

Heritage Markham Committee Minutes

Meeting Number: 5 May 10, 2023, 7:00 PM Electronic Meeting

Members	Councillor Karen Rea, Chair	Victor Huang
	Lake Trevelyan, Vice-Chair	Nathan Proctor
	Councillor Reid McAlpine	Elizabeth Wimmer
	Councillor Keith Irish	David Butterworth
	Ken Davis	Tejinder Sidhu
Regrets	David Wilson Ron Blake	Paul Tiefenbach
Staff	Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner	Erica Alligood, Election & Committee Coordinator Jennifer Evans, Legislative Coordinator

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Karen Rea, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:04 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

2. DISCLOSURE OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

There were no disclosures of pecuniary interest.

3. PART ONE - ADMINISTRATION

3.1 APPROVAL OF AGENDA (16.11)

- A. Addendum Agenda
- B. New Business from Committee Members

Regan Hutcheson noted that the Planning Staff expected to attend the meeting to present on Item 4.1 were no longer available and not in attendance.

Recommendation:

That the May 10, 2023 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved.

Carried

3.2 MINUTES OF THE APRIL 12, 2023 HERITAGE MARKHAM COMMITTEE MEETING (16.11)

See attached material.

Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on April 12, 2023 be received and adopted.

Carried

4. PART TWO - DEPUTATIONS

4.1 COMPREHENSIVE ZONING BY-LAW PROJECT

HERITAGE AREA ZONING BY-LAW ISSUES (16.11)

Extract:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

G. Day, Senior Planner, Zoning & Special Project

B. Roberts. Manager, Manager, Zoning & Special Projects

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, suggested an additional Heritage Markham Committee on Wednesday, May 17th, to hear the presentation from Planning Staff on the Comprehensive Zoning By-law Project, as they were not able to be in attendance for this meeting. The presentation would be scoped to explain how the proposed zoning provisions address comments previously provided by the Heritage Markham Committee.

Recommendation:

THAT this item be deferred to an additional Heritage Markham Committee meeting on Wednesday, May 17, 2023, at 7PM.

Carried

5. PART THREE - CONSENT

5.1 BUILDING OR SIGN PERMIT APPLICATIONS

DELEGATED APPROVAL BY HERITAGE SECTION STAFF 3 VICTORIA LANE (UHCD), 141 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE (UHCD), 116 MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE (UHCD), 107 MAIN ST. N. (MVHCD) (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: HP 23 115434 NH 23 114972 HP 21104546 SP 22 266996

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Markham receive the information on building and sign permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

Carried

5.2 MAJOR HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATION

PROPOSED ONE-STOREY REAR ADDITION 35 WALES AVENUE (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: 23 115841 HE

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed one-storey addition as detailed in the Major Heritage Permit application submitted for 35 Wales Avenue.

Carried

5.3 ARTICLE FROM NOVAE RES URBIS

FILE NUMBER: N/A

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive as information the article titled "What Will Changes to the Heritage Act Mean for the 4,000 Properties Listed on the City's Heritage Register".

Carried

5.4 MAJOR PERMIT APPLICATION

PROPOSED DETACHED GARAGE 14 ECKARDT AVENUE, UNIONVILLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: HE 23 118813

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed design of the new garage at 14 Eckardt Avenue from a heritage perspective, and that the applicant consider locating the garage to permit the retention of existing trees;

AND THAT final review of the Major Heritage Permit application and any other development application be delegated to the City (Heritage Section) staff, provided there are no significant changes to the proposed site plan and design of the building.

Carried

5.5 REPEAL OF DESIGNATION BY-LAWS

11022 KENNEDY ROAD AND 12 IMPERIAL COLLEGE LANE (FORMERLY 9900 HWY 48)

"THE REVEREND WILLIAM JENKINS HOUSE" AND "THE WILLIAM CLARRY HOUSE" (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: N/A

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham acknowledges that the heritage resources formerly located at 11022 Kennedy Road and 12 Imperial College Lane have been demolished and has no objection from a heritage perspective to the repeal of the designation by-laws for both properties.

Carried

6. PART FOUR - REGULAR

6.1 HERITAGE PERMIT

PROPOSED STONE COATED METAL SHINGLES 7667 14TH AVENUE (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: Pending

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

The Committee consented to hear Item 6.1 following Items 6.2 and 6.3 as deputants were present at the meeting for those items.

