

Heritage Markham Committee Minutes

Meeting Number: 8 July 12, 2023, 7:00 PM Electronic Meeting

Members Councillor Karen Rea, Chair Councillor Reid McAlpine

Lake Trevelyan, Vice-Chair

Councillor Keith Irish

Ken Davis

David Butterworth

Tejinder Sidhu

Ron Blake

Victor Huang

Regrets Nathan Proctor David Wilson

Paul Tiefenbach Elizabeth Wimmer

Staff Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Erica Alligood, Election & Committee

Planning Coordinator

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Rajeeth Arulanantham, Assistant to

Planner Council / Committee

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Karen Rea, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:04 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

2. DISCLOSURE OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

Councillor Karen Rea declared a pecuniary interest on the following items due to ongoing litigation with the landowner of the subject properties:

5.1 Minor Heritage Permit Application

Delegated Approval by Heritage Section Staff

288 Main Street North, Markham Village, 77 John Street, Thornhill, 7 Town Crier Lane, Markham Village (16.11)

5.3 Major Heritage Permit Application

Proposed New Infill Dwelling

31 Parkway Avenue, Markham Village Heritage Conservation District (16.11)

3. PART ONE - ADMINISTRATION

3.1 APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A. Addendum Agenda
- B. New Business from Committee Members

Recommendation:

That the July 12, 2023 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved.

Carried

3.2 MINUTES OF THE JUNE 14, 2023 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING (16.11)

See attached material.

Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on June 14, 2023 be received and adopted.

Carried

4. PART TWO - DEPUTATIONS

Evelin Ellison delivered a deputation on Item 5.6, Barry Nelson delivered a deputation on Item 6.1, as detailed with the respective items.

5. PART THREE - CONSENT

5.1 MINOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS

DELEGATED APPROVAL BY HERITAGE SECTION STAFF 288 MAIN STREET NORTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE, 77 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL, 7 TOWN CRIER LANE, MARKHAM VILLAGE (16.11)

File Numbers:

HE 23 125081

HE 23 128160

HE 23 128792

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Councillor Karen Rea refrained from voting due to her conflict which she disclosed. Lake Trevalyan, Vice-Chair, assumed the Chair for this item.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on the heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

Carried

5.2 BUILDING OR SIGN PERMIT APPLICATIONS

DELEGATED APPROVAL BY HERITAGE SECTION STAFF 10508 WARDEN AVENUE, 201 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE (UHCD), 4496 HWY. 7 E. (UHCD), 14 GEORGE STREET (MVHCD) (16.11)

File Numbers:

DP 23 110995

AL 23 123134

AL 23 118111

HP 22 265819

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on building and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

Carried

5.3 MAJOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

PROPOSED NEW INFILL DWELLING 31 PARKWAY AVENUE, MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Number:

HE 23 125411

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Councillor Karen Rea refrained from voting due to her conflict which she disclosed. Lake Trevalyan, Vice-Chair, assumed the Chair for this item.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the architectural design of the proposed new dwelling at 31 Parkway Avenue, and delegates final review of any application necessary to permit its construction to the City, (Heritage Section) staff, provided there are no significant deviations from the design reviewed by the Committee.

Carried

5.4 MINOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

DELEGATED APPROVAL BY HERITAGE SECTION STAFF 257 CARLTON ROAD, UNIONVILLE UNIONVILLE CURLING CLUB

File Numbers:

HE 23 130451

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed recladding of the Unionville Curling Club at 257 Carlton Road.

Carried

5.5 COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

PROPOSED ADDITION AND ALTERATIONS TO A PLACE OF WORSHIP

313 MAIN STREET NORTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Numbers:

MNV 23 126491

A/117/23

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the Committee of Adjustment application to permit the expansion of the existing legal non-conforming use at 313 Main St. N. Markham Village.

AND THAT the chain link fence installed without a permit and the flashing LED lighting be investigated by Heritage Section Staff.

Carried

5.6 COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

PROPOSED REAR SUNROOM ADDITION 370 MAIN STREET NORTH, MARKHAM VILLAGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

File Numbers:

MNV 23 125799

A/116/23

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Evelin Ellison, Deputant, recommended that the glass for the windows on this property follow the Canadian Bird-Friendly guidelines. The Committee noted that as this is a one-storey building, the Bird-Friendly guidelines do not apply.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no comment on the variance application in support of the proposed rear sunroom addition to 370 Main Street North in Markham Village (MNV 23 125799, A/116/23).

Carried

6. PART FOUR - REGULAR

6.1 REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK

PROPOSED DEMOLITIONS – 2023 ROUGE NATIONAL URBAN PARK (16.11)

File Number:

n/a

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, introduced this item advising that eight buildings have been identified within the Rouge National Urban Park for demolition owing to their poor structural condition. Mr. Hutcheson advised that these are frame buildings which are currently uninhabited. Mr. Hutcheson advised that because Parks Canada is a federal body, they do not require municipal approval for the demolition of any structure on their lands, however, Parks Canada has agreed to consult with Heritage Section Staff and the Heritage Markham Committee in the interests of interjurisidictional cooperation. Mr. Hutcheson advised that any Heritage Markham recommendations will be included in a report to Council concerning the demolition of the eight properties.

