

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

From: Elisabeth Tan

Sent: Saturday, February 09, 2013 3:57 PM

To: Scarpitti, Frank; Heath, Jack; Chiu, Alex; Moretti, Carolina; Hamilton, Don; Landon, Gord; Shore, Howard; Jones, Jim; Kanapathi, Logan; Burke, Valerie; Campbell, Colin; Ho, Alan; Li, Joe; Taylor, Andy; Huycke, Stephen

Subject: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

Dear Mayor and Councillors,

I am in favour of the motion (Public meeting item 7 (1), on Tuesday February 12, 2013): to make all reports related to the GTA Arena public.

Perhaps, with the release of the reports, the arena may get more followers? And we, taxpayers, are able to make a better judgement in regards of the GTA Arena.

Please, read today's great article in the National Post below:

[Markham Needs To Produce More Research On NHL-Ready Arena](#)

Thank you for considering to vote YES to the above motion.

Regards,

Elisabeth Tan

P.S. Please, attach this communication to Tuesday's agenda, since I may not be able to attend the meeting.

Hau, Lucy

2

Subject: FW: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

From: Donna Day

Sent: Saturday, February 09, 2013 9:36 PM

To: Elisabeth Tan; Scarpitti, Frank; Heath, Jack; Chiu, Alex; Moretti, Carolina; Hamilton, Don; Landon, Gord; Shore, Howard; Jones, Jim; Kanapathi, Logan; Burke, Valerie; Campbell, Colin; Ho, Alan; Li, Joe; Taylor, Andy; Huycke, Stephen

Subject: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

Mayor and Councillors

I would draw your attention to the attached article appearing in the National Post today (February 9) stating the need to release all reports on the GTA arena proposal to Markham taxpayers. The motion by Jim Jones to release all reports at the public meeting Tuesday February 12th should be approved by all members of council. This flawed project has lacked transparency and is as a result highly suspect. Those who voted in favour of the funding formula and site plan last week will be closely monitored with this vote. We expect you to represent taxpayers, not those with financial interests such as developers. You need to remember your mandate as elected officials.

[Markham Needs To Produce More Research On NHL-Ready Arena](#)

Donna Day

3

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: GTA Arena Reports

From: Dhimo Lad
Sent: Sunday, February 10, 2013 10:37 PM
To: Mayor & Councillors
Cc: Pettit, Martha;
Subject: GTA Arena Reports

Dear Mayor & Councillors,

As a concerned citizen of Markham I'd like to have as much information available to me as possible about the proposed Arena.

I would like all related reports to be made available to the public. If our money is going into this project we have a right to have all the information made available to us.

Thanks,
Dhimo

4

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Markham Arena

From: shafic kara

Sent: Monday, February 11, 2013 11:46 AM

To: Mayor & Councillors

Cc: Pettit, Martha; boneill@yrmg.com

Subject: Markham Arena

Dear Respected Mayor and Councillors,

It is with great dismay that I read that this matter is being pushed through with very little transparency and has caused a lot of dissatisfaction with you, the Mayor and many of the councillors.

Before this matter is considered as final approval, we as, ratepayers and long time residents of Markham, would like you to open all the documents and discussions pertaining to this matter for public scrutiny and approval.

After all, we are the ones who pay taxes and you may be paying too, but, we as a group have the responsibility and the right to question your decisions as we feel \$ 325 million is a big amount to approve and burden us with the risk.

I request you that this email form part of your agenda for tomorrow, February 12 th meeting.

Thank you,
Shafic Kara

5

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Release all GTA documents related to the arena

From: JOE CIURRIA [mailto:

Sent: Monday, February 11, 2013 1:09 PM

To: Pettit, Martha

Subject: Release all GTA documents related to the arena

I am sending this e-mail to demand the release of all GTA documents related to the arena to the public.

