

**HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING
TOWN OF MARKHAM
Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre**

Wednesday, December 14, 2011

MINUTES

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke
Councillor Colin Campbell
Jenny Chau
Ted Chisholm
Judith Dawson
David Johnston
Barry Martin
Marion Matthias
Ronald Waine

Regrets

Councillor Don Hamilton
Barry Nelson, Chair
David Nesbitt

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner
Kitty Bavington, Council/Committee Coordinator

Ronald Waine, Vice Chair, convened the meeting at 6:40 p.m. by asking for any declarations of interest with respect to items on the agenda. There were no declarations.

1. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)**

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

CARRIED

2. MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 9, 2011
HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on November 9, 2011 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
29 SUMNER LANE, THORNHILL
STATUS OF VACANT HOUSE
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the retention of the remaining portions of the frame house at 29 Sumner Lane based on it being a well-built mid-20th century structure, should the applicant wish to incorporate the existing structure into a future, larger house; and,

THAT Heritage Markham would not oppose the removal of the recent foundation and any other structures on the property as required by the Toronto and Region Conservation Authority or the applicant; and further,

THAT a new house, or the old house with a new addition, will be subject to a Site Plan Control Application and the policies and guidelines of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

CARRIED

4. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: SC08 108793
26 ALBERT STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE
CONDITION OF HERITAGE HOUSE
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the Architectural Sub-Committee notes concerning the impromptu site visit to 26 Albert Street for information.

CARRIED

5. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION
DELEGATED APPROVALS: HERITAGE PERMITS
101 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

Staff provided a description of the new garage doors and window shutters.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on Heritage Permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

6. SPECIAL EVENT
HERITAGE DAY AND HERITAGE WEEK- FEBRUARY 2012
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends to Council that the week of February 20-26, 2012 be proclaimed as Heritage Week in the Town of Markham.

CARRIED

7. AWARDS
VOLUNTEER SERVICE AWARDS
MINISTRY OF CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham nominate James Makaruk, Deirdre Kavanagh and Susan Casella for a Volunteer Service Award for their service to Heritage Markham from 2007-2011 (5 years).

CARRIED

8. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT CONSENT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: B/32/11
8359 REESOR ROAD
CONSENT INVOLVING A HERITAGE HOUSE
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment
-

Staff provided a revised memorandum advising that consultation is still ongoing. An updated recommendation was presented by staff and endorsed by the Committee. Correspondence was received from IBI Group in this regard.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the issue of whether to request a Heritage Easement Agreement as a condition of the consent application for 8359 Reesor Road be delegated to Heritage Section staff to allow further discussion with the Town Solicitor.

CARRIED

9. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: HP 11 114763, AL 11 130350,
DP 11 130825, NH 11 114339
12 PAVILION ST, 105 MAIN ST. U., 9451 KENNEDY RD, 33 UNION ST.
DELEGATED APPROVAL OF BUILDING PERMITS
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on Building Permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

10. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT CONSENT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: A/33/11
4400 HWY 7, UNIONVILLE
ACCESS EASEMENT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no comment on the application for provisional consent to permit an access easement on 4400 Hwy 7 in favour of 4410 Hwy 7, Unionville.

CARRIED

11. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Eric and Wendy Green: Thank you letter for Heritage Markham Award of Excellence.
- b) Toronto Historical Association: Newsletter December 2011.
- c) Heritage Canada Foundation: Prix du XXe Siecle (Nationally Significant Modern – Era Buildings)

CARRIED

12. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: HE 11 130291

15 CHURCH LANE, THORNHILL

PROPOSED NEW SIGNAGE

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner introduced this item and explained the request to replace or create signage for Living Life Community Church, a church renting space in St. Volodymyr's Ukrainian Catholic Church at 15 Church Lane. Town Operations staff have expressed concern for the accumulation of signs, and Heritage staff are recommending that the applicant work towards combined signage rather than add a new one.

The Ward Councillor provided some history on the signage issue at this location and the significance of the church structure. Discussions included the clutter of existing signs for various establishments in the area, and the possible use of a temporary event sign for the church, as may be permitted by the Sign By-law. The Committee agreed that the focus of the sign should be to identify the existing church building (St. Volodymyr's).