Mr. Hutcheson delivered a presentation briefly describing the location, history and condition of the subject properties. Mr. Hutcheson noted that Staff asked if Parks Canada tried to market these properties and were advised that Parks Canada did advertise the availability of the properties but there wasn't sufficient interest from prospective tenants.

Barry Nelson, Deputant, representing the Thornhill Historic Society, encouraged an architectural review sub-committee to be held to make recommendations to Parks Canada with regards to the conservation of at-risk buildings within the Rouge National Urban Park. Mr. Nelson suggested that the Architectural Review Sub-committee collaborate with the Thornhill Historical Society in an effort to save some of the buildings.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

 Inquired about the time limit to make recommendations to Parks Canada related to these properties. Mr. Hutcheson advised that the recommendations would be due in August as any feedback from Heritage Markham and staff will be considered by Council in September;

- Inquired regarding the marketing strategy used by Parks Canada to
 advertise the subject properties. Mr. Hutcheson commented that it was
 previously recommended that Parks Canada develop a marketing program
 to ensure that restoring and long term tenancy of the properties would be
 feasible for interested parties, but acknowledged that there may not be
 great interest in these properties due to their poor condition;
- Asked if these properties are being considered differently than heritage
 properties within development sites outside the Park for which relocation
 is sometimes recommended. Mr. Hutcheson advised that there are
 different mechanisms available to city staff when dealing with private
 applicants that are not applicable on federally-owned properties;
- Commented that criteria should be established to evaluate the heritage significance of each of the properties, while noting that the conservation of some of the properties may not be feasible. Mr. Hutcheson noted that the Committee will often look at heritage significance while decisions based on economic feasibility are made at the Council level;
- Sought clarification if additional properties might be recommended for demolition on Parks Canada lands. Mr. Hutcheson advised that most of the other properties are tenanted and as such, it was his understanding that it is unlikely that other properties will need review;
- Inquired about the lease arrangements that were being suggested as part of the marketing strategy for the properties. Mr. Hutcheson did not confirm but advised that it was his understanding that they would be in the range of 30 or 40-year leases.

The Committee put forth the following motion:

Recommendations:

THAT this item be referred to an Architectural Review Sub-committee meeting.

THAT consideration of this item be deferred to the August Heritage Committee to allow for further discussions with Parks Canada and Graham Seaman, Director, Sustainability & Asset Management, including obtaining more information on the marketing approach.

AND THAT in the interim the Councillors on Heritage Markham engage with the local MP to further discuss.

Carried

THAT the deputation by Barry Nelson be received.

Carried

6.2 COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

86 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL PROPOSED COACH HOUSE (16.11)

File Number:

A/106/23

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, provided a summary of the Committee of Adjustment variance application for 86 John Street. Mr. Manning shared drawings of the proposal advising that the Applicant was amenable to a revised rear yard setback of 6ft as requested by Heritage Section staff. Mr. Manning advised that from a heritage design perspective, Heritage Section staff have no objection to the proposed addition and requested that further approvals be delegated to Staff.

Francis Lapointe, Deputant, advised that he had been retained by the adjacent property owner at 4 Leahill Drive to evaluate the Minor Variance application, and outlined his concerns to the Committee about the impact of the proposal on adjacent properties. Mr. Lapointe commented that the proposal was inaccurately described as a coach house, and that the scale and position of the addition was not optimal from a planning perspective. Further, Mr. Lapointe suggested that the addition would be better positioned at the northeast corner of the heritage dwelling. He also commented that the current proposal should not be considered acceptable based on his review of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Plan.

Scott Rushlow, Architect, commented that the proposed addition with a garage was sited to ensure that the heritage building remains prominent when viewed from the street and to ensure minimal impact on the surrounding neighbours.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

- Expressed concern for the survival of on-site trees, notably those adjacent to the east elevation of the proposed addition;
- Expressed concern with the scale of the addition and how it would conserve the character of the neighbourhood given its proposed size;
- Asked if other Departments have reviewed and commented on the application. Mr. Manning noted that the application was reviewed by Urban Design and Engineering staff who provided comments on tree preservation and drainage, respectively;
- Discussed deferral of the application to the Heritage Markham meeting in September to allow other City Departments to thoroughly review and comment on the application. Deferral of the Committee of Adjustment hearing was also recommended.

Recommendation:

THAT this item be heard prior to Item 6.2 to allow for deputations.

Carried

THAT consideration of this item be deferred to the September Heritage Markham Committee meeting.

AND THAT the Heritage Markham Committee request that the Committee of Adjustment also defer the hearing on this item until after Heritage Markham Committee has considered the item at its September meeting.

AND THAT the Applicant and other relevant parties meet with the local Councillor to further discuss the application.

Carried

THAT the written submissions from Francis Lapointe, representing the owner of 4 Leahill Drive and Valerie Burke be received;

AND THAT the deputation from Francis Lapointe be received.

Carried

7. PART FIVE - STUDIES/PROJECTS AFFECTING HERITAGE RESOURCES - UPDATES

There were no updates.

8. PART SIX - NEW BUSINESS

The Committee established the Architectural Review Sub-Committee (for the purpose of the Parks Canada demolition matter) to include Victor Huang, David Butterworth, Ken Davis, Councillor Reid McAlpine, and Councillor Karen Rea.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The Heritage Markham Committee adjourned at 9:00PM.