Joe Ciurria

6

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: all gta reports

From: Thelma Goss
Sent: Monday, February 11, 2013 4:48 PM
To: Mayor & Councillors
Cc: Pettit, Martha
Subject: all gta reports

hello:

i am writing to ask you all to support the motion "make ALL reports related to the gta arena be made available to the public".

these reports were paid for by the taxpayers of markham and as such we should know what they contain re:the arena.

belatedly my congratulations to councillors joe li,jim jones,jack heath,valerie burke,colin campbell,and don hamilton for their votes at the 29th january meeting and their concerns for the markham taxpayer's hard earned dollars which should never be used to back private enterprise.

thank you also to those councillors who have been courteous enough to take the time to reply to a constituent.

as for the rest of you.shame on you all and especially my ward councillor,carolina moretti who doesn't even have the courtesy to respond to my e-mails.maybe i won't respond to her plea for my vote at the next election.

to m. pettit please include this as part of the agenda for the meeting 12 feb. 2013

sincerely,

w.e.goss

7

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Markham Council tonight (Tuesday) for the Arena Vote

From: David Smith
Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 9:16 AM
To: Mayor & Councillors
Cc: Pettit, Martha; boneill@yrmg.com
Subject: Fwd: Markham Council tonight (Tuesday) for the Arena Vote

Markham mayor and councillors

Can you please share why there is so much taxpayers dollars wasted chasing this proposal which should be privately funded, when the roads around us are inadequate and crumbling causing extensive loss in resident productivity and a huge impact on car repair and energy waste.

I would like to see how much time is devoted by council to this issue in comparison to private matter affairs. Perhaps it would make for a good story in the papers, it would at least be worth reading.

For the councillors that have voted against this proposal to publically fund the Markham arena, you have restored my confidence in democratic government, and for those that have supported it, you will not be getting my vote of confidence in the next round..

David Smith

Hau, Lucy

8

Subject: FW: Markham Arena

From: bmok
Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 10:59 AM
To: Pettit, Martha
Cc: Anke Chan
Subject: Markham Arena

I am a long time Markham resident and is very uncomfortable for taxpayer to support the Markham Arena. There are a lot of reports and documents not release to Markham taxpayers. They includes Miller Thomson Slide Deck, KPMG reports, Weir Foulds - client-privileged communication, BDR - sensitivity analysis,.. and more. I urged to release these information to public for review in order to come up a fair decision.

BEN MOK

②

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Markham Arena

From: Roger Shoreman
Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 11:13 AM
To: Pettit, Martha
Subject: Markham Arena

Dear Sirs,

I am going to try and be there tonight, but I would like to add support for the motion for the release of the reports on the Markham Arena.

I am absolutely opposed to this Arena (which has no NHL commitment) proceeding on a partially publicly funded basis.

Many of my neighbors share this view.

The fact that there is no reference to it on the Markham City website (link goes to "Building Markham's Future Together", which makes no reference to it), and no reference to it in Mr. Scarpitti's Inaugural address indicates a secrecy that is most concerning.

There is a massive opposition to this Arena, and Council is going to be made aware of it as the groundswell builds. They certainly will in the next election if they continue on their foolhardy path.

Roger Shoreman

(12)

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: NHL-Ready Arena project

From: Tony Hsiung
Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 11:43 AM
To: Mayor & Councillors; Pettit, Martha
Cc:
Subject: Fw: NHL-Ready Arena project

To, Mayor Scarpitti, City Councillors and Acting Clerk,

I am forwarding you the email that I sent January 29, 2013.

I would like to request, that a copy of this email be attached to the agenda for February 12th, 2013.

Thank you.

Best regards,
Tony Hsiung, Chartered Accountant

----- Original Message -----

From: Tony Hsiung
To: mayor&councillors@markham.ca ; shuycke@markham.ca
Cc:
Sent: January 29, 2013 10:52 AM
Subject: NHL-Ready Arena project

To, Mayor Scarpitti, City Councillors and Acting Clerk,

As a Markham taxpayer, I do not want my tax dollars to benefit private businessmen.

I urge the Mayor and City Councillors **NOT** to proceed with the proposed NHL-Ready arena project by using Taxpayer dollars.

The arena must be **privately** owned, operated and funded.

Thank you.

Best regards,
Tony Hsiung, Chartered Accountant

Release ALL of the GTA arena reports!



Mayor, Councillors and fellow taxpayers...

