File No.: LHC0389



January 11, 2024

Ms. Kimberly Kitteringham City Clerk City of Markham 101 Town Centre Blvd Markham, ON L3R 9W3

Sent via email: kkitteringham@markham.ca

Re: Notice of Objection for the Proposed Designation of 10737 Victoria Square Blvd under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

Dear Ms. Kitteringham:

LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc. ("LHC"), have been retained to provide heritage consulting services and advice to Gel-Don Investments Inc. (the "Owner"), the registered owner of 10737 Victoria Square Blvd (the "Property"). Please consider this letter as the Owner's objection to the proposed designation of the Property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* ("*OHA*").

The Owner plans to develop the Property and will be filing development applications for the Property in the near future. The Owner has been in discussion with City staff concerning redevelopment since 2020, with ongoing discussions into 2022 and 2023. The Property is currently listed on the Municipal Heritage Register under Section 27 of the *OHA*, but is not designated. For the reasons set out below, the Owner opposes the proposed designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the *OHA* and requests that the City not designate the Property. Further, we would request that the City withdraw its intention to designate the Property.

As part of a Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment for the development of the Property, LHC has undertaken a detailed evaluation of the cultural heritage value or interest of the Property based on the criteria outlined in *Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest* under the *OHA* and it is our professional opinion that the Property does not meet sufficient criteria to be eligible for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the *OHA*.

Kingston Office: 837 Princess Street, Suite 400 Kingston, ON K7L 1G8 (1) 613-507-7817 | (1) 833-210-7817 www.lhcheritage.com Toronto Office: 5200 Yonge Street, 2nd Floor North York, ON M2N 5P6 Ottawa Office: 135 Laurier Avenue Ottawa, ON K1P 5J2 To be eligible for designation under Part IV of the OHA, a property must satisfy a minimum of two of the nine criteria outlined in O.Reg. 9/06, which include:

- 1. The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method.
- 2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- 3. The property has design value or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
- 4. The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.
- 5. The property has historical value or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
- 7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.
- 8. The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.
- 9. The property has contextual value because it is a landmark.

Based on the research and analysis undertaken by LHC, the Property does not meet criterion 1. The circa 1872 building on the Property is a common or average example of a modest vernacular residential building. It is not representative of a particular style, type, expression, material or construction method and is not an early example of a vernacular residence in this area. Analysis of comparative examples identified a number of similar examples in Markham dating to earlier dates of construction or with a greater intensity of features demonstrating Georgian architectural influences commonly found in modest vernacular residences throughout the 19th century.

The circa 1872 residence does not demonstrate a higher than average level of craftsmanship or artistic merit, nor does it demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement. As such, it does not meet criteria 2 or 3.

The Property is associated with several families, including George and Ann Savage, Paul and Elle Schell, and Charles Dennie. A review of the history of the Property and surrounding area did not identify any **direct** associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is **significant** to the Victoria Square area or the City of Markham. As such, it does

not meet criteria 4.

LHC did not identify the Property as meeting criterion 5 for its potential to yield information contributing to an understanding of the community or a culture.

The Property was not designed/built by, nor is it associated with, an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community. As such, it does not meet criteria 6.

LHC identified the Property as satisfying criterion 7, as it is important in maintaining the character of the surrounding Victoria Square area; however, LHC is of the opinion that its remaining in its circa 1872 location does not constitute a definable historical, visual, physical, or functional link with its surroundings, and as such does not meet criteria 8.

Furthermore, the Property does not have any contextual value as a landmark. As such, it does not meet criteria 9.

Based on the foregoing, it is LHC's opinion that the Property meets only one of nine of the O.Reg. 9/06 criteria. For a property to be eligible for designation under Part IV, Section 29, it must meet a minimum of two of nine of the criteria. The Property fails to meet this statutory requirement and therefore it would not be appropriate to designate the Property under Part IV of the OHA.

Sincerely,

Christienne Uchiyama, MA CAHP

Principal | Manager, Heritage Consulting Services LHC Heritage Planning & Archaeology Inc.

