



MEMORANDUM

TO: Heritage Markham Committee

FROM: Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

DATE: October 9, 2024

SUBJECT: **Minor Heritage Permit Application**
53 John Street, Thornhill
Unauthorized Installation of a Metal Roof

FILE: Pending

Property/Building Description: Two-storey detached dwelling constructed in c.1962 as per MPAC records

Use: Residential

Heritage Status: 53 John Street is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District (the “THCD”).

Application/Proposal

- The City has been made aware of the unauthorized installation of a metal roof at 53 John Street (the “Subject Property” or the “Property”).

Background

Context

- The Subject Property is located on the south side of John Street between Marie Court to the west and Paul Street to the east;
- The black metal roof, which replaced what appears to be a terracotta roof, generally mimics its appearance albeit in a darker colour (refer to Appendix ‘B’);
- Based on conversations with Heritage Section staff (“Staff”), it appears that the Property owner was unaware of the requirement for Heritage Permit as it was their understanding that their property didn’t have heritage status;
- The Property owner has been advised by Staff that submission of a Minor Heritage Permit application is required for the new roofing material along with any future exterior alterations to their dwelling.

Policy Context

Ontario Heritage Act

- As per Section 42(4) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, Council (or its delegate) must approve a heritage permit, with or without conditions, 90 days from the date the municipality serves notice to the applicant of receipt of the submission (regardless of whether the

alteration has already taken place). While Staff can approve a Heritage Permit (both minor and major) via delegated authority, only Council can deny a permit.

THCD Plan

- The Subject Property is identified as Class 'C' within the THCD Plan. The qualities of this property class are as follows:
 - *They are buildings/properties primarily post 1939;*
 - *They include buildings/properties that are sympathetic to the District by virtue of their scale or design qualities;*
 - *They include buildings/properties not sympathetic to the historic character of the District.*

- The two properties abutting the Subject Property are 49 John Street and 55 John Street. Both dwellings were constructed c.1949 and are identified as Class 'C' properties within the THCD Plan.

- Section 9.3.2.1 ("Contemporary Alteration Approach") of the THCD Plan provides the following guideline relevant to this application: *"Not all new roofing material is necessarily appropriate for use in a Heritage District. The use of the following roofing materials is not supported: sheet metal roofs, clay tile roofs, and plastics and other synthetics".*

Staff Comment

- Notwithstanding direction within the THCD Plan concerning appropriate roofing material for dwellings within the District, Staff do not recommend removal of the newly installed roofing material as it has been installed on a property with minimal heritage significance within the THCD. The properties immediately abutting the Subject Property are also of minimal heritage significance;
- While not ideal, the material is not sufficiently obtrusive to warrant removal (at considerable expense to the Property owner). As such, it is the opinion of Staff that the alteration does not have an adverse impact on the heritage character of the District given the building it was applied to;
- Note that this position should not be taken as broad Staff support for the installation of metal roofs within the THCD as this roofing treatment is usually reserved for accessory buildings. Applications should always be reviewed on a case-by-case basis as to their heritage impact.

Suggested Recommendation for Heritage Markham

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the installation of a metal roof at 53 John Street

OR

THAT Heritage Markham objects from a heritage perspective to the installation of a metal roof at 53 John Street

ATTACHMENTS:

Appendix 'A'	Property Map
Appendix 'B'	Photographs of the Subject Property

File Path: Q:\Development\Heritage\PROPERTY\JOHN\53

Appendix 'A'
Property Map



Property map showing the location of 53 John Street outlined in blue (Source: City of Markham)

Appendix 'B'

Photographs of the Subject Property



Primary (north) elevation of 53 John Street prior to the installation of metal roofing (Source: Google c.2024)



Primary (north) elevation of 146 John Street showing the recently installed roofing material (Source: City of Markham c.2024)