



Report to: Development Services Committee

Meeting Date: April 4, 2023

SUBJECT: Request for Demolition – Commercial Building, 147A Main Street, Unionville Heritage Conservation District, Ward 3

PREPARED BY: Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning, ext. 2080

REVIEWED BY: Stephen Lue, Senior Manager, Development, ext. 2520

RECOMMENDATION:

- 1) THAT the April 4, 2023, report titled, “Request for Demolition – Commercial Building, 147A Main Street, Unionville Heritage Conservation District, Ward 3”, be received;
- 2) THAT Council supports the proposed demolition of the Commercial Building at 147A Main Street, as per Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;
- 3) And that Staff be authorized and directed to do all things necessary to give effect to this resolution.

PURPOSE:

This report recommends that Council support the proposal by the Owner – Unionville Pastry Cafe Holdings Ltd (the “Owner”) to demolish the Commercial Building located at 147A Main Street (the “Property”) in the Unionville Heritage Conservation District (“UHCD”).

BACKGROUND:

The Owner proposes to demolish the existing 1 ½ storey metal clad commercial building on the Property that was constructed c. 1950-60 and replace it due to its poor construction

The Property is located on the east side of Main Street Unionville in the historic commercial core of the Unionville Heritage Conservation District (see Figure 1 and Appendix ‘A’). The existing building is identified as a Class ‘A’ property in the UHCD Plan, which is noted as being a property of major significance to the District and demolition is not supported. The building was originally identified as being from the 1860s and previously occupied by the Chant cabinet and furniture making shop/undertakers in 1873 and later by Edwin Dixon, renowned taxidermist in 1911.

However, based on recent physical evidence uncovered through interior alterations, it became apparent that the building was not constructed in the 19th century as originally thought, which may have led to the building being incorrectly classified as Class ‘A’. The current building was re-constructed in the mid-20th century following a fire that destroyed the earlier 19th century former shop on the Property. It appears the same footprint and overall building form were used in the c. 1959-60 replacement building, which later had faux timber framing added to the exterior.

The UHCD Plan notes that “the mid 1920’s is considered to be a dividing point in the District’s architecture between the heritage resources found in a nineteenth century village and the modern era...From the 1950’s to the late 1970’s, the buildings were typically contemporary architecture of

the period, often with little attention given to integrating with the historical village architecture”. The policies only make reference to preventing the demolition of buildings of architectural and/or historical significance.

The Heritage Markham Committee (“Heritage Markham”) reviewed the Owner’s proposal to demolish the building on the Property

As the Property is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (the “Act”), review by Heritage Markham is required and approval of Council is necessary to permit the demolition of the commercial building. Heritage Markham reviewed the demolition request of the building on March 8, 2023, and had no objection to its demolition. (see Appendix ‘B’)

OPTIONS/ DISCUSSION:

The Act requires Council to consider all demolition applications for designated properties

According to Section 42(1) of the *Act*, an owner is required to obtain a permit from the municipality to:

- 1) Alter, or permit the alteration of, any part of the property, other than the interior of any structure or building on the property.
- 2) Erect any building or structure on the property or permit the erection of such a building or structure.
- 3) Demolish or remove, or permit the demolition or removal of, any attribute of the property if the demolition or removal would affect a heritage attribute described in the heritage conservation district plan that was adopted for the heritage conservation district in a by-law registered under subsection 41 (10.1).
- 4) Demolish or remove a building or structure on the property or permit the demolition or removal of a building or structure on the property.

The Act allows Council to delegate its power to grant permits for the alteration of a property situated in a heritage conservation district to an employee or official of the municipality. Markham Council has approved such a by-law delegating its power for the approval of alterations to the Manager of Heritage Planning. However, upon consultation with Legal staff, Heritage Section staff determined that the delegation authority to approve “alterations” to staff does not include the authority to consider applications for demolition or removal, which are addressed under Part IV and V of the Act. No delegation provisions apply in such circumstances.

Therefore, all applications or requests for demolition of buildings and structures within heritage conservation districts, whether of cultural heritage value or not, must be considered by Council within 90 days of notice of receipt.

Heritage Section Staff support and recommend the proposed demolition of the building

Heritage Section staff determined that the current structure has no cultural heritage value given the new information concerning it being a replacement building from the late 1950s, and that there are no grounds to object to its demolition. A new building is proposed as part of a site plan application with the approval delegated to staff.

