

Heritage Markham Committee Minutes

Tejinder Sidhu

Meeting Number: 10 October 9, 2024, 7:00 PM Electronic Meeting

Members Councillor Reid McAlpine, Chair Nathan Proctor

Elizabeth Wimmer, Vice-Chair

Councillor Karen Rea Lake Trevelyan
Ron Blake David Wilson
David Butterworth Vanda Vicars

Victor Huang

Regrets Councillor Keith Irish

Staff Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Rajeeth Arulanantham, Election

Planner /Committee Coordinator Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Hristina Giantsopoulos,

Planner Election/Committee Coordinator

Jennifer Evans, Legislative Coordinator

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Reid McAlpine, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:09 PM.

2. DISCLOSURE OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

The Chair, Councillor McAlpine, declared a conflict regarding item 5.5. Elizabeth Wimmer assumed the role of Chair for this item.

3. PART ONE - ADMINISTRATION

3.1 APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A. Addendum Agenda
- B. New Business from Committee Members

Moved by Vanda Vicars Seconded by David Butterworth

Recommendation:

That the October 9, 2024 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved.

Carried

3.2 MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 11, 2024 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING (16.11)

Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on September 14, 2024 be received and adopted.

Carried

4. PART TWO - DEPUTATIONS

There were deputations in relation to items 6.1 and 6.2. Please refer to the individual item for details.

5. PART THREE - CONSENT

5.1 MINOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS

DELEGATED APPROVAL BY HERITAGE SECTION STAFF 30 WILSON STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE, 2665 BUR OAK AVENUE, PART IV, 12 WISMER PLACE, PART IV (MARKHAM HERITAGE ESTATES), 158 MAIN STREET, UNIONVILLE (16.11)

File Numbers:

24 191291 HE,

24 191260 HE,

24 190856 HE,

24 192511 HE

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on the Minor Heritage Permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

5.2 BUILDING OR SIGN PERMIT APPLICATIONS

DELEGATED APPROVALS OF BUILDING/SIGN PERMITS 7770 STEELES AVE., 43 MAIN ST. N., 30 WILSON ST., 34 MAIN ST. N. (16.11)

File Numbers:

PP 24 185859,

SP 24 160774,

AL 24 186247,

SP 24 180206

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on building permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

Carried

5.3 AMENDMENTS TO DESIGNATION BY-LAWS

2977 SIXTEENTH AVENUE ("THE JONATHAN CALVERT HOUSE"), 10 ALEXANDER HUNTER PLACE ("THE JOHN IRVING CALVERT HOUSE") (16.11)

File Numbers:

n/a

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to amending the designation by-laws for 2977 Sixteenth Avenue and 10 Alexander Hunter Place to correct their Statements of Significance and to otherwise ensure conformance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as amended.

5.4 COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

UNAUTHORIZED REAR YARD STRUCTURE 16 GEORGE STREET, MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Numbers:

MNV 23 134888,

A/144/23

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham no objection from a heritage perspective and supports the variances approved by the Committee of Adjustment on July 10th related to the structure constructed in the rear yard of 16 George St.

5.5 CONDITION ASSESSMENT OF HISTORIC EXTERIOR CLADDING

25 VICTORIA AVE. UNIONVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Numbers:

SPC 22 116892

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT the Architectural Review Sub-Committee meeting notes be received.

Carried

5.6 COMMERCIAL SIGNAGE REPLACEMENT GRANT APPLICATION 34 MAIN STREET NORTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE

CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Numbers:

n/a

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the application by the owner of 34 Main St. N. to the City's Commercial Signage Replacement Grant up to a maximum of \$1,000.00 provided the applicant meets the eligibility requirements of the program.

Carried

6. PART FOUR - REGULAR

6.1 DEMOLITION PERMIT APPLICATION

FIRE DAMAGE 10 RUGGLES AVENUE, THORNHILL (LANGSTAFF) - MUNSHAW HOUSE (16.11)

File Numbers:

24 179349 DP

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner, provided a brief overview of the proposed demolition, noting that the applicant had submitted three condition assessments which all concluded that the building could not be conserved due to it being unsafe. He also provided a timeline of events including the fire that occurred on June 15, 2024, which impacted the structural integrity of the building. Staff have therefore recommended that the Committee support the demolition of the building subject to certain conditions.

