HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING TOWN OF MARKHAM

Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

Wednesday, May 9, 2012

MINUTES

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke
Councillor Colin Campbell
Jenny Chau
Ted Chisholm
David Johnston
Barry Martin, Vice-Chair
Marion Matthias
Barry Nelson
David Nesbitt
Ronald Waine, Chair

Regrets

Judith Dawson Councillor Don Hamilton Richard Morales

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Kitty Bavington, Council/Committee Coordinator

Ronald Waine, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:22 p.m. by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda. Barry Martin, Vice-Chair, assumed the Chair for Item # 4.

Ron Waine disclosed an interest with respect to item # 4, Delegated Tree Removals, by nature of owning 12 Alexander Hunter Place, and did not take part in the Committee's discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to item # 8, Staff Delegated Heritage Permit Applications, by nature of owning 17 Union Street, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

Councillor Colin Campbell disclosed an interest with respect to item # 15, 127 Main Street Unionville, by nature of having an association with neighbouring property owners, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
- B) New Business from Committee Members

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

CARRIED

2. MINUTES OF THE APRIL 11, 2012 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on April 11, 2012 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: SC 99 020198

46 MAIN STREET NORTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE

PROPOSED MULTI-STORY RESIDENTIAL BUILDING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manager of Heritage Planning explained the history of the site plan application for 46 Main Street North and recent changes made to the front façade of the building. The Committee had the notes and recommendation from the Architectural Review Sub-Committee meeting held on April 30, 2012.

Lance Gao, Owner, and Loghman Azar, Architect, were in attendance to present further revisions subsequent to the Sub-Committee review. Site Plan details and elevations were displayed.

The Committee indicated general support for the revisions, and discussed options for the entrance.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the revised application (May 9, 2012 version);

AND THAT any final modifications to the site plan application be delegated to Heritage Section staff in consultation with the Ward Councillor;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the Town containing the standard heritage conditions regarding materials, colours, etc.

CARRIED

4. TREE REMOVALS

88 MAIN STREET SOUTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE AND 12 ALEXANDER HUNTER PLACE STAFF DELEGATED APPROVAL OF TREE REMOVAL APPLICATIONS (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Barry Martin, Vice-Chair, assumed the Chair for Item # 4.

Ron Waine disclosed an interest with respect to item # 4, Delegated Tree Removals, by nature of owning 12 Alexander Hunter Place, and did not take part in the Committee's discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

As the property owner, Ron Waine provided a brief explanation of the tree removal request.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on tree removal permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

5. TREE REMOVAL

1 PETER STREET

REMOVAL OF TOWN TREE AT 1 PETER STREET (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the notification of the removal of the silver maple tree from the Town property adjacent to 1 Peter St. in Markham Village as information.

6. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: A/58/12

28 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL

INCREASE TO GARAGE SIZE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the requested variance to permit the garage at 28 John St. to have a Maximum Floor Area of 534 ft² subject to the eastern side yard setback being satisfactory to the Director of Engineering.

CARRIED

7. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATIONS

SIGN PERMIT APPLICATION

41 ALBERT STREET, 6060 HWY 7 E, 7530 9^{TH} LINE, 188 MAIN ST. U, 8331 19^{TH} AVE, 7855 HWY 7. E

STAFF DELEGATED APPROVAL OF BUILDING PERMITS (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on building permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

8. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS

82 JOHN ST, 155 MAIN ST. U, 17 UNION ST, 36 CHURCH ST, 15 COLBORNE ST, 14 PAVILLION ST, 139 MAIN ST. U.

STAFF DELEGATED HERITAGE PERMITS (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to item # 8, Staff Delegated Heritage Permit Applications, by nature of owning 17 Union Street, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

9. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: HE 12 115718

104 JOHN STREET

PRIVACY FENCE EXTENSION AND PICKET FENCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner provided background information on the proposal for the fence at 104 John Street.

In response to questions from the Committee Mr. Battaglia, Owner, indicated the 6 foot height would provide privacy for the corner lot, and he would not consider lowering it. The Committee thanked the owner for the outstanding restoration of the property.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Heritage Permit for the privacy fence extension and picket fence for 104 John Street.

CARRIED

10. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: H.P 11 122659

41 ALBERT STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE

UPDATE ON THE OUTCOME OF BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION

(16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive as information.

CARRIED

11. OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT APPLICATION

23 WATER STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE

PROPOSAL FOR EIGHT TOWNHOUSE UNITS (16.110

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Official Plan Amendment application from a heritage perspective.

12. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Architectural Conservancy of Ontario: ACORN journal, spring 2012,
- b) Architectural Conservancy of Ontario: ACORN newsletter, April 17, 2012,
- c) Toronto Historical Association: May 2012 newsletter.