Process/Procedural Requirement for Demolition Requests

The following is a summary of the key process and notification requirements associated with the demolition of a building/structure in a heritage conservation district:

- Council is to consider the request for demolition within 90 days after notice of receipt is served;

- Council is to be advised by its municipal heritage committee with respect to an application to demolish or remove any building or structure;
- Council may give the applicant the permit applied for; notice that Council is refusing the permit; or the permit applied for with terms and conditions attached;
- If Council fails to make a decision within the identified time period, Council shall be deemed to have given the applicant the permit applied for;
- Notice of the Council decision is given to the owner and the owner may appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal (OLT) within 30 days.

For the purpose of this demolition request, the City acknowledges February 21, 2023, as the date of receipt for the notice of intention to demolish with the timeline expiring on May 22, 2023

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Not Applicable

HUMAN RESOURCES CONSIDERATIONS

Not Applicable

ALIGNMENT WITH STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:

Not Applicable

BUSINESS UNITS CONSULTED AND AFFECTED:

The demolition request was reviewed by Heritage Markham, Council's advisory committee on heritage matters.

RECOMMENDED BY:

Giulio Cescato, M.C.I.P., R.P.P.
Director of Planning and Urban Design

Arvin Prasad, M.C.I.P., R.P.P.
Commissioner of Development Services

FIGURES AND ATTACHMENTS:

Figure 1: Location Map

Appendix 'A': Photographs of the Building

Appendix 'B': Heritage Markham Extract of March 8, 2023

Figure 1: Location Map



City of Markham



City of Markham

Appendix 'A': Photographs of the Building



Google Maps- Streetview, October 2021- Main Street (Front- West Elevation)



Google Maps – Streetview, May 2021 East Lane (East Elevation)

Appendix B: Heritage Markham Extract of March 8, 2023

HERITAGE MARKHAM EXTRACT

Date: March 16, 2023

To: R. Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning
P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

EXTRACT CONTAINING ITEM # 6.1 OF THE THIRD HERITAGE MARKHAM
COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON MARCH 8, 2023

6.1 SITE PLAN CONTROL APPLICATION

PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND PROPOSED
NEW BUILDING

147A MAIN STREET UNIONVILLE (16.11)

FILE NUMBER:

SPC 22 264435

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner II, provided an introduction, advising that this item is related to the proposed demolition of a vacant commercial building located at 147A Main Street. Mr. Wokral advised that the subject property is located within the Unionville Heritage Conservation District as a Class A building but noted that upon further physical inspection of the building, it was apparent that most if not all of the original 19th century building was replaced after a fire in the late 1950s. Mr. Wokral advised that the current proposal includes the demolition of the existing building, following which, a new building of the same dimensions, footprint with an additional covered deck/patio would be constructed. Mr. Wokral advised that Heritage Section Staff have no objection to the proposal subject to some minor changes to the proposed design features such as window treatments, and recommended delegation of future variances of the subject property to Heritage Section Staff.

Doug Denby, Deputant, shared historical images of Unionville, including an advertisement and image from the original taxidermy shop on the subject site. Mr. Denby noted that the Tudor treatment of the replacement building in the late 1950s was likely considered appropriate for the area. He also noted his concern related to the extent of change that was being proposed for Unionville and the impact on the area's character.

Evelin Ellison, Deputant, expressed the importance of recognizing the history of the property and suggested that a plaque be placed on the site to commemorate the former uses of the current and former building.

The Committee members provided the following feedback:

- Inquired as to the suggestion that the building on the site is not original and asked for the date of reconstruction. Mr. Wokral advised that the floor joists and structure of the current building are not representative of 19th Century construction, leading Heritage Section Staff to believe the building not to be the original. Mr. Denby provided a brief history of past ownership of the building.
- Suggested that wheelchair accessibility be included in the plan.
- Suggested the removal of shutters from the proposed design and questioned the larger expanse of glass windows on the front elevation.
- Inquired as to the proposed metal roof. Mr. Wokral confirmed that metal roofs are not permitted within the Unionville Heritage Conservation District plan and advised that a standard asphalt roof would be recommended.

Recommendations:

THAT the deputation from Doug Denby and Evelin Ellison be received;

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to proposed demolition of the existing building because it has been determined that the Class 'A' identification in the District Plan was incorrect, and the existing building possesses no cultural heritage significance;

THAT Heritage Markham delegates final review of the Site Plan application for the proposed new building to the City (Heritage Section) staff with the applicant entering into a Heritage Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard heritage conditions regarding materials, colours, windows etc.;

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that a "Markham Remembered" plaque be erected on site to commemorate the former uses of the site as condition of approval;

AND THAT Heritage Markham has no comments on any required variance to permit the proposed building from a heritage perspective and delegates review of any future variance application required to permit the proposed new building to the City (Heritage Section) staff.

CARRIED