



Animal Care Committee

MINUTES

November 20, 2019

Ontario Room

5:30 PM – 7:30 PM

Members

Denielle Duncan, Chair
Janet Andrews, Vice-Chair
Dr. Esther Attard (5:55 p.m.)
Valerie Burke
Sharon Deutsh
Aviva Harari (5:50 p.m.)
Sherry Klein
Vikrum Pain
Judy Postello
Areez Remtulla
June Heather Ziola

Regrets

Bernice Royce
Shirley Lesch

Staff

Christy Lehman, Licensing & Animal Services Coordinator
John Britto, Committee Secretary (PT)

Guests and Members of the Public

Terri Daniels

Call to Order: The Animal Care Committee convened at 5:35 p.m. on Wednesday, November 20, 2019, with Denielle Duncan, Chair presiding as Chair.

Item	Discussion	Action
1. Approval of the October 16, 2019, Animal Care Committee meeting minutes	<p>The minutes of the October 16, 2019 Animal Care Committee meeting were amended as follows:</p> <p>New Business: # 3 Valerie Burke advised that a Notice of Motion will be deliberated at the</p>	

	<p>October 22, 2019, General Committee meeting regarding single-use plastics and litter.</p> <p>Moved by: Janet Andrews, Vice Chair Seconded by: Valerie Burke</p> <p>That the minutes of the October 16, 2019, Animal Care Committee meeting be approved, as amended. CARRIED</p>	
<p>2. Business arising from the Minutes</p>	<p>Janet circulated the draft email to members for their comments. The final revised email was sent to following City staff:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Commissioner of Corporate Services; 2. City Clerk; 3. Deputy City Clerk; and 4. Deputy City Clerk, By-Law Enforcement, Licensing & Regulatory Services <p>Janet Andrews, Vice Chair advised that the Deputy City Clerk, By-Law Enforcement, Licensing & Regulatory Services will be responding to the email.</p> <p>Christy Lehman, Licensing & Animal Services Coordinator advised that the new CAEC brochures were not ready. Denielle Duncan, Chair requested Christy to bring the brochures to the meeting when ready, so they are available for the various events.</p> <p>Denielle Duncan, Chair advised that she, Areez, Sharon, June, Bernice and Janet attended the Mayfair event. She further advised that jam bottles were sold, wildlife literature was distributed, and funds raised at the event.</p> <p>Valerie Burke advised that weather conditions were not very favorable at the Markham Music Festival due to high winds. Volunteers had to hold on</p>	<p>Christy to provide brochures when ready.</p>

	to the tent to prevent it from getting blown away.	
2 (a) Election of Officers	<p>As there were no nominations for the position of Chair, Denielle Duncan agreed to continue as Chair for another year.</p> <p>Valerie Burke was appointed Vice Chair.</p> <p>Judy Postello agreed to continue as Treasurer.</p> <p>Areez Remtulla was appointed Events Co-ordinator.</p>	
3 Animal Control Program Update	<p>a. <u>Cat Adoption & Education Centre</u></p> <p>Christy Lehman, Licensing & Animal Services Coordinator advised that 179 adoptions have been registered this year, thus making a grand total of 784 adoptions.</p> <p>b. <u>Barn Cat Program</u></p> <p>No update</p> <p>c. <u>By-law Review</u></p> <p>No update</p>	.
4 Events	<p>a) <u>Fundraising</u></p> <p>Judy Postello advised that \$421 was raised through the sale of jam and donations received at the Mayfair event.</p> <p>Judy further advised that \$110 was raised at the June 15 Markham Music Festival event. The weather conditions at the festival were not favourable, which may have impacted the amount of funds raised.</p> <p>The above funds were handed over to Christy Lehman, Licensing & Animal Services Coordinator.</p> <p>b) <u>Events</u></p>	

