Heritage Markham Committee Meeting City of Markham June 13 2018

Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

Members

David Nesbitt, Chair
Ian Darling
Ken Davis
Graham Dewar
Evelin Ellison
Anthony Farr
Councillor Don Hamilton
David Johnston
Councillor Karen Rea
Maria Cerone

Regrets

Councillor Valerie Burke Zuzana Zila Jennifer Peters-Morales

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner Alida Tari, Acting Manager of Access & Privacy

David Nesbitt, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:20 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 5 (5 Euclid Street), by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

David Johnston disclosed an interest with respect to Item #15, by nature of being the Architect of the project, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

1. Approval of Agenda (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
 - Jarvis Fairty House designation by-law amendment
- B) New Business from Committee Members

Recommendation:

That the June 13, 2018 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved with the addition of the addendum item.

Carried

2. Minutes of the May 9, 2018

Heritage Markham Committee Meeting (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Minutes

Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on May 9, 2018 be received and adopted.

3. Heritage Permit Applications,

104 John Street, Thornhill,

31 Eureka Street, Unionville,

210 Main Street, Unionville

137A Main Street, Unionville,

118 Main Street North, Markham Village,

9 James Walker Court, Markham Village

2-49 Marmill Way, Markham Village,

7943 Ninth Line Box Grove Community,

Delegated Approvals: Building, Demolition and Sign Permits (16.11)

File Numbers: HE 18 232424 HE 18 232433 HE 18 232434 HE 18 231444

HE 18 232300

HE 18 232311 HE 18 232935

HE 18 232635

HE 18 234718

HE 18 229353

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memo

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

4. Building, Sign and Permit Applications,

15 Colborne Street, Thornhill,

32 Victoria Avenue, Unionville,

4491 Highway 7 East, Unionville

50 Peter Street, Markham Village,

15/17 George Street, Markham Village,

31 Wales Avenue, Markham Village

60 Main Street North, Markham Village,

2718 Elgin Mills Road, Victoria Square,

2730 Elgin Mills Road, Victoria Square,

5560 14th Avenue, Armadale Community,

10537 McCowan Road, Milnesville Community,

Delegated Approvals: Building, Demolition and Sign Permits (16.11)

File Numbers: 18 233703 HP

18 229803 HP

18 232246 AL

17 182930 HP

17 179942 HP

18 228548 HP

10 220340 111

18 230347 SP

18 233399 DP

18 233407 DP

18 234008 HP

18 230235 HP

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memo

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on building, demolition and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

5. Tree Removal Applications,

15 Church Lane,5 Euclid Street,

Delegated Approvals: Tree (16.11)

File Numbers: 18 229434 TREE

18 229087 TREE

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memo

David Nesbitt disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 5 (5 Euclid Street), by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on the tree removal permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

Carried

6. Demolition Permit Applications,

30 Washington Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Demolition of Shed/Garage (16.11)

File Number: 17 175034 DP

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

J. Chow, Applications Administrator

G. Duncan, Project Planner

Memo

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the demolition of the shed/garage in the rear yard of 30 Washington Street.

7. Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, 104 John Street, Thornhill Heritage Conservation District, Reduced Rear Yard Setback for an Accessory Building (Home Occupation) (16.11)

File Number: A/67/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memo

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no comments from a heritage perspective regarding the requested variance to permit the existing accessory building at 104 John St., used as a Home Occupation to have a minimum rear yard setback of 15 ft.

Carried

8. Consent Application,

10 Albert Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Severance of Newly Built Semi-Detached Dwelling (16.11)

File Number: B/04/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memo

There was discussion regarding whether a condition could be included that the severance is granted with the understanding that the home remains a semi-detached dwelling. Staff agreed that the planning report could recommend conditions linking support of the consent to the approved semi-detached dwelling but that this is not a heritage issue.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no comments from a heritage perspective on the proposed severance of the property at 10 Albert Street to create separate ownership of the residential units of the newly constructed semi-detached dwelling.

