Heritage Markham Committee Meeting City of Markham October 9, 2019 Canada Room, Markham Civic Centre

Members

Graham Dewar, Chair
Maria Cerone
Ken Davis
Doug Denby
Anthony Farr
Shan Goel
Councillor Keith Irish
Councillor Reid McAlpine
David Nesbitt
Jennifer Peters-Morales
Councillor Karen Rea

Regrets

Evelin Ellison
Paul Tiefenbach

Staff

Regan Hutcheson, Manager, Heritage Planning George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner Victoria Hamilton, Committee Secretary (PT)

Graham Dewar, Chair, convened the meeting at 7:20 PM by asking for any disclosures of interest with respect to items on the agenda.

Anthony Farr disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 4 (38 Colborne Street, Thornhill HCD), by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

1. Approval of Agenda (16.11)

- A) Addendum Agenda
 - 28 Wales Avenue, Markham Village HCD
 - 28 Church Street, Markham Village HCD
 - 9286 Kennedy Road, George Hunter House
 - Proposed Changes to the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), Cultural Heritage Policy
- B) New Business from Committee Members

Recommendation:

That the October 9, 2019 Heritage Markham Committee agenda be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

2. Minutes of the September 11, 2019

Heritage Markham Committee Meeting (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

<u>Minutes</u>

Recommendation:

That the minutes of the Heritage Markham Committee meeting held on September 11, 2019 be received and adopted.

3. Demolition Permit Application,

Request for Demolition, Barn Complex, North Markham Planning District, 10988 Warden Avenue (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

Gabriel Wong, Manager of Capital Delivery & Engineering of York Region and Fang Li from Property Services, York Region advised that options for repurposing the barn were reviewed, as requested by Heritage Markham at the June 2019 Heritage Markham meeting.

A presentation was given by consultants Christienne Uchiyama of Letourneau Heritage Consulting Inc. and Ryne Cameron of Tacoma Engineers, with the findings from their heritage impact assessment, condition assessment and feasibility study. It was noted that the building was not in compliance with current Ontario Building Code standards and to bring it up to code, R. Cameron provided a high level budget figure of \$1 million. To demolish the barn and salvage elements such as the timber and rubble stone foundation to be reused by others would cost approximately \$50,000.

Discussion ensued regarding the physical state of the barn. It was noted that most vacant barns would be in a similar state of disrepair and that consideration should be given to preserve at least some of them in our community.

G. Wong confirmed that the property was intended to be used by York Region as a road maintenance facility and it would not be feasible to retain and incorporate the barn into the proposed facility.

Recommendations:

That in consideration of the findings of the condition assessment and heritage impact assessment studies undertaken on behalf of the Region of York, Heritage Markham does not oppose the demolition of the barn complex at 10988 Warden Avenue subject to the applicant agreeing to undertake the following:

1) A commitment to salvage selected elements of the barn complex to incorporate into one of the proposed new buildings on the property (such as the office) or possibly as decorative landscape features;

- 2) A commitment to advertise the availability of the barn structures/materials (that are not needed for #1) for possible re-use elsewhere to avoid the materials going to landfill; and
- 3) Agreeing through the Site Plan Control application process, to provide a Markham Remembered interpretive plaque describing the history of the site, to be installed in a visible location on the property.

And;

That a copy of the Heritage Impact Assessment be provided to the Markham Museum for their archives.

4. Heritage Permit Applications,

38 Colborne Street, Thornhill HCD,

Fred Varley Drive between Fonthill Blvd & Main Street, Unionville HCD,

175 Main Street, Unionville HCD,

88 James Scott Road, Markham Village, HCD,

328 Main Street North, Markham Village, HCD,

123 Main Street North, Markham Village, HCD,

Delegated Approvals: Heritage Permits (16.11)

File Numbers: HE 19 134345

HE 19 133732

HE 19 133736

HE 19 133344

HE 19 134351

HE 19 135201

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memorandum

Anthony Farr disclosed an interest with respect to Item # 4 (38 Colborne Street, Thornhill HCD), by nature of being the neighbour, and did not take part in the discussion of or vote on the question of the approval of this matter.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on heritage permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

5. Building Permit Application,

39 Artisan Trail, Individually Designated, Victoria Square Community, Delegated Approvals: Building Permits (16.11)

File Number: 19 129786 HP

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memorandum

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on building permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

CARRIED

6. Tree Removal Application,

15 Colborne Street, Thornhill HCD,

Delegated Approvals: Tree Removal Permits (16.11)

File Number: 19 132387 TREE

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memorandum

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the information on the tree removal permits approved by Heritage Section staff under the delegated approval process.

7. Site Plan Control Application, 123 Main Street Unionville,

Proposed Two Storey Detached Accessory Building/Garage (16.11)

File Number: SPC 19 136253

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

Recommendations:

That Heritage Markham has no objection from a heritage perspective to the proposed two storey, detached rear yard garage/accessory building provided that the second storey dormers are architecturally treated in the same manner as the dormers on the existing heritage dwelling; and,

That final review of the Site Plan application and any other development application required to permit the proposed garage/accessory building be delegated to Heritage Section staff; and further,

That the applicant enter into a Site Plan Agreement with the City containing the standard conditions regarding windows, materials colours, etc.