The Committee heard deputations from the following concerned citizens:

Valerie Burke - who expressed support for the preservation of this heritage building.

Barry Nelson - who expressed opposition to the demolition permit application.

There was a lengthy discussion on the following:

• Whether the owner entered into a heritage agreement;

- The cultural significance of the building;
- The merits of preserving the building;
- Possible ways of dismantling the building and the preservation of components that could be incorporated into its reconstruction;
- The appropriate storage of salvaged material offsite so it could be reincorporated into the reconstruction of the Munshaw House;
- Appropriate contributions to the Markham Heritage Fund in compensation for the demolition of the building:
- The cause of the fire;
- The exploration of all restoration avenues before determining that there is no other option than demolition;
- The provision of additional photos of the building to provide a more thorough understanding of the extent of the fire damage;
- The possibility of a peer review of the engineering reports to confirm the findings of the three consultants; and
- The possible demolition/dismantling of the building with conditions.

Alex Beduz from Condor Properties, the applicant, advised that the current condition of the building poses a health and safety risk and that he is not willing to permit any further consultants to enter the building knowing that the building is at risk of collapse.

Neil Puype, Principal, Facet Group, summarized the report prepared by his firm, noting that reconstruction would require stabilization and retention of the exterior walls to facilitate the potential removal of material for salvage. He stated that the only way to safely remove the roof would be by machine and that could compromise the rest of the structure.

The Committee discussed conservation of the building as well as demolition and reconstruction with salvaged materials. The Committee ultimately recommended the demolition/dismantling of the building subject to certain conditions.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham reluctantly supports the demolition/dismantling of the Munshaw House subject to the following conditions:

- That the applicant obtains measured drawings of the building's exterior and interior as a record of the existing building and to aid in its reconstruction;
- That sound original building materials be salvaged and appropriately and safely stored offsite so that they can be incorporated into a future reconstruction of the Munshaw House on the subject property;
- That a professional heritage consultant be hired to create a plan for the dismantling and reconstruction of the Munshaw House incorporating salvaged materials;
- That the applicant provides a Letter of Credit or security of \$500,000.00 to ensure the above conditions are met;

THAT the deputations from Valerie Burke and Barry Nelson be received;

AND THAT the written correspondence from Tony and Angela Farr, Valerie Burke, Diane Berwick, Thornhill Historical Society, and Elena Cesaroni be received.

Carried

6.2 MINOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

UNAUTHORIZED INSTALLATION OF A DRIVEWAY ARCH 146 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL (16.11)

File Numbers:

24 193021 HE

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, introduced the item and indicated that the driveway arch was constructed without prior authorization from the City and that this application is for after-the-act permission.

The owner of the home, Ivy Hong, was present and stated that she was not aware of the requirement for a heritage permit as she viewed the arch as a temporary feature.

The Committee supported the application and suggested that no other additional structures be constructed. The Committee also suggested to Staff that communication be sent to owners of heritage properties reminding them of the need for a heritage permit for these types of additions/features.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the existing driveway arch at 146 John Street and that the associated Minor Heritage Permit application should be approved subject to compliance with any other municipal requirements.

Carried

6.3 MINOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

UNAUTHORIZED INSTALLATION OF A METAL ROOF 53 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL (16.11)

File Numbers:

Pending

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

The Committee supported the Staff recommendation and suggested that information be included in newsletters sent by Councillors to remind homeowners that permits are required to make exterior alterations to a heritage resource or any property within a heritage conservation district.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the installation of a metal roof at 53 John Street

Carried

7. PART FIVE - STUDIES/PROJECTS AFFECTING HERITAGE RESOURCES - UPDATES

There were no updates.

8. PART SIX - NEW BUSINESS

Councillor Rea Karen Rea suggested that an in-person meeting be planned in December for a Christmas social.

Lake Trevelyan indicated that a meeting for the 50th anniversary of Heritage Markham is planned for mid-November.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The Heritage Markham meeting adjourned at 9:30 PM.