9. Site Plan Control and Minor Variance Application,

14 David Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Addition and Improvements to a Non-Heritage Dwelling (16.11)

File Number: SC 17 171213

A/180/17

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

<u>Memo</u>

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed scale, massing, form, height and architectural details of the proposed house at 14 David Street; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the requested variances for the proposed house at 14 David Street as it is complementary to the heritage character of the District and compatible with the scale of adjacent dwellings; and,

That final review of the Site Plan Control and Variance applications be delegated to Heritage Section staff; and further,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement containing the standard conditions regarding windows, materials, colours etc.

Carried

10. Zoning By-law Amendment Application,

Plan of Subdivision, 3151 Elgin Mills Road East,

Thomas Frisby Jr. House (16.11) File Number: ZA/SU 18 181743

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Kitagawa, Project Planner

Memo

The Committee discussed the importance and their support of the Thomas Frisby Jr. House remaining on its original site.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham supports the retention of the Thomas Frisby Jr. House on its original site as proposed in the current applications; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends that the adjacent development should be generally complementary to the Thomas Frisby Jr. House; and,

That Heritage Markham sees this an example for future projects that have existing heritage dwellings within the development; and further,

That Heritage Markham recommends that the standard Heritage Conditions of Draft Approval be included in the approval of the Draft Plan of Subdivision application.

Carried

11. Correspondence (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Correspondence

Recommendation:

That the following correspondence be received as information:

- a) Ontario Heritage Trust: Heritage Matters Newsletter, Spring 2018 (Staff has full copy)
- b) Community Heritage Ontario: Spring 2018 Newsletter. Committee Members receive this publication via email.

Carried

12. Site Plan Control Application,

Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, 19 George Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Semi-Detached Dwelling (16.11)

File Number: SC 18 226716

A/48/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Project Planner

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memo

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He pointed out that the original application had a rear yard setback variance, but it is no longer required. Staff advised that because the dwelling is a semi-detached, the infill by-law is not applicable.

There was discussion regarding the lot coverage, and whether that number can be reduced. The applicant was in attendance, and advised that to reduce the lot coverage that the front porch would have to be removed as opposed to interior floor space.

The Committee suggested that staff continue to work with the applicant to soften the roof lines.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed development and the requested variances to implement it subject to:

- The placement of the heritage dwelling on a new foundation, in the same location as existing, provided that the ground floor height above grade is no higher than 2 feet (this is supported based on specific site conditions at this property);
- The retention of the existing heritage windows and storms;
- The windows in the addition/new dwelling being revised to a 1 over 1 or 2 over 2 glazing pattern to reflect window designs historically found in Markham Village;
- The existing 6/6 window on the north elevation of the historic tail of the heritage house being retained and not replaced with a 4/4 window as shown on the drawing;
- An increased rear yard setback for the foundation of the southerly dwelling unit to address the preservation of the mature silver maple (tree #14 on the arborist report) as requested by Urban Design staff; and
- The applicant entering into a Site Plan Agreement containing the usual conditions relating to materials, colours, etc.; and,

That staff continue to work with the applicant to soften the roof lines; and further,

That as a condition of the approval of the Minor Variance application, the owner be required to enter into a Heritage Conservation Easement Agreement with the City for the heritage dwelling.

Carried

13. Site Plan Control Application, 15 Bewell Drive,

Proposed 2 Storey Addition to an Existing Heritage Dwelling (16.11)

File Number: SC 18 181794

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

Memo

Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the meeting notes of the Architectural Review Subcommittee held on May 30, 2018

The Committee spoke in support of the recommendations from the Architectural Review Subcommittee.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed two storey addition to the existing heritage dwelling at 15 Bewell Drive, subject to the exterior east facing wall being set back at least 6" from the plane of the one storey wall of the heritage portion of the house in order to create a shadow line to better differentiate the new construction from the original house; and,

That final review of any development application required to approve the revised plans for the proposed two storey addition to 15 Bewell Drive be delegated to Heritage Section Staff; and further,

That the applicant enter in to a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding materials, colours and windows etc.

