Heritage Markham Committee Meeting City of Markham Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

June 18, 2014

Minutes

Members

Councillor Valerie Burke Jenny Chau Graham Dewar David Johnston David Nesbitt, Vice-Chair Marion Matthias Templar Tsang-Trinaistich Ronald Waine **Regrets**

Councillor Colin Campbell Judith Dawson Anthony Farr Councillor Don Hamilton Barry Martin, Chair

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planner George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner Kitty Bavington, Council/Committee Coordinator

David Nesbitt, Vice-Chair, convened the meeting at 7:26 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda. There were no disclosures. Ron Waine assumed the Chair for a portion of agenda item No. 13.

1. Approval of Agenda (16.11)

- A) New Business from Committee Members
 - Property Standards on 723 Yonge Street
 - Minor Variance and Site Plan applications for 36 George Street

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That the June 18, 2014 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved.

2. Minutes of the May 14, 2014

Heritage Markham Committee meeting (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on May 14, 2014 be received and adopted.

CARRIED

3. Heritage Permit Application -

Installation of Vinyl and

Aluminum Cladding on a Heritage Building

188-190 Main Street (16.11) File Number: HE 14 119143

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

B. Wiles, By-law Enforcement

The Senior Heritage Planner described the Class A structure at 188-190 Main Street, and the unauthorized installation of vinyl cladding and aluminum around each window. Staff have met with the owner and discussed options. The owner is requesting permission to retain the cladding on the building. If permission is not granted by the City, the owner will be prosecuted under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Mr. Larry Mariani, owner, was in attendance, and advised the Committee that he has owned property in this area for 27 years and has done other similar projects in the past, and was not aware that a permit was required. The building required maintenance and the cladding solution had been recommended by his contractor. Mr. Mariani stated that if the cladding has to be removed, much of the wood siding would also have to be replaced, due to its condition.

The Committee viewed current and past photographs of the building, and discussed the appropriate materials, installation, available contractors for heritage restoration, and the policies and guidelines of the Unionville Heritage Conservation District Plan.

It was confirmed that when Mr. Mariani purchased the property, the building was clad in aluminum (over the original wood siding). Mr. Mariani then added a horizontal wood siding on top of the aluminum. The newly installed vinyl cladding has been installed on top of the existing wood cladding.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham does not support the Heritage Permit submitted for the application of vinyl siding and aluminum trim cladding for the heritage building at 188-190 Main Street as this work does not comply with the policies and guidelines of the Unionville Heritage Conservation District Plan;

That the owner be required to remove the vinyl and aluminum cladding from the building and restore the underlying wood siding and trim to its previous condition.

CARRIED

4. Heritage Permit Application Proposed Circular Driveway (16.11)
148 John Street, Thornhill
File Number: HE 14 118649

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner explained the proposal to create a circular driveway at 148 John Street, using permeable materials. It was noted that the proposal does not conform to the policies and guidelines of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan. The Committee had comments from member Anthony Farr, who was not able to attend.

Mr & Mrs. John Monita, owners, were in attendance to explain the purpose of the circular driveway, to facilitate safe and efficient ingress and egress from his property in an area that experiences long traffic lineups. Mr. Monita advised that there are two entranceways and two cut curbs, and the previous owner had indicated to them that a circular driveway was 'grandfathered', although staff clarified that is not. Mr. Monita suggested that a hammerhead driveway would take up almost as much area, and he displayed photographs of the preliminary work on the project.

The Committee discussed the history of this property and safety issues, and considered options, including initiating traffic calming measures.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham supports the Heritage Permit for a circular driveway at 148 John Street in consideration of the specific traffic safety concerns affecting the property, on the basis of the use of permeable materials, retention of the picket fence, and additional plantings, and on the understanding that the support of this circular driveway does not imply future support of similar driveways elsewhere in the heritage district.