CARRIED

13. BUILDING DEMOLITION APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: 12 113533 DP

11528 NINTH LINE

DEMOLITION OF A LISTED HERITAGE BUILDING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner reviewed the request for demolition for 11528 Ninth Line. This matter had been referred to the Building Evaluation Sub-Committee, which concluded it is a Group 3 heritage building. The recommendation is to urge the owner to repair the building to re-tenant it, but to not object to the demolition if the owner decides not to repair it.

Bernardo Capputo, representing the owner, was in attendance, and indicated the owner is not supportive of preserving the structure.

The Committee noted Heritage staffs' expertise and their significant efforts on heritage matters. Staff was requested to provide information and details involved in the evaluation process, at the next Heritage Markham meeting.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham accepts the conclusion of the Evaluation Sub-Committee that the Nathan Tarr House at 11528 Ninth Line is a Group 3 heritage building;

AND THAT the owner be requested to consider the option of appropriately restoring the house to a habitable condition and keeping it tenanted to help ensure its future preservation;

AND THAT if the owner decides to proceed with demolition, the demolition be conditional on:

- a) Advertising the building in a local newspaper for two weeks, for relocation or salvage of parts;
- b) Retaining a demolition contractor that will salvage the major historical components rather than have the material going to a landfill;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to Heritage Section staff signing off on the demolition permit application.

CARRIED

14. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: HP 12 113888

257 MAIN ST. N. MARKHAM VILLAGE

UNAUTHORIZED ALTERATIONS TO 257 MAIN STREET N. (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner explained the unauthorized alterations at 257 Main Street, and discussed the consultation and permit processes. Lengthy discussions involved options for restoration, materials, window treatments, and stairway location.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham directs staff to determine if the interior wall at 257 Main St. N., Markham Village, has been removed;

AND THAT if the interior wall has been removed, that staff make reasonable recommendations for partial window restoration including installation of muntin bars, taking economic factors into consideration;

AND THAT if the wall has not been removed, Heritage Markham recommends that the house be restored to its original appearance using any original materials that are still available.

15. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION

COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

127 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE

FILE NUMBER: SC 12 110471 & A/56/12

PROPOSED ADDITION TO EXISTING DWELLING (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

Councillor Colin Campbell disclosed an interest with respect to item # 15, 127 Main Street Unionville, by nature of having an association with neighbouring property owners, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

The Manager of Heritage Planning introduced this proposal for an addition to 127 Main Street Unionville and reviewed the staff recommendations. It was noted that the driveway location may threaten the boulevard tree as well as three trees on the property.

The Committee supported the relocation of the driveway, and generally supported the design but had concerns regarding the overall size of the proposed dwelling.

The applicant was in attendance and was in agreement to the recommendations and suggestions discussed.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham generally supports the proposed architectural style and massing of the proposed addition to 127 Main St. Unionville;

AND THAT Heritage Markham does not support the requested variance to permit a Maximum Lot Coverage of 36.6% and recommends that the applicant revise the design to conform to the provisions of the By-law;

AND THAT Heritage Markham delegates final approval of the design of the addition at 127 Main St. Unionville Architectural Review Sub-Committee and to Heritage Section Staff;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan agreement with the Town containing the standard provisions of the heritage conservation district plan regarding materials, windows colours, etc.;

AND THAT the proposed driveway be revised to a single lane where it connects with Main St. In order to preserve the front yard trees and green space that is proposed to be removed.

16. COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT CONSENT APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: A/25/12, A/36/12, B/09/12 33 JOSEPH STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE

LOT SEVERANCE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Corr, Committee of Adjustment

The Manager of Heritage Planning reviewed this proposal for a lot severance and variances for 33 Joseph Street. This matter had been referred to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee, and the recommendations from the Sub-Committee meeting held on April 19, 2012, were reviewed. Discussions included tree preservation, lot orientation, and the variances requested.

The applicant was in attendance and had no further comments.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the application for lot severance (B/09/12) at 33 Joseph Street, Markham Village;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the following variances from the zoning by-law:

Severed Lot (A/35/12) Minimum Lot Area of 5744 sq ft

Retained Lot (A/36/12)

Minimum Lot Area of 6353 sq ft Minimum Rear Yard setback of 12.7 ft Minimum Side Yard setback (south) of 3.9 ft

17. INFORMATION

LISTING OF CONTRACTORS, RESTORERS, TRADES PEOPLE, BUILDING MOVERS, AND ARCHITECTS'/DESIGNERS SPECIALIZING IN HERITAGE PROJECTS IN THE MARKHAM (TORONTO AREA) (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manager of Heritage Planning discussed the listing of contractors and clarified the Town's policy with respect to this customer service initiative. The Manager noted that some people may be under the misconception that this listing is in some manner a preferred listing and that the applicants are required to utilize only these firms. This is incorrect. It was reiterated that property owners can choose anyone they wish to undertake alterations to their heritage property. They are in no way required or advised that they must use this listing.

The Town has determined that it does not want to disadvantage any contractor who is a member of Heritage Markham or a related family member by restricting them from being included on the list. The Manger noted that the Heritage Markham Committee has had a well established protocol for dealing with Committee members who have to appear before the committee on behalf of their clients or if family members are employed in the heritage field and interact with the Committee.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive as information.

