



MEMORANDUM



TO: Heritage Markham Committee

FROM: Regan Hutcheson, Manager-Heritage Planning

DATE: July 10, 2024

SUBJECT: Demolition Permit Application
10 Ruggles Avenue, Thornhill (Langstaff) - Munshaw House
Fire Damage

Property/Building Description: 1 ½ storey, frame dwelling, c. 1854
Use: Vacant building
Heritage Status: Munshaw House is individually designated pursuant to Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (By-law 2014-20)

Application:

- A demolition permit application has been submitted in response to fire damage.

Background

- On May 31, 2023, the City approved an application to expand a previously approved plan of subdivision for several properties in the Langstaff community east of Yonge Street and south of Hwy 407, and the new boundaries include the Munshaw House. Approval included changes to the conditions of draft approval to address the Munshaw House.
- The Plan of Subdivision included expanding the boundary to include the full park Block B (which includes the existing location of the Munshaw House).
- As part of the approval, Council indicated no objection to the partial demolition of the non-heritage components and foundation of the Munshaw House to facilitate its relocation to a temporary storage location pending determination of its final location.
- The Conditions of Draft Approval for the plan of subdivision contain heritage conditions to ensure the protection and conservation of the Munshaw House.
- In January 2024, Heritage Markham indicated no objection to the proposed strategy to address the conservation and incorporation of the Munshaw House through a Major Heritage Permit application as part of the future development at the School/Mixed Use Development Site located east of Romeo Park (Phase 6- 2035 to 2040).

- Preparations were underway to relocate the Munshaw House to its temporary storage location on Cedar Avenue.
- On June 15, 2024, the Munshaw House was damaged by fire.

Heritage Staff Comment

- The building is still standing and most of the damage from the fire appears to be in the east side of the interior. The Fire Department has been contacted and the investigation is ongoing as to what may have caused the fire.
- The Building Department has issued an Unsafe Building Order and in response, the owner has fenced the property and undertaken a preliminary structural review. See Appendix “D” for the LMS Engineering Inc report. The consulted provided the following recommendation:

Conclusions and Recommendations

After a visual review of the fire damaged dwelling house, the existing structural frame is in very poor condition and unsafe. The wood frame & roof deck/floor deck are at a very high risk of collapse. The wood frame can no longer maintain its structural integrity. The perimeter area around the dwelling is blocked to prevent any access due to the hazard. The fire damaged dwelling structure will require a complete demolition from the immediate potential cave-in hazard arising as result of the floor, roof, and wall collapse.

- In response to the structural investigation, the owner has applied for a demolition permit through the Building Department.
- Given the submission of the demolition permit application, this matter will be considered by Heritage Markham Committee for review/recommendation and then to Council through the Development Services Committee for a decision. Council has 90 days from submission of a complete application to render a decision on the permit.
- Heritage Planning Staff has also met with the owner and discussions are ongoing concerning the condition of the building and as to whether the building can be repaired and relocated to the storage property on Cedar Ave as originally was planned. Staff will also be attending the site with the owner prior to the Heritage Markham meeting. Staff has also discussed a possible peer review of the structural assessment or a second assessment to be undertaken by a firm known to be familiar with damaged heritage structures.
- A further update will be provided at the August Heritage Markham meeting.

Suggested Recommendation for Heritage Markham

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that all options be explored by the owner to conserve and repair the Munshaw House as opposed to pursuing demolition of the structure.

ATTACHMENTS:

Appendix 'A'	Location Map
Appendix 'B'	Aerial Photograph
Appendix 'C'	Photographs
Appendix 'D'	LMS Engineering Inc Letter

Q:\Development\Heritage\PROPERTY\RUGGLES\10\Fire June 2024\HM July 2024 fire RH PW.doc

Appendix 'A' – Location Map



(10 Ruggles Ave highlighted in yellow)

Appendix 'B' - Aerial Photograph





AERIAL PHOTO (2022)

APPLICANTS: RDG Gateway Tower One and Condor Properties Ltd.
Draft Plan of Subdivision 19TM-18006

FILE No.'s [SPC 22 247842 & PLAN 22 264894](#)

Q:\Geomatics\New Operations\2022 Agenda\SPC\SPC22_247842\Report Figures.mxd

 SUBDIVISION LANDS
 BLOCK A LANDS

DATE: 24/04/2023

Aerial Image of the subject lands with the Part-IV designated property at 10 Ruggles Avenue

Appendix 'C' - Photographs



Prior to the removal of the newer addition



After the removal of the newer addition



During the fire

Appendix 'D' – Structural Report

June 19, 2024

25 Langstaff Rd. East Development Inc.
1500 Highway 7
Concord, ON L4K 5Y4

Attention: Mr. Pat Perciasepe

Re: Building Structural Review for fire damaged Dwelling Structure
- 10 Ruggles Ave, Thornhill, ON
Our Project Number: S24-115

LMS Engineering Inc. was retained to assess the condition of a dwelling structure damaged by fire, smoke, and water. LMS Engineering Inc. visited the above noted site on June 18, 2024 to review the dwelling structure after fire damage for the above noted location. The purpose of this review is to determine if the fire occurrence would have a negative impact on the structure components of the building.

The site review of the dwelling structure condition is based on direct visible observation at the time of the review. Any structural elements which were inaccessible or covered by finishes were not reviewed and are not included in this structural review as no destructive testing was undertaken. We have enclosed photographs within this report to illustrate existing site condition.

Brief Description of Building & Observations

The subject dwelling structure is a detached two-storey house located on 10 Ruggles Ave in Thornhill, Ontario. The dwelling floor frame was constructed of conventional sawn wood framing. The exterior wall were constructed with conventional wood stud with siding finish. The roof frame was constructed with convention wood roof rafter and timber collar tie, bearing on exterior wall at each end of roof rafter.

A major fire occurred June 15th, 2024 within the East end of the building causing extensive damage to the ground floor, 2nd floor & roof. The wall stud, floor joists & roof rafter were burned off indicating that the charred wood was subject to heat from the fire. The existing wood frame is a total loss and not suitable for any structural support as a result of the heat and water damage.

Conclusions and Recommendations

After a visual review of the fire damaged dwelling house, the existing structural frame is in very poor condition and unsafe. The wood frame & roof deck/floor deck are at a very high risk of collapse. The wood frame can no longer maintain its structural integrity. The perimeter area around the dwelling is blocked to prevent any access due to the hazard. The fire damaged dwelling structure will require a complete demolition from the immediate potential cave-in hazard arising as result of the floor, roof, and wall collapse.

Limiting Conditions

The assessment provided is based on visually observed defects at a limited number of locations and our experience with similar types of buildings. Deficiencies may exist at other areas not referenced in this report or that are not visually apparent given the level of evaluation. No responsibility is therefore assumed concerning these matters, or for failure to carry out technical or engineering techniques that would be required to discover any inherent or hidden conditions of the property, since such an investigation was not included in the scope of work.

We trust this report is satisfactory and self-explanatory, however, if you have any questions or concerns please do not hesitate to call.

Sincerely,

LMS ENGINEERING INC.



Haijun Li,
M.Sc. P.Eng. BDS, LEED AP.

APPENDIX A – PHOTOGRAPHS



North side elevation



South side elevation



Wood stud wall frame @ east side (from inside & ground floor level)



Ground floor level @ north east corner of building

APPENDIX A – PHOTOGRAPHS



Roof level @north west corner of building (from 2nd floor level)



Roof rafter & collar tie (from 2nd floor level)

APPENDIX A – PHOTOGRAPHS



Wood stud wall frame @ east side (from inside & 2nd floor level)



Roof deck @ south side of building