

**HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING
CITY OF MARKHAM
Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre**

Wednesday, July 3, 2013

MINUTES

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke
Jenny Chau
Ted Chisholm
Councillor Don Hamilton
David Johnston
Barry Martin, Vice-Chair
Marion Matthias
Richard Morales
Barry Nelson
David Nesbitt
Ronald Waine, Chair

Regrets

Councillor Colin Campbell
Judith Dawson

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planner
Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner
Kitty Bavington, Council/Committee Coordinator

Ronald Waine, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:19 p.m. by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

Councillor Valerie Burke disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 4, Heritage Permit Applications regarding 26 Colborne Street, by nature of the dwelling being her family home, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)
 - A) New Business

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Heritage Markham agenda be approved.

CARRIED

2. MINUTES OF THE JUNE 12, 2013
HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the Minutes of the Heritage Markham meeting held on June 12, 2013 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATIONS
DELEGATED APPROVALS: BUILDING PERMITS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Committee sought an update on 14 David Gohn Circle, and staff will provide information at the next meeting.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on building, demolition and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

4. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS
DELEGATED APPROVALS: HERITAGE PERMITS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

Councillor Valerie Burke disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 4 Heritage Permit Applications regarding 26 Colborne Street, by nature of the dwelling being her family home, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

Staff will follow up with information on the material for the door at 10 Colborne Street.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

5. TREE REMOVALS
DELEGATED APPROVALS: TREE REMOVAL PERMITS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on the tree removal permit approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

6. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
ZONING BY-LAW AMENDMENT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: SC 13 113809 & ZA 13 113809
5 ROUGE STREET
PROPOSED BUILDING LOTS FRONTING JAMES SCOTT ROAD
AND TWO PROPOSED DWELLINGS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the re-zoning application subject to the creation of two new dwellings addressed as 16 & 18 James Scott Road that comply with the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan;

THAT Heritage Markham does not support the design of the proposed new dwellings date stamped June 20, 2013;

THAT the designs of the proposed new houses fronting James Scott Road be referred to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee for further review and comment;

AND THAT the applicant revise the site plan to show the foot prints of neighbouring dwellings at 12, 20 James Scott Road, and that the applicant provide a streetscape elevation showing the street facing facades of the proposed new houses and 12, 20, 22, 24, 26, 28 and 30 James Scott Road prior to the Architectural Review Sub-Committee meeting.

CARRIED

7. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: PRE 13 121621
7713 YONGE STREET, THORNHILL
PROPOSED PATIO FOR TEA ROOM(16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the creation of a patio in front of 7713 Yonge St.;

THAT final review of the proposed patio fencing and furniture be delegated to Heritage Section Staff;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding, materials, colours, etc.

CARRIED

8. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
15 PETER STREET
PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF EXISTING HOUSE
AND NEW DETACHED DWELLING (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

The Heritage Planner advised of the proposal to demolish the existing non-heritage house (Class B) and construct a new single family dwelling in accordance with the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan guidelines. The guidelines were reviewed with respect to appropriate design.

The Committee questioned staff regarding policies for Class B buildings. Staff reported the policy indicates that generally there will be an opposition to the demolition of this classification particularly if the building is deemed to be relatively significant in terms of adding to the overall heritage character of the district.

The Committee emphasized the importance of a tree inventory and discussed the protective hoarding, noting that trees are not being protected despite numerous calls to By-law Enforcement. Staff were requested to follow up on this issue with appropriate departments.

The Committee questioned if the neighbouring residents have been consulted. A member of the Committee suggested that the proposal is in keeping with other houses recently built in the area.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the existing non-heritage dwelling at Peter St. provided the applicant obtains site plan endorsement from the City for a new single detached dwelling designed in accordance with the guidelines for new construction contained in the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan;

THAT final review of the Site Plan application to construct a new house at 15 Peter St. be delegated to Heritage Section Staff provided that the applicant provides a streetscape elevation satisfactory to Heritage Section Staff, and there is no deviation from the proposed architectural style and 1 1/2 story building form;

THAT staff not release the Building Permit until the tree preservation fencing is in place to the satisfaction of Urban Design and Heritage Section staff;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding, materials, colours, windows etc.

