



MEMORANDUM

TO: Heritage Markham Committee

FROM: George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

DATE: March 11, 2020

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR FEEDBACK Metal Shingle Roofing for New Dwelling 11 Princess Street Markham Village Heritage Conservation District

Property/Building Description:

• New dwelling at 11 Princess Street.

<u>Use</u>:

• Residential.

Heritage Status:

• Property located within the Markham Village Conservation District, Type C (nonheritage) building.

Application/Proposal:

- A new two storey dwelling has been approved through Site Plan Control application SPC 19 122591.
- A building permit has been issued for the project.
- The applicant has requested, through his designer, to substitute metal roofing for the asphalt shingles approved in the Site Plan Control application.
- Since the metal, Interlock slate-style roofing was not supported by Heritage Markham, the applicant is proposing another product. The product type that the applicant now wishes to use is "DECRA Shingle XD". A sample of the material will be available for examination at the Heritage Markham meeting.
- The approved front elevation of the new dwelling is attached.

Background:

• Metal roofing is not typical of old Markham Village.

- Metal roofing has been permitted on a case-by-case basis in Markham's four heritage conservation districts and in Markham Heritage Estates, generally for accessory buildings. Metal roofing types that have been allowed include standing seam and corrugated, galvanized metal roofing panels or sheets. A metal shingle with an asphalt-shingle look was approved for a large-scale senior's residence in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.
- In the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan, with respect to roofing materials in new construction, the Guidelines state that "Roofing materials should reflect the historical materials found in the surrounding older buildings. Wood shingles are preferred, but asphalt shingles are considered a compatible, second choice (page 42)." In the case of 11 Princess Street, the immediate context is newer houses except for 89 Main Street, a heritage dwelling with an asphalt shingle roof.
- Metal roofing is not listed among the roofing cladding materials not to be used. The prohibited materials include: tile, plastic and other synthetics (page 42).

Staff Comment:

- Metal roofing in an imitation of shingles has not typically been allowed for heritage buildings in Markham's four heritage conservation districts. The reasoning is that these products often have a bolder texture and larger size of the individual tabs than seen on traditional shingle materials.
- Based on information from the applicant, the appearance of the granular-coated metal, shingle-style roofing is quite similar to a traditional asphalt shingle roof and may be virtually indistinguishable from an asphalt roof in its appearance.
- After reviewing the above considerations, staff is of the opinion that subject to an inspection of the actual material, if Heritage Markham finds this product to closely resemble a traditional asphalt shingle roof, it be allowed as a test case for this project in the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District.

Suggested Heritage Markham Recommendation:

THAT Heritage Markham supports the substitution of granular-coated metal shingle cladding "DECRA Shingle XD" for the approved asphalt-shingle cladding for the new dwelling at 11 Princess Street in an appropriate heritage colour as determined by staff, as a test case.

File Path: Q:\Development\Heritage\PROPERTY\PRINCESS\11\HM March 11 2020.doc