	<p>Denielle inquired if the OSPCA and Shades of Hope have events planned for 2020 as per their contractual agreements. Christy advised of the following events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • December 7-8 at Ren's Pets; • December 14, at the Thornhill Community Centre. • Adopt at the CAEC over the Holidays. • Shades of Hope Holiday Auction event in December. <p>Christy will share further information and posters when available.</p> <p>Christy further advised that a "Speaking of Wildlife" event has been planned for 2020 Spring at the Thornhill Community Centre. She will advise of the date when confirmed.</p> <p>Janet Andrews suggested that such events be organized to start around 7:00 / 7:30 p.m. to make it more convenient for residents to attend.</p> <p>Responding to a question, Christy advised that the Shades of Hope contract has been renewed for 2020. The OSPCA contract is yet to be confirmed.</p> <p>Denielle Duncan, Chair advised that the Markham Santa Claus Parade is scheduled to be held on Saturday, November 23, 2019.</p>	
5 New Business	<p>1. June Ziola was concerned there was no mention that the City of Markham owns the CAEC, and/or any acknowledgement of the City of Markham's Animal Care Committee on the OSPCA website.</p>	<p>Christy will follow-up to ensure the City of Markham is appropriately acknowledged on the OSPCA website in relation to the CAEC.</p>

	<p>Janet Andrews, Vice Chair advised that this has happened in the past as well.</p> <p>Christy Lehman, Licensing & Animal Services Coordinator advised that the OSPCA has recently upgraded their website and this could be the reason some information may not be available. She agreed to follow-up with OSPCA.</p> <p>2. The Committee discussed a recent news article with respect to Ontario Court of Appeal's decision to overturn a ruling that it is unconstitutional for the province to assign police and other investigative powers to a law enforcement agency not subject to reasonable standards of transparency and accountability.</p> <p>The judgment was an appeal of the January 2, 2019 ruling by the Justice Minister of the Superior Court of Justice in <u><i>Bogaerts v. Attorney General of Ontario</i></u>, a constitutional challenge to Ontario's provincial animal welfare laws and the way they are enforced. Previously, animal law enforcement was done primarily by the Ontario SPCA, a private charity not subject to freedom of information laws or the <i>Police Services Act</i>, unlike nearly every other law enforcement body, and funded in part by public donations.</p> <p>After the Superior Court decision, the Ontario SPCA chose to withdraw from enforcing animal protection laws in Ontario. In October, the provincial government introduced new legislation that would make animal welfare law enforcement a fully public function performed by public inspectors, no</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>longer reliant on charities and funded by charitable donations.</p> <p>Animal Justice, a national animal law organization, intervened at both levels of court to argue that transparency and accountability in law enforcement are constitutional requirements, and important to ensuring the protection of animals.</p> <p>The Court of Appeal also considered whether search and seizure powers afforded to animal welfare investigators were too broad, and upheld the Superior Court ruling that robust search and seizure powers are appropriate. In particular, the Court adopted Animal Justice's argument that search and seizure powers must be robust because animals rely on humans to protect them from distress, and cannot assist themselves.</p> <p>"The <i>Bogaerts</i> case prompted a serious public discussion about how animal welfare laws should be enforced in Ontario and beyond," said lawyer Camille Labchuk, executive director of Animal Justice. "Animal Justice's key concern was always ensuring that a robust, public, well-funded enforcement system be put into place, and the province of Ontario is moving toward such a system with <u>Bill 136</u>, the Provincial Animal Welfare Services Act. A strong enforcement system sends a signal that the government agrees with citizens that animals matter, and that ensuring their protection is an important public value."</p> <p>The Court of Appeal case was argued on October 2, 2019 in Toronto.</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>3. Denielle Duncan, Chair advised Shirley Klein to email Laura Gold, Council/Committee Coordinator in the Clerks Department, if she would like to continue on the Animal Care Committee.</p> <p>4. Denielle Duncan, Chair acknowledged the services to the Animal Care Committee provided by Janet Andrews, outgoing Vice Chair who completes her term on the Committee at the end of November 2019.</p>	
6 Date of next meeting	5:30 p.m., Wednesday, December 18, 2019.	
7 Adjournment	The Animal Care Committee adjourned at 6:15 p.m.	