CARRIED

9. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: SC 13 113336
60 DAME GRUEV DRIVE
PROPOSED ADDITION TO AN EXISTING HERITAGE HOUSE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed rear addition to the Abraham Strickler House date stamped June 10 2013, provided the design of the addition be revised to illustrate details such as:

- Projecting windows sills;
- A frieze board beneath the eaves;
- Corner boards and the pattern of horizontal siding;
- More heritage appropriate garage doors;
- Window and door casings etc.;

THAT final review of the site plan control application to restore the Abraham Strickler House and construct a new addition be delegated to heritage section staff;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding materials, colours, windows etc.

CARRIED

10. DEMOLITION PERMIT APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: 13 115290 DP
10015 HIGHWAY 48
WITHDRAWAL OF PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF
TWO BUILDINGS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT staff are requested to complete the research on the property;

AND THAT the building be evaluated by the Building Evaluation Sub-Committee once the research is completed, in order to facilitate future conversations with the owner concerning plans for the buildings at 10015 Highway 48.

CARRIED

11. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: SC 13 120960
7787 YONGE STREET
PROPOSED FAÇADE/STOREFRONT ALTERATIONS (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Heritage Planner
-

The Committee discussed appropriate designs and viewed samples of traditional retail building features and materials found in Canada. Colour was noted as an important aspect. The Committee supported the staff recommendation regarding the use of wooden or wood-like materials instead of stone on the base panels.

It was noted that this is a Class A building and was formerly the Ring Funeral Home.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the removal of the oversized portico on the heritage portion of 7787 Yonge St., as it is of no architectural or historical significance;

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed remodelling of the modern portion of the building at 7787 Yonge St., subject to the knee walls of the storefronts being clad in a material that is a reasonable facsimile of a wooden panelled knee wall, instead of the proposed cultured stone, and the entrance doors being of a more traditional configuration having a recessed panel at the bottom and a glazed upper section;

THAT final review of the application be delegated to Heritage Section Staff provided there are no significant changes to the drawings date stamped June 13, 2013;

AND THAT the applicant enter into a Site Plan agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding, materials, colours, windows etc., in consultation with the Ward Councillor.

CARRIED

12. EVENTS
DOORS OPEN MARKHAM COMMITTEE MINUTES (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive as information.

CARRIED

13. CORRESPONDENCE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Ontario Heritage Trust: Heritage Matters Newsletter, May 2013.
- b) Heritage Canada Foundations: Heritage Magazine Vol. XVI, No. 2, 2013
- c) Heritage Canada Foundation: 2013 Conference
- d) Architectural Conservancy of Ontario: ACORN in a Nutshell newsletter June 17, 2013.

CARRIED

14. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: PRE 13 121582
26 ALBERT STREET
DETACHED TWO CAR GARAGE (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
G. Duncan, Project Planner
-

The Heritage Planner reviewed the application for site plan control and the direction of Council regarding the demolition of the existing house, conditional on the applicant obtaining site plan approval for a replica of the house suitable for a two car garage. An updated memo dated July 3 2013, was provided, providing revised elevation drawings from the applicant and comparing the revised drawings with the features found on the original building. Several differences were noted with respect to the windows, chimney, and building size.

The Committee discussed the definition of “replica” and the intent of Council’s decision, including the direction that as many of the original components as possible be used if the building is not relocated. Discussions included the proposed location on the lot and the alignment and resizing of the building.

Mr. Crabtree, applicant, was in attendance and explained the differences between the original and replica buildings. He agreed to a number of adjustments to the plans including installing a replicated chimney and increasing the building height to allow properly scaled and aligned second storey windows (east side). In the event the original building is not relocated to Heritage Estates, Mr. Crabtree stated he would use as many surviving components of the structure as possible. Staff advised that in the event the original building is not moved, the site plan will be modified to reflect the use of some existing materials and staff would be involved in validating the materials to be reused.