CARRIED

18. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION

FILE NUMBER: SC 12 123116

158 MAIN STREET N, MARKHAM VILLAGE

NEW PARKING AREA AND DRIVEWAY PAVING (16.11) Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

J. Parsons, Court Administrative Coordinator

The Senior Heritage Planner advised that a Notice to Comply has been issued to the owners of 158 Main Street, with respect to paving almost all of the front yard of this commercial property. Options were discussed regarding removal of the new paving, restoration of the property to its previous condition, landscaping, grading, and replacement of the fence that had been removed.

The Committee noted that it would like to see any landscape features in open beds rather than planters, and questioned if it would be appropriate for all the paving to be removed.

Nick Pileggi, representing the applicant, supported the staff recommendation and would like to work with Heritage staff to find a solution.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that all unauthorized paving be removed;

AND THAT the applicant submit revised detailed plans;

AND THAT any additional parking area that may be approved by the Site Plan Control application consist of permeable materials.

CARRIED

19. EVENT – HERITAGE MARKHAM DESIGNATION PLAQUE CEREMONY

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manger of Heritage Planning advised of the Designation Plaque Ceremony on May 27, 2012, and provided event details. The members were encouraged to attend.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive this item as information

CARRIED

20. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK

PROPOSED ADDITIONS AND ALTERATIONS

1 PETER STREET

MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning;

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner.

The Senior Heritage Planner gave an overview of the proposal for additions and alterations to 1 Peter Street. Staff indicated a concern with the removal of the rear two-storey brick portion of the dwelling. Comments were provided for the Architectural Review Sub-Committee's consideration.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham refer the proposal for additions and alterations to 1 Peter Street to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for review and comments;

AND THAT the Ward Councillor be invited to attend the meeting.

21. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION SC 12 114455 COVERED PORCH AND DETACHED REAR YARD GARAGE 10 ROUGE STREET

MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning;

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner explained the Site Plan Control application proposal for 10 Rouge Street. It was noted that the Committee had not supported recent Minor Variances for the buildings, but that they had been approved by the Committee of Adjustment.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Site Plan Control Application for a covered porch and detached rear yard garage for 10 Rouge Street, subject to the owner entering into an amended Site Plan Agreement containing the usual heritage requirements

CARRIED

22. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
MARMILL GARDEN FEATURE
2-49 MARMILL WAY

MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner explained the situation with the deterioration of the commemorative features in Marmill Garden, and advised of staff findings and recommendations.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the condominium corporation be advised that the commemorative monument in the parkette was erected as part of the approved Site Plan Agreement and is a feature of the development that must be maintained for the site to be in conformity with the Site Plan Agreement, which is registered on title to the property;

AND THAT due to the advanced deterioration of the support posts of the centre arch, Heritage Markham has no objection to the centre arch being taken down by the owner, with the sound parts kept in storage on the property until replacement posts can be sourced and the arch-re-erected;

AND THAT the Town obtain a financial security to ensure that the re-erection of the feature is undertaken in a timely manner;

AND THAT the condominium corporation investigate how to better protect the structures from water damage (i.e. by applying wood preservative, introducing flashing or caulking to prevent water infiltration and by ensuring adequate drainage around the base of the support posts).

CARRIED

23. OFFICIAL PLAN/ZONING AMENDMENT OP/ZA 11 124399
SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION SC 12 119834
PROPOSED MULTI-STOREY RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS
4576 & 4550 STEELES AVENUE; 31, 67, 73 & 81 OLD KENNEDY ROAD
MILLIKEN COMMUNITY

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning;

S. Bordone, Project Planner

The Senior Heritage Planner advised that this area is in transition to a more urban character and this application does not affect the existing Heritage building.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no comment on the Official Plan/Zoning Amendment and Site Plan Control applications since they do not directly impact the designated heritage building at 73 Old Kennedy Road.

CARRIED

24. HERITAGE CANADA FOUNDATION
CALL FOR NOMINATIONS TO THE BOARD OF GOVERNORS
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Manger of Heritage Planning provided background information. Barry Nelson expressed an interests in pursuing a nomination.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive this item as information;

AND THAT Heritage Markham supports the nomination of Barry Nelson for the Board of Governors of the Heritage Canada Foundation.

25. OFFICIAL PLAN/ZONING AMENDMENT OP/ZA 12 132315 NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

PROPOSED TOWNHOUSES

23 WATER STREET

MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive this item as information.

CARRIED

NEW BUSINESS

26. The Committee discussed ways to protect buildings from deterioration and to encourage owners to maintain the buildings. Staff advised of resource restrictions and stated that any property standard issues are referred to By-law Enforcement staff to address; however, this only involved exteriors, not interiors. The Committee requested this issue be discussed further at a future meeting.

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 10:15 PM.