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the existing signs for St. Volodymyr's Ukrainian Catholic Church remain as they are, with no additions.

CARRIED

13. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: SC 11 127935

23 PRINCESS STREET

PROPOSED NEW DWELLING

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner reviewed the history of this application and the previous discussions by the Heritage Markham Committee. The applicant has submitted revised plans in accordance with the recommendations of the Committee, except for the front yard setback with respect to the imaginary line between the south west corners of the existing neighbouring houses. Although the proposed setback is within the permitted zoning standards, staff are recommending the house be moved back an additional 7.5 feet in order to maintain the streetscape and preserve the line of existing vegetation.

Ward Councillor Carolina Moretti made a deputation in support of the application, suggesting that Princess Street is unique and secluded. With respect to the imaginary line, Councillor Moretti observed that the street is in transition and both neighbouring houses will likely be replaced in the future. In Councillor Moretti's opinion, the proposed setback is reasonable as a standard for future development. It was also reported that the neighbours do not have a concern with the proposal as presented. The Councillor supported the tree preservation requirement, and considered that the cupola would add character if it was added back into the design.

The Committee discussed the setback and the cupola at length, noting a concern for the massing of new infill housing that dwarfs existing adjacent houses; and that the proposed setback may set a precedent. It was noted that both adjacent houses are not heritage houses and could likely be replaced in the future. This may be an opportunity to establish a reasonable setback. The Committee supported the cupola design as originally proposed, provided it is centered on the peak of the roof.

The applicant, Balwinder Khanna was in attendance, and advised that he is not agreeable to the recommended increase in the setback, although he was willing to consider a minor increase to the setback.

A motion was made to permit the cupola, centered on the peak of the roof; allow the applicant's proposed revised setback as shown; to use this setback as the standard for future development on the street; that the shape of the driveway be revised; and that the Committee is satisfied with the form, massing and materials. The motion was defeated.

A motion was made to adopt the staff recommendation; to revise the setback to be entirely behind the imaginary line; to revise the shape of the driveway; that the Committee is satisfied with the form, massing and materials; and to permit the cupola. The motion was defeated. The Committee split the vote on several issues.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the deputation by Ward Councillor Carolina Moretti in support of the site plan application for 23 Princess Street, be received; and

THAT the cupola be retained, as shown on the original drawings and possibly increased in height, but centered on the peak of the roof; and

THAT the shape of the driveway be revised to be further away from the roots of the spruce tree in the front yard.

CARRIED

THAT the setback of the proposed house be approved as submitted by the applicant in the latest drawings; and

THAT the setback be used as the standard for future development on Princess Street.

CARRIED

14. SITE PLAN APPROVAL APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: SC 07 134577

32 CHURCH STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE

RESTORATION OF HISTORIC SIDING

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Staff reviewed the recommendation from the Architectural Review Sub-Committee held on November 22, 2011.

James Therien, applicant, was in attendance to answer any questions. He displayed a sample of the material to be used.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the historic siding on the front of the heritage house at 32 Church Street be retained and restored in accordance with the site plan agreement for file no. SC 07 134577; and,

THAT in recognition of the issues relating to the condition and weather-tightness of the historic siding on the gable ends, this material may be replaced with new wood siding that replicates the historic siding; and further,

THAT siding removed from the gable ends that is in good condition is to be salvaged and used to fill in missing or damaged siding on the front wall of the heritage house.

CARRIED

15. POLICY
YORK REGION- VISION 2051-DRAFT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Manager of Heritage Planning reviewed the highlights of the proposed Policy of York Region, Vision 2051.

The Committee discussed points on Page 12 of the Vision and agreed that stronger wording is necessary.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the following modifications to Vision 2051 be forwarded to the Region of York as feedback:

- Goal 1- A Place Where Everyone Can Thrive- Celebrating our Culture, Heritage and Diversity section- 5th bullet be revised to “Valuing historic towns and village cores, and **protecting our** buildings and areas **of cultural heritage significance, such as Heritage Conservation Districts**, as critical elements of our community identity which contribute to a sense of place”
- Goal 2 – Liveable Cities and Complete Communities – Complete Communities section- new bullet be added “Protecting and incorporating cultural heritage resources and areas as part of achieving complete communities”

CARRIED

16. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION
MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE – COMMERCIAL AREA
SEASONAL DECORATIONS FOR LAMP POSTS
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

Staff advised that the seasonal decorations were installed without a Heritage Permit. Concern was expressed for the use of rope lights with respect to replacing burned out lights. The fixtures are a seasonal item and will be removed in January; however, they will be used again in future years.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the seasonal decorations be approved, conditional on proper maintenance and replacement of the lights in due course, with a more appropriate fixture.