Cc: Owner

Encl: Notice of Intention to Designate, dated 14 December 2023



December 14, 2023

Gel-Don Investments Inc. 206 Main Street – Unit 2 Unionville, Ontario L3R 2G9

RE: INTENTION TO DESIGNATE A PROPERTY UNDER PART IV OF THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT, SAVAGE-SCHELL-DENNIE HOUSE, 10737 VICTORIA SQUARE BLVD

To whom it may concern:

This will confirm that at a meeting held on December 13, 2023, Markham Council adopted the following resolution:

That Council state its intention to designate 10737 Victoria Square Blvd under Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in recognition of its cultural heritage significance

Please find attached the Statement of Significance which summarizes the cultural heritage value or interest of the property and provides a description of the heritage attributes of the property. Notice of objection to the notice of intention to designate the property may be served on the clerk within 30 days after the date of publication of the notice of intention on the City's website (January 13, 2024). Refer to 'Ontario Heritage Act Notices' at the link below. The notice of objection must include the reasons for the objection and all relevant facts.

https://www.markham.ca/wps/portal/home

Should you have any questions regarding the Statement of Significance or the implications of heritage designation, please contact Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, at <u>emanning@markham.ca</u>

Kimberley Kitteringham City Clerk

C. Ontario Heritage Trust

Attachment: Statement of Significance

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Savage-Schell-Dennie House

10737 Victoria Square Boulevard c.1872

The Savage-Schell-Dennie House is recommended for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> as a property of cultural heritage value or interest, as described in the following Statement of Significance.

Description of Property

The Savage-Schell-Dennie House is a one-and-a-half storey frame dwelling located on the east side of Victoria Square Boulevard in the historic community of Victoria Square. The house faces west onto Victoria Square Boulevard.

Design and Physical Value

The Savage-Schell-Dennie House has design and physical value a representative example of a modest vernacular village dwelling in the Georgian architectural tradition. The ground floor windows previously had 6/6 single hung windows, and the second floor, 6/6 windows in the north gable end and 1/1 windows in the south gable end.

Historical and Associative Value

The Savage-Schell-Dennie House has historical and associative value as representing the theme of the early development of the hamlet of Victoria Square and specifically the creation of retirement properties in village settings for former local farmers. This property is the former residence of George and Ann Savage, retired farmers from the Gormely area that first developed village Lot 23, Plan 184, in William Hingston's subdivision of 1856 in Victoria Square, and as the former home of Paul and Ellen Schell when they retired from farming north of Schell's Corners in 1882. Paul Schell was the great-grandfather of Wesley Schell, founder of Schell Lumber in Stouffville in 1922. The property has further historical and associative value for its long association with Charles Dennie, a labourer, huckster and drover that lived here from 1890 to the mid-1930s.

Contextual Value

The Savage-Schell-Dennie House has contextual value as one of a number of nineteenth century buildings that are important in defining, maintaining, and supporting the character and extent of the historic hamlet of Victoria Square. It has stood on this property since c.1872. As such, it has long-standing and significant physical, visual and historical linkages to the community of Victoria Square.

Heritage Attributes

Character-defining attributes that embody the cultural heritage value of the Savage-Schell-Dennie House are organized by their respective Ontario Regulation 9/06 criteria, as amended, below:

Heritage attributes that convey the property's design and physical value as a representative example of modest, vernacular, village dwelling in the Georgian architectural tradition:

- One-and-a-half storey, rectangular plan, western block;
- One-storey rear kitchen wing
- Wood clapboard siding that is presumed to exist below modern cladding;
- Symmetrical 3-bay façade (west elevation);
- Medium-pitched gable roof with projecting, open eaves;
- Existing flat-headed, rectangular window openings on all sides of the building;
- Centrally-placed, flat-headed, single-leaf door opening on the west or front wall.

Heritage attributes that convey the property's historical and associative value as representing the early development of the hamlet of Victoria Square, particularly the creation of retirement properties in village settings for former local farmers, and its association with Charles Dennie, a noteworthy long-term resident:

• The dwelling is a tangible reminder of the Savage, Schell and Dennie families that historically resided here.

Heritage attributes that convey the property's contextual value as a building that is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the character and extent of the hamlet of Victoria Square.

• The central location of the building facing Victoria Square Boulevard within the historic hamlet of Victoria Square.

Attributes of the property that are not considered to be of significant cultural heritage value:

- Vinyl siding;
- One-over-one contemporary window units.