



Report to: Development Services Committee

Meeting Date: January 24th, 2022

SUBJECT: Request for Demolition of Dwelling 4638 Major Mackenzie Drive East, Ward 6 The Pingle-Brown House
File: 21 142804 DP

PREPARED BY: Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner, ext. 7955

REVEIWD BY: Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning, ext. 2080

RECOMMENDATION:

- 1) That the staff report titled “Request for Demolition of Dwelling, 4638 Major Mackenzie Drive East, Ward 6, The Pingle-Brown House, File: 21 142804 DP”, dated January 24, 2022, be received;
- 2) THAT Council has no objection to the demolition of the dwelling at 4638 Major Mackenzie Drive East, subject to the following:
 - a. The owner is to advertise the availability of heritage components for salvage prior to demolition;
 - b. The owner is to provide documentation to the City of Markham illustrating the mid-19th century building techniques used during the construction of this building obtained as part of the proposed sensitive demolition; and
 - c. The owner is to provide at its cost, an interpretative plaque designed in accordance with the requirements of the “Markham Remembered” program and to arrange its installation in a publicly visible location on the property as part of the future development.
- 3) AND THAT Staff be authorized and directed to do all things necessary to give effect to this resolution.

PURPOSE:

To recommend that Council has no objection to the demolition of the dwelling at 4638 Major Mackenzie Drive East, which is listed on the Markham Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, subject to certain conditions.

BACKGROUND:

Property and existing heritage dwelling

Property and existing heritage dwelling

The existing dwelling at 4638 Major Mackenzie Drive East is a two-storey, evolved heritage dwelling originally constructed circa 1860 added to and renovated in the late 19th to early 20th century, 1940’s, and 1970’s. A brief history of the property is attached as Appendix ‘D’.

The House occupies part of the land owned by Major Kennedy South Developments Inc. that is proposed for future residential redevelopment, and the subject of current Draft Plan of Subdivision and Zoning Amendment applications (PLAN 20 113780) that have been submitted to the City (See Appendix 'A' - Location Map and Photograph of the Dwelling). The applicant has agreed to retain two heritage dwellings as part of the overall development (10225-10227 Kennedy Road - Homer Wilson House and JB Carr Cottage) as well as help protect and preserve the Pingle Cemetery/Monument.

Property is on the Markham Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The property is listed on the Markham Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. It is not individually designated or designated as part of a heritage conservation district. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the owner of a property included in the Register shall not demolish or remove the building or permit this to occur unless the owner gives the municipality at least 60 days notice in writing of the owner's intentions.

Owner of the property seeks permission to demolish the existing heritage dwelling

The owner is seeking demolition of the existing dwelling. A formal request for demolition has been submitted to the City's Building Department (File: 21 142804 DP) and the official notice of receipt was provided on December 2, 2021.

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) prepared for the owner in 2018, by a consultant from This Land Archaeology Inc., concluded that the Pingle-Brown House did not warrant individual designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* due to its extensive remodelling, and instead recommended careful demolition to document the early 19th century building techniques, and the advertising of historic components to the public for salvage (See Appendix 'B').

Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition

At the September 8 and December 8, 2021, meetings of Heritage Markham, the Committee indicated that it has no objection to the demolition of the Pingle-Brown House subject to the formal documentation of the mid-19th century building techniques during demolition to be provided to the City, and the advertising of historic components for salvage to the public, as recommended by the owner's heritage consultant in the HIA.

OPTIONS/ DISCUSSION:

Staff undertook an assessment of the building

The Pingle Brown House is in good to fair structural conditions, but is deteriorating due to its vacant status. Site visits conducted by Heritage staff in the summer of 2021 confirmed the evolved nature of the structure, and its lack of significant architectural heritage features, culminating in staff's support for the recommendations made by the owner's heritage consultant in the HIA.

Demolition is supported

Although the house has been extensively altered over time, there is potential value in the documentation of the early construction during the demolition process, the potential salvage of historic components that would otherwise be diverted to a landfill, and the celebration of the property's history through the introduction of an interpretive plaque.

The demolition of the dwelling is supported by staff and Heritage Markham, subject to the following conditions:

- a. The owner is to advertise the availability of heritage components for salvage prior to demolition;
- b. The owner is to provide documentation to the City of Markham illustrating the mid-19th century building techniques used during the construction of this building obtained as part of the proposed sensitive demolition; and
- c. The owner is to provide at its cost, an interpretative plaque designed in accordance with the requirements of the "Markham Remembered" program and to arrange its installation in a publicly visible location on the property as part of the future development.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Not Applicable

HUMAN RESOURCES CONSIDERATIONS

Not Applicable

ALIGNMENT WITH STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:

The assessment of heritage buildings within the City aligns with the City of Markham's Strategic Priority of Managed Growth.

BUSINESS UNITS CONSULTED AND AFFECTED:

The demolition request was reviewed by Heritage Markham, Council's advisory committee on heritage matters.