5. Building or Sign Permit Application -

Delegated Approval of Building Permits (16.11)

9 Albert Street, Markham Village

68 Main Street North, Markham Village

81 John Street, Thornhill

70 Karachi Drive, Armadale

5970 16th Avenue, Markham Village

4561 Highway 7 East, Unionville

150 Main Street, Unionville

6827 14th Avenue, Box Grove

18 James Scott Road, Markham Village

16 James Scott Road, Markham Village

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on building and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

6. Heritage Permit Application -

Delegated Approvals of Heritage Permits (16.11)

94 John Street, Thornhill

99 Main Street North, Joseph Street Parkette, Markham Village

10 Eckardt Avenue, Unionville

819 Bur Oak Avenue, Markham

Colborne Street, Thornhill (Streetscape Alterations)

12 Wismer Place, Markham Heritage Estates

29 Jerman Street, Markham Village

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

7. Tree Removal Application -

Delegated Approval of Tree Removal Permits (16.11)

81 John Street, Thornhill 16 Maple Street, Unionville

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on the tree removal permit approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

8. Site Plan Control Application -

Proposed Rear Addition (16.11) 10 Centre Street, Markham Village

File Number: SC 14 138349

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of the existing one storey rear portion of 10 Centre St; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the scale, form, massing and materials of the proposed rear addition to 10 Centre St. shown in the drawings date stamped June 6, 2014; and,

That the existing vinyl windows be replaced with new wooden windows matching the shape, profiles, pane divisions and method of operation as the original historic windows as a condition of Site Plan Approval for the proposed rear addition; and,

That final review of the application be delegated to Heritage Section Staff; and further,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding colours, materials, windows, etc.

9. Request for Feedback -

Proposed Addition to a Listed Heritage Property (16.11) 53 Dickson Hill Road

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham suggests the following design modifications for the proposed addition to the heritage house at 53 Dickson Hill Road:

- The original house and the addition should be clad in different materials to differentiate the old from new;
- The posts in front of the garage bays should either be simplified by the removal of the masonry bases or eliminated altogether, and possibly be replaced by brackets;
- The porch-like canopy over the garage bays should be at the same height as the porch on the south wing of the heritage house and should stop short of the outmost garage bay.
- The face of the most northerly garage bay should be slightly recessed from the other two garage bays to provide some relief to the garage façade.

CARRIED

10. Notice of Public Meeting -

Notice of Public Consultation Centre #2 Road Crossing of Highway 404 between 16th Avenue to Major Mackenzie Drive -Class Environmental Assessment Study (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive as information.

CARRIED

11. Site Plan Control Application -

Commercial Patio - Second Cup (16.11) 60 Main Street North, Markham Village

File Number: SC 14 115756

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the commercial patio for the Second Cup at 60 Main Street North

12. Correspondence (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Historic Main Street Unionville Walking Tour: New Brouchure.
- b) Society for the Preservation of Historic Thornhill: May, 2014 Newsletter
- c) Architectural Conversancy of Ontario: ACORN Newsletter, Spring 2014
- d) Brampton Heritage Board 2014 Newsletter
- e) Community Heritage Ontario: CHO News, June 2014
- f) Heritage Canada The National Trust: Heritage Magazine, Spring 2014 issue

CARRIED

13. Site Plan Control Application and

Committee of Adjustment Variance Application - Proposed Addition to a Heritage Property (16.11)

3 Franklin Street

File Numbers: SC 14 118344, A/65/14

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner R. Punnit, Committee of Adjustment

Ron Waine assumed the Chair for a portion of this matter.

The Manager of Heritage Planning provided an overview of the proposal for 3 Franklin Street, and reviewed the staff memorandum including the notes and recommendation from the Architectural Review Sub-Committee held on June 4, 2014, as well as the applicant's response to the recommendations. A handout was provided listing detailed comparisons of the size of single detached dwellings. Lot sizes, and the allowable amount of gross floor area of each property in proximity to the subject property.

Russ Gregory, representing the applicant, was in attendance and provided clarification on the size of the garage door, tree preservation, the roof line, the removal of three additions, the need for a greater GFA ratio, height, and other details. Mr. Gregory advised the roof ridge could be lowered approximately one foot.

The Committee had lengthy discussions regarding the size and scale, and whether it is sympathetic to the heritage character of the District in which the average size of house is around 1800 sq. ft. Staff noted the importance of a specific tree and how the placement of the new addition would be detrimental to its survival. Mr. Gregory agreed to ensure it is protected and will be preparing a tree preservation plan as part of the site plan application.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham acknowledges the policies of the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan regarding the relocation of heritage buildings, but in this instance agrees that the relocation of the house within the existing property can be supported due to the condition of the foundation; and,

That Heritage Markham supports the revised plans for the proposed addition to the heritage house at 3 Franklin Street with the following modification:

• The design features of the addition should more closely reflect the architecture of the heritage house; and further,

That Heritage Markham has the following comments on the variances:

- No objection to the proposed front yard setback
- No objection to the lot size variance as it is an existing situation
- No objection to the north side yard setback as it is minor
- No objection to the GFA ratio increase to 56.7%, subject to site plan approval as a condition of the Committee of Adjustment approval.

