit a Bid. From the two follow-up calls made, one supplier indicated they felt their firm's bid for Part 1 – Optical Scan Vote Tabulation, would not be competitive based on previous participation; and, one supplier did not submit a bid as a lead consultant, but rather as a sub-contractor via Part 2 – Online Voting System, due to internal changes to both organizational structure and business focus / direction.

Market Place: When discussing with vendors who did not bid, it was realized that there are only a few firms with proven experience in this specialized niche.

#### **PROPOSAL EVALUATION:**

The evaluation team was comprised of staff from ITS and Legislative Services, with Purchasing staff as the facilitator. Parts 1 and 2 were evaluated separately.

The evaluation of each part was based on pre-established evaluation criteria as detailed in the Request for Proposal: 10 points for "Experience and Qualification of the Bidder and Project Team"; 5 points for "Project Understanding, Methodology and"; 40 points for "Meeting Business and Technical Requirements"; 5 points for "Testing"; 5 points for "Training and Support Services"; 5 points for "Maintenance, Election Support Services and Warranty"; and, 30 points for "Price"; totaling 100.

Staff weighted each of the Minimum Business and Technical Requirements based on its importance in ensuring functionality and security of the vote system. Further, to ensure each bidder understood the City's requirements and to allow staff members to review the proposed solutions, Staff invited each of the vendors to a presentation/interview assessment as allowed in the bid document. These presentations were scored out of a possible 10 points, for a total score out of 110. The resulting scores are as follows:

#### **PART 1 – OPTICAL SCAN VOTE TABULATION: PROVISION, SUPPORT & SERVICES**

<b>Supplier</b>	<b>Score (out of 100)</b>	<b>Overall Score (out of 110)</b>
<b>Election Systems &amp; Software (ES&amp;S)</b>	91.56	<b>100.56</b>
SCYTL Canada Inc.	NO BID	

Election Systems & Software ("ES&S"), scored strongly in both the technical submission as well as in the presentation/interview assessment, demonstrating a thorough understanding of the project and its requirements. Election ES&S have been providing equipment to support Canadian municipal elections for more than 30 years. ES&S has supplied Markham with voting equipment for the last five Municipal Elections and By-Elections. Based on feedback from Markham following the 2010 and 2014 Election, ES&S has made improvements to their Optical Scan Vote Tabulators (model DS200). These improvements, which were demonstrated by the vendor, ensure that the processing time for ballots are consistent throughout an electoral event.

#### **PART 2 – ONLINE VOTING SYSTEM: PROVISION, SUPPORT & SERVICES**

<b>Supplier</b>	<b>Score (out of 100)</b>	<b>Overall Score (out of 110)</b>
<b>SCYTL Canada Inc.</b>	90.77	<b>99.77</b>
Election Systems & Software (ES&S)	NO BID	

Scytl Canada Inc. ("Scytl"), scored strongly in both the technical submission as well as in the presentation/interview assessment, demonstrating a thorough understanding of the project and its requirements. Scytl is a wholly owned subsidiary of Scytl Secure Electronic Voting S.A., a Barcelona Spain company established in 2001. Scytl has provided online voting services to more than 100,000 election events worldwide, including a successful deployment of an online voting system for the City of Markham's 2014 Municipal Election and the Regional Municipality of Halifax's 2012 and 2016 Municipal Elections. Scytl is the owner of numerous patents and patent applications related to e-democracy and online voting security.

Scytl's online voting solution is the leading solution in the online voting sector for executing transparent and secure elections. The electronic platform being offered has passed many certification and auditing processes performed by prestigious certification authorities, academia and subject matter experts in many countries around the world. Scytl

is ISO 9001:2000 certified, following ISO/IEC 90003 guidelines for software development within the field of electronic voting.

The solution being provided implements a unique and patented cryptographic protocol, which combined with physical and logical security measures, provides an electronic voting platform that has the highest security levels available today. The capabilities of the solution include: multi-device support with end-to-end advanced encryption; enhanced voter authentication and authorization; ensuring that only one vote per voter is counted and only from valid electors; individual verifiability; voter privacy; results validation; unique audit capabilities; execution of critical actions in isolated and physically segregated environments; advanced monitoring capabilities; seamless integration with vote tabulator provider (ES&S); full integration with Voters' List management provider (DataFix); solution hosted by redundant and reliable Tier 3+ data centers that have advanced control mechanisms for managing distributed denial of service attacks (DDOS); and solution hosting providers have passed SSAE 16 certifications.

In addition to end-to-end specialized security, ScytI uses all of the standard commercial security measures that complement the features of the cryptographic protocol, such as: audit trails, timeouts, system hardening, logical sealing, firewalls and secure architectures. The most common attacks that could be experienced during an electoral event are mitigated, including: phishing, denials of service, viruses, spying software, and replacement of audited software.

#### **OPTIONS / DISCUSSIONS:**

Markham has now used online voting in four consecutive binding municipal elections (2003, 2006, 2010 and 2014). The 2018 Municipal Election model includes an extension of online voting up to and including Voting Day and a reduction in the number of vote tabulators used. The number of electors casting their ballot online in Markham has increased with each election and post-election surveys have indicated electors would like the opportunity to vote online on Voting Day. Markham is a highly connected City, with 95% of residents owning a computer and 68% owning a smartphone. ScytI's online voting solution is mobile friendly, which means electors can access the voting platform using their smartphone. The cost associated with the tabulator and online portion of the 2018 election will be funded from the existing election budget.

#### **FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS AND TEMPLATE:**

The awards of the contract for Part 1 (\$67,609.34 inclusive of HST) and Part (\$372,645.12, inclusive of HST) will be funded from the Contracted Services Election account (#310-311-7882).

<b>Item</b>	<b>Amount</b>
Total Election Budget:	\$ 1,200,000.00
Budget allocated for these items:	\$ 425,000.00
Total Cost of Award for Part 1 & 2:	\$ 440,254.56
<b>Budget Shortfall:</b>	<b>(\$ 15,524.46)*</b>

\*The budget shortfall in the amount of \$15,254.46 will be accommodated within the 2018 election budget.

The total election budget for 2018 is \$1.2M. The 2014 actual cost for the components in this award was approximately \$339,000. The higher cost in 2018 for tabulators and an online voting platform reflect a unit price change since the 2014 Municipal Election. Despite these increases Markham is confident we are receiving a very competitive price for these services.

**HUMAN RESOURCES CONSIDERATIONS**

Not Applicable

**ALIGNMENT WITH STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:**

Exceptional Services By Exceptional People (Digital Strategy)

Safe and Sustainable Community (Greenprint Strategy)

Engaged Diverse and Thriving City (Accessibility Plan)

**BUSINESS UNITS CONSULTED AND AFFECTED:**

ITS

**RECOMMENDED BY:****X**

Kimberley Kitteringham  
City Clerk

**X**

Trinela Cane  
Commissioner of Corporate Services

**ATTACHMENTS:**

Not Applicable