The Committee considered the staff recommendation for modifications to the plans.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the scaling down of the floorplate of the replica garage to 24 feet by 20 feet 5 inches but recommends that the height of the new building be the same as the heritage building, and that the second storey window, west elevation windows, and chimney be reinstated;

THAT revised plans be brought back to Heritage Markham for review and comment;

AND THAT a Markham Remembered plaque for the original site of the James Campbell House be provided at the applicant’s cost as a condition of site plan approval.

CARRIED

15. REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK
150 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL
AGE AND CONDITION OF BUILDING (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Heritage Planner reviewed the notes and recommendation from the Architectural Review Sub-Committee held on June 25, 2013. The dwelling was confirmed as a Class B status building and demolition is not supported.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham confirms the Class B status of the house at 150 John Street based on the apparent 1930 date of construction of the front section of the building,

THAT the policies and guidelines of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan regarding Class B buildings be followed in any future considerations for changes to the property;

THAT the building contributes significantly to the heritage character and context of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District and demolition is not supported;

AND THAT the applicant should be aware that, as the existing house is on a portion of tableland, with the balance of the property sloping toward the valley and some of the lot is within a steep sloping area, the TRCA's top of bank setback restrictions would likely severely limit development potential of the property if the removal of the existing house was contemplated.

CARRIED

16. SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION
FILE NUMBER: SC 09 129156
9642 NINTH LINE
CORNERSTONE CHRISTIAN COMMUNITY CHURCH (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
R. Cefaratti, Project Planner
-

The Heritage Planner provided background information on the subject property and reviewed the proposed church for 9642 Ninth Line. The building is not within a Heritage District and staff have no objection to the modern design of the new building. It was noted that the submitted drawings related to the heritage building do not appear accurate and do not appear to reflect the proportions of the existing structure, and that the drawings should be amended to be accurate.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham has no comments on the design of the Cornerstone Christian Community Church as it is acknowledged to be a product of its own time and is physically separated from the heritage building;

THAT the site plan be revised to reflect the restoration plan for the heritage building and replace the deck shown on the site plan with a grade-related feature more in keeping with the heritage building, such as a stone patio;

THAT the restoration plan for the heritage building be integrated into the site plan approval process for the entire development, and be included in the site plan agreement with appropriate conditions and financial securities;

THAT staff ensure that approval of the overall development contain a mechanism to ensure that the heritage building will be restored prior to the completion of the construction phase of the new Place of Worship, and not left until the end of construction;

AND THAT the applicant be required to enter into a Heritage Conservation Easement, and provide a Markham Remembered plaque as conditions of site plan approval, as previously recommended by Heritage Markham.

CARRIED

17. AWARDS
ONTARIO HERITAGE TRUST
2013 COMMUNITY RECOGNITION AWARDS AND
YOUNG HERITAGE LEADERS PROGRAM (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
-

The Committee reviewed the list of past winners and considered new nominations.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT the following individuals be nominated for awards under the Ontario Heritage Trust Heritage Community Recognition Program (2013):

- Built Heritage – Fred & Joyce Watt
- Natural Heritage – Jane McCulloch
- Cultural Heritage – Evelin Ellison

CARRIED

18. NEW BUSINESS
TREE PRESERVATION (16.11)
Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning
S. Marsh, Urban Design
C. Jeffery, Urban Design
-

The Committee discussed ways to strengthen tree preservation as an important asset to heritage areas. Staff will investigate the best way to move forward with this recommendation during Council's summer recess.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT staff be encouraged to make every effort to ensure protection and preservation of trees as an important asset to heritage areas;

AND THAT all trees that are threatened and not currently protected, be protected immediately.

CARRIED

19. NEW BUSINESS

14 EUREKA DRIVE (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Further to the recommendations of Heritage Markham at a previous meeting, the applicants are proposing modifications to the proposed addition to the heritage dwelling that are substantially in accordance with the approved plans. The Committee reviewed the modifications and had no concerns.

HERITAGE MARKHAM RECOMMENDS:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the update on 14 Eureka Drive as information.

CARRIED

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.