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, introduced this item advising that it is related to a pending minor heritage permit application for 7667 14th Avenue proposing stone coated metal shingles to replace the existing asphalt shingles. Mr. Manning advised that this is a City-owned building and noted that Sustainability and Asset Management, the department responsible for maintenance of the building, identified stone-coated metal shingles as a cost-effective material with a long lifespan.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

- Noted that another City-owned facility, the Pingle House, utilized fiberglass asphalt shingles with a lifetime warranty and suggested that this option be explored;
- Noted the difference between a metal roof that appears as a metal roof and a roof with metal shingles which are designed to mimic asphalt, as is what is being proposed for this property.

Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the installation of a metal roof at 7667 14th Avenue provided that it is in a colour and configuration complementary to the building's heritage character, and that approval be granted for a future Minor Heritage Permit application via delegated authority.

Carried

6.2 PLAN OF SUBDIVISION APPLICATION

CONSERVATION OF CULTURAL HERITAGE RESOURCE MUNSHAW HOUSE, 10 RUGGLES AVE (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: 22 247842 PLAN

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage PlanningD. Brutto, Senior Planner II, West

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, advised that this item involves an application for a plan of subdivision affecting the Munshaw House, located at 10 Ruggles Avenue. Mr. Hutcheson advised that a previous application for an adjacent property was reviewed by Heritage Markham, but the City has now received an expansion of the proposed plan of subdivision. This has created the need to relocate the Munshaw House temporarily from it current location in a proposed park until a permanent location can be found. An alternative location within the current plan or the immediate area has not been identified at this time. Mr. Hutcheson advised that the Munshaw House will be relocated to a temporary storage location at 10 Cedar Avenue, before its final relocation. Mr. Hutcheson noted that the Applicant has applied for a partial demolition permit to remove the new addition from the original structure and that a Heritage Impact Assessment will be undertaken to determine the most appropriate final location.

The Committee was also informed of a prior agreement from 2014 between the Owner and the City in which the Owner agreed to not demolish the Munshaw House, but to move and restore it at no cost to the City to a location in the Langstaff Secondary Plan acceptable to both parties. Mr. Hutcheson noted that Heritage Section Staff is supportive of the proposed conservation strategy and provided an outline of Staff recommendations.

Valerie Burke, Deputant, on behalf of the Thornhill Historical Society, noted the importance of this significant heritage resource to the Langstaff community and expressed concern with the preservation of the building, requesting that the Owner provide assurance on an annual basis advising of the status of the building, given it will be in temporary storage for several years. Ms. Burke also provided feedback on the demolition of the addition, noting concerns with the previous additions to the original building which are proposed to be maintained.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

- Questioned if the City has experienced similar monitoring of the integrity of a building over a prolonged period of time. Staff confirmed that they have experience with a heritage building on the Cathedral lands which was moved to a temporary location for a period of time, before final relocation two years later. He also noted a heritage building on Highway 7 west of Donald Cousens Parkway that is currently being stored temporarily prior to its relocation in the residential subdivision. Mr. Hutcheson advised that there are various protection mechanisms within agreements.
- Expressed concerns with the current condition of the roof, noting that a roof in poor condition could lend to further degradation of the building while in temporary

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed strategy to address the conservation of the Munshaw House as part of the Draft Plan of Subdivision application (PLAN 22 264894) including the identified heritage conditions of approval;

THAT the conditions of approval require the Applicant to provide Staff with annual photographic evidence of a yearly inspection to ensure that the Munshaw House is stable, being maintained and not deteriorating;

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the partial demolition of the nonheritage components and foundation of the Munshaw House to facilitate its relocation to a temporary storage location pending determination of its final location;

THAT the Applicant ensure that the roof is in good condition, and if necessary, undertake repairs, and that the building comply with the Keep Markham Beautiful By-law including Section 8 which addresses the appropriate treatment of Vacant Heritage Buildings;

THAT the personal written submission from Valerie Burke, and the deputation from Valerie Burke on behalf of the Thornhill Historical Society be received;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the amendment of the of the existing Designation By-law (2014-20) to address any necessary revisions to the by-law including the legal description for the temporary location and the permanent location.

Carried

6.3 COMMITTEE OF ADJUSTMENT VARIANCE APPLICATION

36 JOHN STREET, THORNHILL (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: A/036/23

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, advised that that the item was a Minor Variance Application to enable the construction of a one-and-half storey rear addition and extended front veranda. Two variances concerning building depth and encroachment of the veranda into the front yard setback have been requested by the Applicant (David Lung), and will be considered by the Committee of Adjustment at a future date.

Renderings of the addition were shared with the Committee noting the complementary nature of the proposal relative to the heritage dwelling. It was noted that the Applicant worked with City staff during the early design phase to maintain on-site mature trees.