Carried

14. Site Plan Control Application,

Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, 28 Wales Avenue, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Proposed Additions to the Existing House and Accessory Building (16.11)

File Number: SC 18 232302

A/65/18

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Heritage Planner

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memo

Peter Wokral, Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed addition to the existing heritage dwelling at 28 Wales Avenue provided the unauthorized driveway/parking pad at the south side of the property is removed and sodded, and that the proposed two over one windows are changed to two over two windows or one over one windows, and that the chimney is clad in brick instead of vertical siding; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed roof structure to be attached to the existing accessory building; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the requested variances identified in A/65/18; and,

That final review of any development application required to permit the construction of the proposed addition to the existing house and detached accessory building be delegated to Heritage Section staff; and further,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding windows, materials and colours etc.

Carried

15. Committee of Adjustment Variance Application 30 Colborne Street, Thornhill Heritage Conservation District, Detached Garage (16.11)

File Number: A/142/16

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Project Planner,

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memo

David Johnston disclosed an interest with respect to Item #15, by nature of being the Architect of the project, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

There was discussion regarding the preservation of the existing trees on the property adjacent to the driveway and the use of an appropriate driveway surface treatment.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the variance requested to permit a detached garage in the side yard of 30 Colborne Street subject to the Urban Design department being satisfied with tree protection measures; and,

That the correspondence from Diane Berwick, 15 Colborne Street and Pam Birrell, on behalf of the Society for the Preservation of Historic Thornhill be received.

16. Zoning By-law Amendment Application,

Plan of Subdivision, 31 Victory Avenue,

Alexander McPherson House (16.11)

File Number: ZA/SU 18 149630

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Bordone, Project Planner

Memo

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

There was discussion regarding the importance of retaining the heritage building on its original site, and ensuring that it is integrated into the new subdivision as opposed to being relocated to a separate lot. The Committee suggested that the word "placement" be replaced with "integration" in the recommendation.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham is concerned from a heritage perspective regarding the treatment of the heritage dwelling and recommends the following information be provided prior to consideration of any approvals:

- Justification from the applicant as to why the heritage dwelling needs to be relocated to a new site;
- Submission of a concept site plan illustrating the **integration** of the heritage dwelling on the new site (or the original site), any proposed additions, driveway/garage location and amenity area to demonstrate that the site is of an appropriate size to accommodate all the features typically associated with a residential dwelling, and that the front of the dwelling faces a public right-of-way; and
- Information on the timing of the restoration of the heritage building relative to the timing of construction of the overall development, to ensure that work on the heritage building will not be left to the last; and,

That the standard Heritage Conditions of Draft Approval (which include the preservation and maintenance of the building, heritage easement agreement, site plan approval (including restoration plan), financial securities and further conditions relating to the Subdivision Agreement, such as the requirement for an interpretive plaque (Markham Remembered) be included in any approval of the Draft Plan of Subdivision application; and further,

That the applicant take immediate steps to implement the stabilization work on the heritage building to prevent any further physical deterioration of the vacant structure.

17. Committee of Adjustment Variance Applications,

Consent Application,

1 Station Street, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District, Semi-Detached Dwellings (16.11)

File Number: B/25/16

A/181/16 A/182/16

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

J. Leung, Committee of Adjustment

G. Duncan, Project Planner

Memo

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

The Committee inquired why the applicant applied for the severance prior to applying for a site plan control application.

The owner was in attendance, and advised that they were not aware of the application process. He also advised that all the mature trees on the property will be preserved.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection to Consent Application B/26/16 and Minor Variance Applications A/181/16 and A/182/16 from a heritage perspective; and

Heritage Markham recommends that Site Plan Endorsement of a semi-detached dwelling be a condition of approval for all of the Committee of Adjustment applications.

18. Designation By-law Amendment Jarvis Fairty House 6350 Steeles Avenue East By-law 2013-30

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham acknowledges the need to amend the legal description in the designation by-laws for the Jarvis Fairty House (Designation By-law 2013-30) and has no objection.

Carried

19. New Business

Heritage Markham Committee

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Councillor Don Hamilton addressed the Committee advising that many of the other City of Markham advisory committees do not meet during July and August, and suggested that Heritage Markham Committee consider not meeting during that time. The majority of the Committee members did not support Heritage Markham Committee not meeting during July and August due to the large number of applications that require review.

Adjournment

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 9:53 PM.