For months now some of you have called us, 'a small vocal minority' spouting incorrect information regarding the proposed NHL-sized arena. While we have done our own due diligence, we have not been privy to all of the 'secret' reports that staff or council has. So, if you expect public buy-in, it behoves you to vote tonight to release all of the taxpayer-funded documents that have been under lock and key and without public scrutiny.

I read an interesting article in the Toronto Sun this weekend written by a city councillor in Newmarket -- Maddie Di Muccio. And, I totally agree with her perspective and the points she made. So, I have included a few snippets of her article here.

She writes, "But can Markham afford it?...In their efforts to sell the dream of an NHL franchise to local residents, politicians are ignoring the fiscal realities of sports teams and the history behind them. While some insist professional hockey is a golden opportunity for our region, let's look at the track record of the NHL."

Writing in Forbes magazine in September, 2012, Kurt Bandenhausen points out that only three of the 30 NHL teams are actually successful. Many are losing millions of dollars each year.

A January 29, 2013 article in the Huffington Post, by a Richard Ivy School of Business professor, regarding the recently passed Edmonton arena called it one the worst deals in Canadian history. Study after study shows that sports teams and arenas generate little economic benefit, Moffatt said.

Perhaps taxpayers are smarter than some mayors and councillors give us credit for?

So, Mr. Mayor and the other 6 councillors who voted to continue on this arena dream -- as a taxpayer, I want to know how you arrived at the conclusion that Markham -- even without an NHL team, will be sustainable? One of the document authors, Brad Humphreys, University of Alberta sports economist said his material was 'cherry-picked' -- what facts were left out of the 'great opportunity' equation? Do you really think that taxpayers should trust you when we hear things like 'cherry-picked'???

Interestingly 'cherry-picking' isn't a new political sport. CBC News, August 7, 2008, reports a very similar M.O. in Edmonton. The Canadian Taxpayers Federation accused city officials of hiding some important facts such as NHL arenas in Vancouver, Ottawa, Montreal, and Toronto were built with private financing alone.

Humphreys isn't surprised that the report was edited, he states "They're going to spin it in the best light possible. It's sort of like a piece of propaganda, I think. That's the way to think about it.

Release ALL of the GTA arena reports!

It's not the whole truth. There is useful information in there, but there's also information that should be out there that's omitted — just like any other propaganda piece that you might expect out of people that are seeking taxpayer dollars that is primarily going to be used by private enterprise."

I think it is admirable that the mayor and council want to bring jobs and money to Markham -- IBM, Honda, American Express, etc. I say great job, well-done. However, this is a whole different animal and I am not a gambler and certainly not with a debt of hundreds of millions of dollars that taxpayers have an excellent chance of inheriting.

Respectfully, I do not believe that any of you, nor your staff, have the business acumen to tackle a project of this size and complexity. The public sector and the private sector are polar opposites -- one spends taxpayer money and the other makes investor profits. A 20,000 seat arena definitely falls into the private domain sector. So councillors, why are you jumping into a shark-infested ocean when you can barely swim and don't even have access to a life-jacket -- except taxpayers pockets?

Di Muccio goes on to say, "...Today, public debt has been maxed out and taxpayers are tapped out. Markham has enough on its plate dealing with important items such as traffic congestion and delivering basic municipal services -- such as sewers I might add. The city shouldn't jeopardize these services by assuming \$325 million in public debt towards a vanity project...common sense tells me the risks far outweigh the perceived benefits...Taxpayers have enough on their hands paying for politicians' legacy projects that have no business in the work of government. These politicians won't be there forever — but their debt might. Markham should just say, "No thanks" to this deal."

And, I agree with her.

I feel that this entire arena dream has been a total waste of taxpayer time and money. Markham taxpayers have already been funding this dream for far too long. It should have been killed on January 29 or before.

Many Markham residents are very skeptical about recent happenings at the town. Secret meetings, secret reports -- zero transparency, questionable accountability. And yes, even being untruthful to taxpayers about why a meeting **had** to be in-camera yesterday. It is very sad that the mayor, solicitor, and senior staff choose to be untruthful -- is it because in-camera sessions should in fact be open to the public? I challenge each councillor -- the next time a meeting is in-camera, and you feel that there is no justification for it to be so -- that you make your feelings heard -- and refuse to participate unless and until it is made public. I believe we have enough good councillors who will use their own minds on what is right and what is wrong and very quickly these phantom in-camera meetings will become few and far between -- just as they were intended to be. Councillors, I know that you have the strength to make it right and so I will be counting on you...

