# Heritage Markham Committee Meeting City of Markham July 11, 2018

# Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

Members

David Nesbitt, Chair

Maria Cerone

Ian Darling

Ken Davis

Graham Dewar

Anthony Farr

Councillor Don Hamilton

**David Johnston** 

Jennifer Peters-Morales

Councillor Karen Rea

Zuzana Zila

**Regrets** 

Councillor Valerie Burke

**Evelin Ellison** 

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

### **Staff**

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner Victoria Hamilton, Committee Secretary (PT)

David Nesbitt, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:24 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 3 (15 Union Street, Unionville) by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

David Johnston disclosed an interest with respect to Item #7, by nature of being the Architect of the project, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

A member of the Committee requested that Item #9 be moved forward in the Agenda and discussed ahead of the Consent portion.

# 1. Approval of Agenda (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
  - 33 Albert Street Site Plan Control Application
- B) New Business from Committee Members

#### Recommendation:

That the July 11, 2018 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved with the addition of the addendum item.

CARRIED

# 2. Minutes of the June 13, 2018

**Heritage Markham Committee Meeting (16.11)** 

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Minutes

There was discussion regarding whether the Recommendation for Item #17 (1 Station Street) sufficiently encompassed the condition that the consent was dependent on the home remaining a semi-detached dwelling. Staff advised that the current wording of the Recommendation adequately notes this condition.

# Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on June 13, 2018 be received and adopted as presented.

3. Heritage Permit Applications,

133 Main Street, Unionville,

15 Union Street, Unionville,

45 Church Street, Markham Village,

107-113 Main Street North, Markham Village,

10 Heritage Corners Lane, Markham Heritage Estates,

**Delegated Approvals: Heritage Permits (16.11)** 

File Nos: HE 18 235358

HE 18 236513 HE 18 233685 HE 18 235375 HE 18 235038

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memo

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 3 (15 Union Street, Unionville) by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

# **Recommendation:**

That Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

4. Building or Sign Permit Applications,

19 Victoria Avenue, Unionville,

143 Main Street, Unionville,

150 Main Street, Unionville,

4561 Highway 7, Unionville Area,

19 Maple Lane, Markham Village,

30B Rouge Street, Markham Village,

16 George Street, Markham Village,

**Delegated Approvals: Building, Demolition and Sign Permits (16.11)** 

File Nos: 17 165727 HP

18 234677 HP

18 236235 SP

18 229485 AL

14 244763 HP

16 136466 DP

18 229285 HP

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

#### Memo

There was discussion regarding which side of the street 19 Victoria Avenue was on. Staff advised that it is located on the south side. The Committee inquired how substantial the revision was to the deck design. Staff advised that it is a minor change.

The Committee inquired which building was located at 150 Main Street Unionville. Staff advised that it is the old Veterans' hall.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on building, demolition and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

**CARRIED** 

5. Tree Removal Application,

159 Main Street North, Markham Village,

**Delegated Approvals: Tree (16.11)** 

File No: 18 236890 TREE

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memo

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on the tree removal permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

#### 6. Site Plan Control Application,

4496 Highway 7 East, Unionville Heritage Conservation District, Automobile Dealer Use Addition to Existing Automotive Sound Business (16.11)

File No: SC 18 228209

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Project Planner

Memo

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no comment on this application at 4496 Highway 7 from a heritage perspective.

**CARRIED** 

# 7. Committee of Adjustment Variance Application,

12 Gleason Avenue, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed 2<sup>nd</sup> Storey Addition (16.11)

File No: A/75/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Memo

David Johnston disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 7, by nature of being the Architect of the project, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the requested variance to permit a front yard setback of 17'-6" or the proposed second storey addition to 12 Gleason Avenue, provided that there are no substantial changes to the design dated June 2017 and June 2018; and,

That final Heritage Markham review of any future development application for the proposed second storey addition to 12 Gleason Avenue dated June 2017 and June 2018 be delegated to Heritage Section staff; and,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding windows, materials, colours etc.

# 8. Site Plan Control Application,

43 Castleview Crescent,

**Proposed Detached Garage/ Accessory Building (16.11)** 

File No: SC 18 109206

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Project Planner

<u>Memo</u>

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed garage/accessory building at 43 Castleview Crescent from a heritage perspective and delegates final review of the Site Plan application to Heritage Section staff provided there are no substantial changes to the design by David Wylie date stamped July 12, 2011 and revised May 28, 2018; and,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding windows, material, colours etc.

**CARRIED** 

## 9. Site Plan Control Application,

Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, 16 Church Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Addition to Heritage Building (16.11)

File Nos: SC 235037

A/78/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Project Planner

Memo

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He advised that a new foundation will be constructed as the existing one has structural issues. He also advised that many of the variances listed recognize the existing heritage dwelling conditions that do not conform to the by-law, but require approval to allow for the addition to be constructed.

There was discussion regarding the installation of pavers for the drive leading to the garage instead of asphalt to allow for better water drainage. The applicant was in attendance, and agreed to take this into consideration.

The Committee commented that they are pleased with the proposal by the applicant.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham supports the proposal for 16 Church Street to raise the building onto a new foundation in the same location on the lot, provided the finished floor height above grade is no greater than 2 feet, and supports the proposed addition and the variances required to implement the project; and,

That the applicant work with Heritage Section staff to determine restoration details for exterior finish, doors, windows, etc. appropriate to the c.1860 period of the existing dwelling; and,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with conditions relating to materials, colours, etc.

**CARRIED** 

# 10. Site Plan Control Application,39 Artisan Trail, Victoria Square Community,Heritage House Reconstruction and Addition (16.11)

File No: SC 18 182081

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Project Planner

#### Memo

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He noted that although the house was constructed c. 1840, the structure was renovated in the 1880's and that Staff recommends the detailing of the proposed addition to be in keeping with the 1880's architecture.