Barry Nelson, Deputant, speaking on behalf of Thornhill Historical Society, expressed support for this application as it is in line with the District Plan. Mr. Nelson commended the application as obviously separate, but complementary to the existing design. Mr. Nelson read a statement from the Thornhill Historical Society expressing general support for the application but emphasizing the birdfriendly considerations that should be incorporated into the building design.

Valerie Burke, Deputant, expressed support for this application, noting that it will be an enhancement to the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District. Ms. Burke commended the design while noting concerns with the proposed windows and the risk of bird strikes.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

- Agreed that the addition is compatible;
- Questioned if a mature tree in the rear yard would be maintained or if the shed would expand. The Applicant confirmed that the back wall of the shed will remain as is and the adjacent tree would be conserved.

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to requested variances for 36 John Street;

AND THAT the Deputations from Valerie Burke and Barry Nelson be received;

AND THAT the written submission from Valerie Burke be received;

AND FURTHER THAT future review of a Major Heritage Permit application, and any other development application required to approve the proposed development, be delegated to Heritage Section staff should the design be substantially in accordance with the drawings as appended to this memo.

Carried

7. PART FIVE - STUDIES/PROJECTS AFFECTING HERITAGE RESOURCES -UPDATES

7.1 PRIORITY DESIGNATION INFORMATION REPORT

DESIGNATION OF PRIORITY PROPERTIES LISTED ON THE CITY OF MARKHAM'S REGISTER OF PROPERTIES OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST IN RESPONSE TO BILL 23 (16.11)

FILE NUMBER:

N/a

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning E. Manning, Senior Heritage Planner

Evan Manning, Senior Heritage Planner, provided an overview of the designation program being undertaken for the next two years by Heritage Section Staff, in response to Bill 23. Mr. Manning detailed the listed properties currently recommended for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act and the criteria against which they were measured to determine whether designation was warranted.

The Committee provided the following feedback:

- Questioned if Heritage Section Staff are ever in disagreement regarding proposed designation of properties. Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, confirmed that the research reports as appended to the Staff report have been reviewed and are supportable from a Staff perspective.
- Questioned if these designations are expected to be challenged or appealed. Mr. Hutcheson advised that if designations are appealed they likely would not cite the absence of cultural heritage significance as the reason for appeal, but rather citing perceived hardships to the Owner.

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Markham receive as information the work plan developed by Heritage Section staff for the designation of priority properties in response to Bill 23;

AND THAT Heritage Markham supports designation of 5474 19th Avenue, 7822 Highway 7 East, 53 Dickson Hill, 14 Heritage Corners Lane (formerly 10062 Highway 48), 10729 Victoria Square Blvd, 10737 Victoria Square Blvd under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act based on the appended Research Reports.

Carried

7.2 PROPOSED PROVINCIAL PLANNING STATEMENT 2023 (16.11)

FILE NUMBER: N/A

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, advised that comments from a heritage perspective have been requested on on the new Provincial Planning Statement, 2023 which would replace the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020. Mr. Hutcheson provided an overview of comments and recommendations drafted by City Staff on the proposed policies that would appear to affect cultural heritage planning.

The Committee questioned if providing feedback is likely to result in changes to the proposed Provincial Planning Statement. Mr. Hutcheson could not confirm that changes would be made but noted that it is beneficial to provide comments nevertheless.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham supports the comments on the proposed Provincial Planning Statement 2023 related to the potential impact on cultural heritage resources as identified by Heritage Section staff and this be shared with Markham Council when considering its response to the Province.

Carried

7.3 ONTARIO HERITAGE CONFERENCE 2023

London, Ontario

Extracts:

R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, reminded the Committee that the 2023 Ontario Heritage Conference is upcoming in June and encouraged potential attendees.

The Committee agreed on the importance of having members attend, particularly in light of various Provincial changes to planning and heritage legislation, noting that it would be an opportunity to connect with other heritage professionals to see how they are adapting to these changes.

Recommendation:

THAT the information on the Ontario Heritage Conference be received as information;

AND THAT Heritage Markham Committee supports the attendance of citizen members Elizabeth Wimmer, Tejinder Sidhu, Victor Huang, and Lake Trevalyan at the 2023 Ontario Heritage Conference, and that members be reimbursed for registration, mileage and accommodation (if necessary) from the 2023 Heritage Markham budget (Technical Workshops-Training for Volunteers).

Carried

8. PART SIX - NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The Heritage Markham Committee adjourned at 8:41PM.