CARRIED

17. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
PRELIMINARY SITE PLANS
PHILIP ECKARDT LOG HOUSE 9451 KENNEDY ROAD
BECKETT FARMHOUSE 4672 16TH AVENUE
UPPER UNIONVILLE COMMUNITY
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner
-

The Senior Heritage Planner provided an update on the proposed site plan for the heritage buildings at 9451 Kennedy Road and 4671 16th Avenue.

A representative of the developer was in attendance to answer any questions.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham refer the site plans and exterior restoration plans (when submitted) for the Philip Eckardt Log House and the Beckett Farmhouse to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee, with authority to approve on behalf of Heritage Markham.

CARRIED

18. TREE REMOVAL PERMIT 11 132937 TREE
12 ALBERT STREET
MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner
D. Prendergast, Tree Preservation
-

The Heritage Planner explained the application to remove a large Black Walnut tree located on the property line between 10 and 12 Albert Street. Discussions included the previous application by the previous owner, which was denied by staff; the current application submitted by the new owner; the provisions of the Tree By-law; and the Arborist's report and Engineer's report submitted by the applicant. Staff reviewed the findings of the reports and the observations from a site visit. The Arborist's report states that although the cracks in the foundation may have been caused by the tree, the tree is in good health and there are other options available to the home owner. The City of Toronto has prepared an information brochure indicating that tree roots do not cause damage to foundation walls or push them in, but the roots will seek water or oxygen that is available at foundation walls that may be present due to other issues.

The Committee discussed legal implications of Heritage Markham's recommendations and requested staff consult with the Legal Department. Staff advised that the Committee is only commenting on the application, and the Town's Arborist will make the final recommendation.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support removal of the Black Walnut Tree located on the property line between 10 and 12 Albert St. identified in the Tree Removal Application 254146 for the following reasons:

- The tree is a mature valuable native species in good health and of good structure;
- The tree contributes to the heritage character of the neighbourhood and the heritage district;
- The author of the arbourist report believes there are options for preservation;
- The conclusions of the engineering report are not consistent with the information provided by the City of Toronto's flyer regarding the impacts of tree roots on pathways, driveways and foundations;
- The applicant was aware that the Town did not support removal of the tree prior to purchasing the property; and,
- It would be premature to support its removal prior to the planned redevelopment of the neighbouring property at 10 Albert St.

CARRIED

19. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION HE 11 133376
PORCH ENCLOSURE
12 ALBERT STREET
MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner
-

The Heritage Planner advised that the owner is requesting to enclose the umbrage or verandah at 12 Albert Street. The Committee discussed options.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the Heritage Permit to enclose the umbrage or veranda at 12 Albert St. with the sandblasted glass panels selected by the applicant;

AND THAT Heritage Markham encourages the applicant to meeting with Heritage Section Staff to select an alternate means of enclosing the umbrage at 12 Albert St. that is appropriate to the heritage conservation district in terms of materials and design;

AND THAT Heritage Markham delegates final approval of the enclosure of the umbrage at 12 Albert St. to Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED

20. RESIGNATION FROM HERITAGE MARKHAM
DEIRDRE KAVANAGH

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
L. Gold, Clerk's Department

The Manager of Heritage Planning advised that Deirdre Kavanagh had regretfully resigned from Heritage Markham Committee due to personal commitments. The Committee expressed appreciation for Ms. Kavanagh's contribution to the Committee over the years.

Council has appointed a replacement member effective January, 2012. The Committee had several questions regarding the appointment process, and the Clerk will follow up on this issue.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham accept Deirdre Kavanagh's letter of resignation from the committee, and request the Clerk's Department to send a letter of thanks for her contribution to the community through her many years of service on Heritage Markham.

CARRIED

NEW BUSINESS

21. FENCE AT GO STATION

The Committee noted the progress in replacing the fence at the GO Station and thanked staff for their attention to this matter.

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.