There was discussion regarding whether any variances were required for the project. Staff advised they were unaware of any variances required, however the Zoning Section has not yet reviewed the application. The applicant was in attendance and stated that he was also unaware of any variances required.

The applicant advised that he will have his engineer review the remaining walls of the heritage building and incorporate them in the reconstruction of the house, if possible.

The Committee commented that the garage-side of the structure will be in keeping with the look of the other large houses in the subdivision.

There was discussion regarding the odd numbered houses being on the west side of the street, and whether the heritage portion of the dwelling would be visible to the public. Staff advised that the vegetation growing in the valley is wild, and though the heritage structure is currently visible it is possible it will be screened in the future. Staff

commented that there is a paved walking path on the valley side of the property which allows the heritage structure to be appreciated by those walking along the path.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham recommends that the detailing of the windows (brick arches and glazing pattern) and front porch (porch posts and roof) of the proposed addition to 39 Artisan Trail be re-designed in consultation with Heritage Section staff to be more in keeping with mid-19th century farmhouse architecture of old Markham Township, to achieve a more compatible addition to the heritage dwelling; and,

That the remaining three walls of the original heritage building be re-used in the reconstruction of the Adam Hagler House; and,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement including the standard requirements relating to materials, colours, etc.

**CARRIED** 

#### 11. Site Plan Control Application,

Zoning By-law Amendment Application,

**Notice of Public Meeting,** 

Official Plan Amendment Application,

9064-9110 Woodbine Avenue, Buttonville Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Townhouse Development and Addition to an Existing Heritage Dwelling (16.11)

File Nos: OP/ZA/SU/CU/SC 17 153653

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

#### Memo

Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham generally supports the form, massing, and height of the proposed townhouses and their orientation to Woodbine Avenue from a heritage perspective; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends that the use of stone be limited to a foundation treatment no higher than the sills of ground floor windows and that the townhouses be clad in an appropriate brick, wood, or wood-like substitute; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends that the architectural detailing of the proposed townhouses better reflect the 19<sup>th</sup> century vernacular homes of Buttonville and the townhouse development immediately to the north as recommended by the Buttonville District Plan; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the design of the proposed rear addition to the heritage dwelling; and,

That Heritage Markham supports the removal of the visitor parking spaces from the front yard of the heritage dwelling; and,

That Heritage Markham is satisfied with amenity spaces available to the heritage dwelling; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends retention of the large Silver Maple tree adjacent to the heritage dwelling; and further,

That final review of any development application required to permit the proposed townhouse development and addition to the existing heritage dwelling be delegated to Heritage Section Staff, provided there are no substantial changes to the drawings presented date stamped March 2018.

**CARRIED** 

## 12. Site Plan Control Application,

Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, Consent Application,

14 Ramona Boulevard, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Severance, New Dwelling and Detached Garage (16.11)

File Nos: SC 18 168268

B/07/18 A/95/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Memo

Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

There was discussion regarding the requested severance. The Committee supported Staff's recommendation in opposition to the severance of the property.

The Committee inquired if the property could be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act rather than Part V in order to prevent further severance of the property or reduction of the front landscaping. Staff indicated that a Part IV designation would

require specific attributes of the property to be listed whereas a Part V designation includes the property in more general terms.

The Committee recognized the historical importance of this property in the community and indicated that the frontage of the property as well as the lot size are significant features of the heritage value and should be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Staff noted that the variance and consent applications are current and if the Committee decides to recommend council designate this property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act then this matter would be put before Council in the fall. The Committee advised that they feel strongly about not severing this property.

The Committee inquired if a precedent was previously set with another property being granted severance, and inquired if any decision was made regarding the remainder of this property when a portion was previously severed to create 16 Ramona Boulevard. Staff advised that, at that time, staff proposed a one-foot reserve along the frontage line so the City could control further severances, however the applicant convinced the Committee of Adjustment that the reserve was not necessary along the entire property, therefore only the area in front of the heritage building has the reserve.

The Committee proposed an amendment to the recommendation - that Heritage Markham further recommends staff to consider designating this property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to designate the front landscaping and lot size as significant attributes of the heritage property.

The Committee proposed an additional amendment to the staff recommendation, to change the wording from "does not support" to "strongly opposes".

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham **strongly opposes** the proposed further severance of 14 Ramona Boulevard and the accompanying Site Plan Control and Variance Application in support of the proposed new dwelling and accessory building because of their detrimental effects on the Robinson House which include:

- The elimination of varied lots sizes which contribute to the distinct character of the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District;
- Placing a new dwelling in the front yard of the Robinson House, which reduces its context and makes the Robinson House more of an anomaly rather than supporting its significance and original relationship with Markham Main Street;
- The elimination of numerous mature trees which surround the Robinson House that significantly contribute to its historical context and heritage character of the district.

That Heritage Markham suggests Staff consider the opportunity of designating this property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to identify the front landscaping and lot size as significant attributes of the heritage property.

**CARRIED** 

#### 13. New Business

Site Plan Control Application, 33 Albert Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Proposed Detached Accessory Building at Rear of Property (16.11)

File Nos: SC 18 154568

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Memo

Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He advised that the accessory building is located at the rear of the property and would not be visible from the street and have no impact on the public realm.

There was discussion regarding variances required for the project. Staff advised they were unaware of any variances.

#### Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to design of the proposed accessory building at 33 Albert Street received on June 21, 2018, and delegates final review of any development application required to permit its construction to Heritage Section Staff.

**CARRIED** 

#### Adjournment

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 8:10 PM.