Release ALL of the GTA arena reports!

Markham needs a representative democracy where we, the taxpayers, have a right to be involved in decisions that affect us, that we are treated with respect, honesty and integrity and finally, that we are given the opportunity to be involved in more decision-making processes with access to documentation -- such as the \$500,000 plus reports that may help clarify our 'incorrect information'.

Markham needs to eliminate the secrets and seemingly limitless number of in-camera meetings under the guise of property acquisition and client/solicitor privilege.

I ask each and every councillor to allow the public to read the reports and to have the opportunity to draw their own conclusions vs speculation. If the seven of you have proof why this arena would be a good deal for the Markham taxpayers, then you should have no apprehension standing up for your constituents and voting tonight to release all of the arena reports.

Through the chair, I challenge the town solicitor to provide taxpayers with credible reasons why she has continuously recommended to council that these reports not be released to the public.

I would like to hear her response please -- after I make one last comment. I have previously been told that the solicitor does not work for the taxpayer, so then who is protecting us and our best interests???

Ms. Solicitor...

Donna Bush
Markham taxpayer

12

Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: public meeting

From: Kate Hobson

Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 3:22 PM

To: Scarpitti, Frank; Heath, Jack; Chiu, Alex; Moretti, Carolina; Hamilton, Don; Landon, Gord; Shore, Howard; Jones, Jim; Kanapathi, Logan; Burke, Valerie; Campbell, Colin; Ho, Alan; Li, Joe; Taylor, Andy; Huycke, Stephen

Subject: public meeting

Dear Mayor and Councillors,

I am in favour of the motion (Public meeting item 7 (1), on Tuesday February 12, 2013): to make all reports related to the GTA Arena public.

Sincerely,

Don and Kathy Hobson

Hau, Lucy

13

Subject: FW: Markham Council tonight (Tuesday) for the Arena Vote

From: samuel chang

Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 3:46 PM

To: Mayor & Councillors; Pettit, Martha;

Subject: Fwd: Markham Council tonight (Tuesday) for the Arena Vote

Hon. Mayor & the above mentioned, I support these issues & am definitely against the use of Taxpayer money being spent for your businessman friends benefit from the stadium. You are elected by the people & must adhere to the people's wishes, why did you support the issue. Why are you so interested in building it with taxpayer money.

Sam

Hau, Lucy

14

Subject: FW: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

Importance: High

-----Original Message-----

From: Margaret MacKenzie

Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 4:50 PM

To: Pettit, Martha

Subject: Tuesday February 12, 2013 Public Meeting item 7(1): "Made All Reports related to the GTA Arena public."

Importance: High

Please attach our letter to the agenda for this evenings meeting.

To Mayor and Councillors,

We are in favour of the motion (Public meeting item 7 (1) Tuesday, February 12, 2013): to make all reports related to the GTA Arena public.

With the release of all reports, we as taxpayers may be able to see why the Mayor and certain Councillors believe the GTA arena to be such a good deal for Markham.

Please vote YES on the above motion.

Margaret and Rod MacKenzie
Concerned residents of Markham

15
Hau, Lucy

Subject: FW: Opposed to current proposal of Markham "NHL" arena

----- Original Message -----

From: Tans

Sent: Tuesday, February 12, 2013 06:49 PM

To: Mayor & Councillors; Pettit, Martha;

Subject: Opposed to current proposal of Markham "NHL" arena

We are long-time residents of Markham Village and are opposed to the current financial structure of the proposed Markham Arena. While we would welcome an arena we do not welcome the use of our tax dollars to make it a reality. The current proposal runs the risk of being a tax burden for us residents for decades. How is that a benefit to anyone???? Let private businesses and businessmen bare the burden. In addition, please release the reports so the tax payers can be fully informed. Full transparency would be greatly appreciated.

We are unable to attend the meeting tonight but we would like this letter to be attached to the agenda for the meeting that is taking place this evening.

Sincerely,
The Perry family

Sent from my iPad