HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING TOWN OF MARKHAM

Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

Wednesday, January 11, 2012

MINUTES

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke Councillor Colin Campbell

Jenny Chau

Ted Chisholm

Judith Dawson

Councillor Don Hamilton

David Johnston

Barry Martin

Marion Matthias

Barry Nelson, Chair

David Nesbitt

Ronald Waine, Vice-Chair

Regrets

Richard Morales

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner Kitty Bavington, Council/Committee Coordinator

Barry Nelson, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:20 p.m. by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda. None were declared.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

2. MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 14, 2011 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on December 14, 2011 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK

CULTURAL HERITAGE RESOURCES IN THE LANGSTAFF GATEWAY PLANNING AREA (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

R. Blake, West District Manager

The Senior Heritage Planner provided an overview of the relevant aspects of the Secondary Plan and Official Plan for development in the Langstaff Gateway Planning District, and the polices for heritage resources.

Al Duffy, representing the developer, was in attendance to discuss the Town-initiated Secondary Plan with respect to concentrating density within the 100-acre district for transit-oriented development; the overall treatment of heritage buildings within the plan; and specifically, the options for the former Baptist Church at 26 Langstaff Road and the Munshaw Farmhouse at 10 Ruggles Avenue.

The Committee discussed the jurisdiction of the Ontario Realty Corporation, the remediation of the creek, and transit issues, and suggested that various expert movers be consulted regarding the possibility of moving the church. Mr. Duffy agreed to the suggestion. He requested the Committee examine the Munshaw house on site and offered to have the project Architect make a presentation to the Committee regarding the vision for the area. The Committee supported both opportunities and requested that developers use creative ways to integrate heritage buildings into the new community.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the deputation by Al Duffy regarding the former Baptist Church at 26 Langstaff Road, and the Munshaw Farmhouse at 10 Ruggles Avenue; and,

THAT the Architectural Review Subcommittee visit all the heritage houses in the Langstaff district and provide recommendations to the Committee.

4. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK

39 ARTISAN TRAIL – ADAM HAGLAR HOUSE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF HERITAGE LOT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner provided background information on the property at 39 Artisan Trail, and explained the proposal for the Adam Haglar House. In response to feedback from staff, the applicant has amended the original proposal. A reality style television show is being proposed to document the restoration of the building.

Mr. David Guido made a deputation to explain the proposed renovations and additions. He displayed plans and elevations and advised that he considered that the heritage guidelines had been followed.

The Committee indicated a preference for the house to be used as a house rather than being converted into a garage, and had questions or comments regarding the roofline, height, proportions of the window sizes, and wrap-around verandah. The Committee cautioned against overwhelming the original structure.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the deputation by David Guido; and,

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the heritage house remain the dominant feature within the context of the development of 39 Artisan Trail, with the heritage house facing Woodbine Avenue and a complementary addition to the rear that will not overwhelm the house in terms of size, height, placement or architectural style; and,

THAT Heritage Markham supports the concept of a reality style television program focussed on the restoration of the Adam Haglar House subject to the owner obtaining any required permits or approvals.

CARRIED

5. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK

8966 WOODBINE AVE

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner reviewed the proposal by a prospective purchaser to renovate the heritage building at 8966 for commercial use and to build a business office beside it on the property.

Steve Hunt and Jeffery Swartz made a deputation to explain their approach and present the draft details of the proposal. They confirmed the design is barn-style, and the height will be two storeys with a loft. The Committee acknowledged the challenge of a large addition on a small house and provided the following comments:

- concern for the window wall on the front of the building
- arch above window wall does not suit the barn style
- lower the roof to reduce massing and prevent overpowering the original building
- instead of barn style, perhaps a more sympathetic style to the existing building
- include bird-friendly measures

The applicants displayed an alternate design of a transparent timber-framed structure. Staff noted the alternate modern design shown would not comply with the district plan and would not be compatible with the scale and character of the existing Buttonville Heritage Conservation District. At the request of the Committee, staff provided some suggestions to revise the design to comply with heritage guidelines.

The Committee directed the applicant to continue to work with staff and to provide more complete design details.

The applicant noted the front yard setback will be subject to a Minor Variance application to reduce the front yard setback, and requested the Committee's support. The Committee and staff preferred a larger setback than proposed, but indicated support for a reduced setback variance.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the presentation by Hunt Design Associates regarding the proposed development concept at 8966 Woodbine Avenue, and provide comments regarding the design details and massing; and,

THAT the applicant continues to work with staff on the design details.

CARRIED

6. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION
COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT CONSENT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: B/31/11 AND A/139/11
3 ROUGE STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE
PROPOSED LOT SERVERANCE AND NEW DETACHED DWELLING
(16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Committee of Adjustment applications for 3 Rouge St. to create a new lot fronting James Scott Road, the variances required to permit the size of the lot, and the variances requested to permit a new dwelling and accessory structure to be constructed on the lot subject to the applicant obtaining site plan approval for the proposed new house fronting James Scott Road.