CARRIED

14. Request for Feedback -

Proposed Amenity Area Structure (16.11)

14 Eureka Street, Unionville

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner introduced the proposal for an outdoor amenity structure, and reviewed previous discussions by Heritage Markham regarding this property and proposal. The applicant had originally requested a privacy fence, and is now considering a pergola concept in keeping with the historic architectural character of the house and District.

Mr. Trevelyan Lake, the owner, was in attendance to display concept renderings and discuss the details. The Committee offered design and material suggestions.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham supports in principal the proposed location of an outdoor amenity structure at 14 Eureka St. provided it is designed to be more complementary to the historic architectural character of the house and District; and,

That Heritage Markham supports any variances required to construct the proposed structure provided that it does not exceed the foot print of the previously proposed sunroom; and,

That final review of the design of the proposed structure and any planning or building permit application s required to permit the proposed structure be delegated to Heritage Section Staff.

CARRIED

15. Site Plan Control Application -

Proposed Conversion of Accessory Building (16.11)

104 John Street, Thornhill File Number: SC 14 113334

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Workal, Heritage Planner

The Heritage Planner described the Site Plan Control Application for the conversion of a portion of an accessory building at 104 John Street, to accommodate office use (home occupation). Modifications include the installation of a glass curtain wall window on the east side of the barn facing the valley lands, requiring bird-strike mitigation measures. Minor changes are proposed for other elevations.

The Committee commented on the amount of glass, and suggested the Architectural Review Sub-committee, including all Thornhill members of the Sub-committee (if available), do a site visit. This would not cause a delay, as the applicant will still have to wait for TRCA approval.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That the Site Plan Control Application for 104 John Street, Thornhill, be referred to the Architectural Review Sub-committee, including all Thornhill members, for a site visit, and a recommendation to Heritage Markham.

CARRIED

16. Events -

Doors Open Markham, 2014 Organizing Committee Meeting (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive as information.

17. Victoria Square Heritage District Study - Open House Notice, June 25, 2014 (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

The Senior Heritage Planner provided an overview of the event and encourages all members to attend.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive as information.

CARRIED

18. Main Street Unionville Precinct Master Plan Study Update (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Staff demonstrated where the study can be found on the City website, and requested members provide feedback.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That Heritage Markham receive a presentation on the Main Street Unionville Precinct Master Plan Study at the next Heritage Markham meeting and provide comments at that time.

CARRIED

19. New Business

Site Plan Control Application and Committee of Adjustment Variance Application Proposed Demolition and construction of a semi-detached dwelling 36 George Street

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

R. Punnit, Committee of Adjustment

The Heritage Planner explained the proposal to demolish the dwelling and build a semidetached dwelling at 36 George Street. The required front yard setback and other variances were outlined. Staff are recommending referral to the Architectural Review Sub-committee with authority to approve, in order to meet the Committee of Adjustment deadline. An option was suggested to delegate the Minor Variance application to the subcommittee and bring the site plan application back to Heritage Markham.

Russ Gregory, representing the applicant, was in attendance and presented a site plan and elevations. The owners were also in attendance.

Heritage Markham Recommends:

That the Minor Variance application for 36 George Street be referred to the Architectural Review Sub-committee with delegated authority to approve; and

That the Site Plan Control application be considered at the next Heritage Markham committee meeting.

CARRIED

20. New Business 7723 Yonge Street

A Committee member discussed the deteriorating condition of the exterior of the commercial plaza at 7723 Yonge Street. The Committee recommended that By-law Enforcement staff be alerted to property standards issues.

21. New Business Unionville Arms

A Committee member noted the temporary approval granted to Unionville Arms for outdoor TV displays during the World Cup events, and advised that the owners had sought the permission on a permanent basis. A nearby establishment has also installed outdoor TVs without permission. Staff advised of discussions with the Legal Department and By-law Enforcement in this regard and this issue may be revisited as an amendment to the Heritage District Plan.

Adjournment

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 11:25 PM.