RECOMMENDED BY:

Stephen Lue, M.C.I.P., R.P.P.
Senior Development Manager

Arvin Prasad, M.C.I.P., R.P.P.
Commissioner of Development Services

ATTACHMENTS:

APPENDIX 'A': Location Map and Photograph of Existing Dwelling

APPENDIX 'B': Heritage Impact Assessment Extract

APPENDIX 'C': Heritage Markham Extracts from September 8 and December 8, 2021

APPENDIX 'D': Research Report

APPENDIX 'A': LOCATION MAP PHOTOGRAPH OF EXISTING DWELLING



APPENDIX 'C': Heritage Markham Extracts from September 8 and December 8, 2021

THAT Heritage Markham supports the proposed Draft Plan of Subdivision and Zoning By-law Amendment applications at this time as they appropriately address the retention of the relevant identified cultural heritage resources;

THAT Heritage Markham recommends that the Homer Wilson House and J.P Carr Cottage be relocated to the location illustrated in the appended conceptual drawings, and that the standard heritage conditions of approval be secured (i.e. heritage easement agreement, site plan approval/restoration plan, Markham Remembered plaques, etc);

THAT Heritage Markham recommends the Pingle Cemetery area be sensitively integrated with adjacent development in a respectful manner to protect and preserve its integrity including the requirement for appropriate fencing, landscaping and a Markham Remembered plaque;

THAT Heritage Markham supports the recommendation of the CHIA report which would allow the Pingle Brown House to be deconstructed and documented during demolition to provide an opportunity to learn more about the mid-nineteenth century construction methods and materials and allow the possible salvage of building components, and that these findings would be provided to the municipality;

AND THAT final review of the Draft Plan of Subdivision and Zoning By-law Amendment, and any other development application required to approve the proposed development, be delegated to Heritage Section staff should the siting of the retained heritage resources be generally consistent with the conceptual drawings appended to this memo.

Carried

Heritage Markham Extract of December 8, 2021

THAT Heritage Markham has no objection to the demolition of Pingle-Brown House provided that the owner ensures that the building is carefully deconstructed during the demolition process to discover the evolution of the structure and provides documentation of the mid-19th century construction techniques to the City, and permits that salvage of historic building components.

Carried

APPENDIX 'D': RESEARCH REPORT

Pingle-Brown Farmhouse
Lot 21, Concession 6
4638 Major Mackenzie Drive
c.1855; Enlarged and Remodeled c.1940

Historical Background:

This two storey vernacular farmhouse is located on the west part of Markham Township Lot 21, Concession 6. George Pingle, the eldest son of the Berczy settler family of Joachim and Anna Margaretha Pingle, received the Crown patent for the full 200 acres of this lot in 1804. His father received the Crown patent for Lot 22, Concession 6, the next property to the north, in 1805.

George Pingle (1770-1852) married Maria Koepke (c.1785-1873) and raised a family on Lot 21, Concession 6. One of their sons, Jacob Henry Pingle (1817-1878), inherited the family farm after his father's death in 1852. Jacob Henry Pingle's first wife was Martha (1779-c.1847). In 1847 he remarried, his second wife being Henrietta Speas (1823-1902). According to the 1851 census, by that time George Pingle was no longer listed as residing on the property. His son, Jacob Henry Pingle and his family were farming Lot 21, Concession 6, residing in a two storey log house.

An early schoolhouse was located at the south-west corner of the Pingle farm at least as early as 1855. It was a log building that served School Section No. 11, known as the Colty Corners School after the crossroads community of that name. In 1864, a new brick schoolhouse was built on the opposite corner to replace it.

A new farmhouse had been constructed on the property by the time of the 1861 census. The Pingle residence was described as a one storey brick dwelling. There were two daughters in the family, Marcella and Alice. One of the teachers in the local school, Mary Patterson, boarded with the Pingles. By 1871, with no sons to take over the farm, Jacob

and Henrietta Pingle had moved and rented their property to tenant farmers. According to the 1871 census, Clement Casely resided there. In the both the 1881 and 1891 census returns, the property was tenanted by James Harper. In 1891, the residence was described as a one storey brick dwelling containing four rooms.

Jacob Henry Pingle died in 1878. His widow, Henrietta relocated to Toronto where she lived with Marcella Nellie McKay, one of her daughters, also a widow. In 1907, the farm was sold out of the Pingle family's ownership after a century.

In the early 20th century, the former Pingle farm had a series of owners. One of these, either George Reesor (owner from 1907-1910), Henry Arnold (owner from 1901-1912) or Edward Bewell (owner from 1912-1922) raised the one storey brick dwelling to two storeys.

The next major period of change for the house at 4638 Major Mackenze Drive East occurred under the ownership of Frank and Ila (Hastings) Brown, who purchased the property in 1937. Both Frank and Ila Brown were from Scarborough Township. They expanded and remodeled the farmhouse on the property into the form it has today. They also re-built the barn after it burned shortly after they moved to the farm. The Brown family owned the property until recent times. The owner in 2017 was Major Kennedy South Developments.

In its current form, the Pingle-Brown farmhouse is a representative example of an evolved building, containing at least three periods of development: the original one storey brick dwelling dating from c.1855, the second storey dating from c.1910, and the expansion and remodeling dating from c.1940. The Pingle-Brown farmhouse is a simple vernacular building.