CARRIED

7. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: A/141/11

1982 DONALD COUSENS PARKWAY

REQUEST FOR VARIANCES TO BY-LAW (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to variances requested for the proposed restoration of the William Forster House located at 1982 Donald Cousens Parkway.

CARRIED

8. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: 08 121109 NH

156 MAIN STREET

BOARD AND BATTEN SIDING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Di Perna, Supervisor and Permit Administration

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the substitution of Hardiboard board and batten siding to replace the vinyl siding on the non-historic one storey rear addition to 156 Main Street, in place of wood board and batten.

9. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Toronto Architectural Conservancy: February events and general information
- b) Ontario Heritage Trust: Heritage Matters Newsletter, November, 2011
- c) Ontario Historical Society: OHS Bulletin Newsletter, December, 2011
- d) Richmond Hill Central Library: Internet Genealogy Program
- e) Markham Economist and Sun: Article about fee for Heritage Permits for unapproved work, December 15, 2011

CARRIED

10. AWARDS

2011 HERITAGE COMMUNITY RECOGNTION PROGRAM ONTARIO HERITAGE TRUST (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manager of Heritage Planning advised of Award presentations being scheduled with Council on February 28, 2012, for any members who wish to attend.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on the municipal ceremony for the 2011 Heritage Community Recognition Program proposed for the February 28, 2012 Council meeting.

CARRIED

11. POLICY

INFILL DEVELOPMENT IN UNIONVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manager of Heritage Planning explained the issues relating to infill development and the necessity of providing clear and appropriate building standards to support the policies in the heritage conservation district plans. The Committee supported the concept of a review of zoning by-law standards, starting with the Unionville district and extending this exercise to other areas of the Town.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information regarding development standards; and,

THAT Heritage Markham establish a sub-committee consisting of Ted Chisholm, David Nesbit, Marion Matthias, Barry Martin, Judith Dawson, and Councillor Don Hamilton, to review possible amendments to the zoning development standards for low density residential development in the Unionville heritage conservation district; and,

THAT Councillor Don Hamilton be nominated as Chair of the sub-committee.

CARRIED

12. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: A/117/11 (REVISED)

10 ROUGE STREET

MODIFICATION TO DWELLING/ NEW THREE CAR GARAGE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

The Senior Heritage Planner gave a review of the proposed modifications to 10 Rouge Street and the required Minor Variances. Concerns have been identified regarding drainage issues, which the applicant has been addressing. The site plan application will be coming before the Committee for review.

The Committee expressed concern for the length of the driveway and sustainability issues.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the variances at 10 Rouge Street for a minimum lot frontage of 50 ft and a maximum building dept of 18.9 m (to address a proposed covered porch on the rear elevation of the previously approved design of the dwelling); and,

THAT Heritage Markham does not support any further building on the property and therefore does not support the variances for an increase in the maximum net floor area or increase to the maximum height of an accessory building.

CARRIED

13. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: 11 134068

188 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE

SIGNAGE – THE ONE GALLERY (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

L. Sperrino, Application Administrator

The applicant has requested this matter be deferred.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham defers the sign permit application for 188 Main Street Unionville to the February 8, 2012 meeting of Heritage Markham.

CARRIED

14. HERITAGE EDUCATION WINDOW RESTORATION WORKSHOP

POTENTIAL WINTER 2012 PUBLIC EVENT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Committee supported scheduling the seminar as part of the Heritage Week events on the evening of Wednesday, February 22, 2012.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham request staff to coordinate the Window Restoration Seminar event with Barry Nelson, and consider an appropriate date, time and venue as part of the Heritage Week events.

CARRIED

15. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION SC 11 132740

NEW SEMI-DETACHED HOUSE

10 BUTTONVILLE CRESCENT WEST

BUTTONVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner gave an overview of the site plan application for a new semi-detached house at 10 Buttonville Crescent West.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham refer the Site Plan Control application for a new semi-detached house at 10 Buttonville Crescent West to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for review and comment, with authority to approve; and,

THAT the applicant prepare a streetscape to scale showing how the proposed new house will relate to the houses to the north and south of the property, to assist the Sub-Committee in their consideration of the plans.

NEW BUSINESS

16. TRANSPORT CANADA PICKERING AIRPORT LANDS PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF VACANT HERITAGE

Staff provided an update on this issue, further to the November 9, 2011 Heritage Markham meeting. Council has endorsed preservation of the nine houses and authorized them for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act. The Town considers Transport Canada's proposed demolition to be premature in light of the ongoing discussions to establish a National Park on the lands. The CAO was given authority to enter into lease agreements with Transport Canada, if necessary.

17. CHAIN LINK CEMETERY FENCE ST. LUKE'S CHURCH, 36 CHURCH LANE, THORNHILL

The Committee noted that no action has begun for replacement of the fence. Staff advised that the applicant is researching the required materials and has yet to re-submit their application. Staff will contact the applicant for an update.

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 9:35 PM.