8. Site Plan Control Application, 4031 Sixteenth Avenue,

James McLean House/Briarwood Farm (16.11)

File Number: SPC 19 134919

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

A deputation was given by Ann Woods, a resident of Normandale Road, the neighbouring street to the property. She expressed concern regarding the heritage house being moved from its original site and inquired about the new distance between the proposed dwelling and the fence line of the Normandale Road properties, as well as the height of the proposed dwelling, noting that the Normandale homes would lose some of their privacy. She also noted that the new houses were large and not reflective of the neighbourhood. A. Woods also requested a timeline for commencing the project and during what stage the heritage house would be relocated.

Representatives of the developer, James Koutsovitis, planning consultant and Joan Burt, the architect, were present to respond to inquiries. The planning consultant clarified that the Ontario Municipal Board settlement approved the relocation of the heritage house, and advised that the height of the new houses and distance to the property line were within the commitment of the OMB decision, being less than 11 meters in height and 3 meters from the property line. The developer intends to start the work this year.

In response to queries from the Committee, Joan Burt advised that the basement depth would be 10 feet and the exterior cladding on the new addition would be brick similar to the buff brick trim on the existing heritage home and limestone with some trim.

A. Woods inquired about tree preservation. G. Duncan advised that he would connect Ms. Woods with the City planner managing the file.

Recess was taken from 8:24 p.m. to 8:32 p.m. to allow staff to find the OMB Terms of Settlement in the file.

Staff advised that the minutes of the settlement were reviewed which included a zoning bylaw amendment with a height limitation of 11 meters and stipulations for the front, side and backyard setbacks. No stipulation was made on the size of the dwellings as long as they were within the limitations.

The Committee remarked on the heritage of the existing house and that moving it would affect its context.

Recommendations:

That Heritage Markham supports the Site Plan Control application (including the restoration plan) for the James McLean House at 4031 16th Avenue from a heritage perspective subject to the applicant entering into a Site Plan Agreement containing the usual conditions relating to colours, materials, etc. and the following:

- The above ground exposed foundation of the heritage building is to be faced with existing fieldstone attached to the new concrete block foundation walls(as proposed), but the fieldstone treatment should be inset in line with the brick above so that it does not protrude;
- The above ground exposed foundation of the relocated heritage building should generally reflect the existing condition;
- The side veranda and front porch features should be relocated intact with the building; and,

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the removal of the later east side addition and the later rear addition.

9. Zoning By-Law Amendment Application,

Plan of Subdivision,

3151 Elgin Mills Road East, Berczy Glen/Victoria Square Community,

Thomas Frisby Jr. House (16.11)

File Number: ZA/SU 18 181743

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

S. Kitagawa, Project Manager

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He noted that this was a positive instance of maintaining a heritage house on its original property.

Recommendations:

That Heritage Markham supports the revised Mattamy-Roman draft plan of subdivision, which includes the retention of the Thomas Frisby Jr. House on its original site; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends that the standard Heritage Conditions of Draft Approval be included in the approval of the Mattamy-Roman Draft Plan of Subdivision application; and further,

That Heritage Markham has no comment on the Mattamy-Rinas draft plan of subdivision, which does not contain any built cultural heritage resources.

10. Special Events,

Doors Open Markham 2019 Event Report (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and noted that the event was a success, with the greatest number of visits since inception in 2003.

Appointment of a Heritage Markham representative to the organizing committee was deferred to the November 2019 Heritage Markham meeting.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham receive the staff memorandum about the 2019 Doors Open Markham event.

11. Committee of Adjustment Variance Application, Minor Variance Application,

272 Main Street North Markham Village, HDC (16.11)

File Number: A/105/109

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

J. Leung, Secretary-Treasurer, Committee of Adjustment

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo, noting that the garage in the rear yard had 5 bays and was likely used for business operation in the past.

The Committee expressed concern regarding the existing pavement of the rear yard. G. Duncan advised that a comment would be put in the staff report.

The Committee proposed an amendment to the Staff recommendation – that Heritage Markham recommends that some of the hard surface landscaping in the rear yard be removed and replaced with soft landscaping.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no comments regarding the application to legalize the existing second residential unit in the dwelling at 272 Main Street North, Markham Village; and

That Heritage Markham recommends that a portion of the hard landscaping in the rear yard be removed and replaced with soft landscaping.

12. Heritage Designation,

7482 Highway 7, Cornell Community Heritage Designation, William Reynolds House (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

George Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham recommends that staff contact the property owner of 7482 Highway 7 to advise them of the committee's interest in recommending this property for designation under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u>, and to ask the owner to re-tenant the building to help keep it secure; and,

That Heritage Markham supports the preparation of a Statement of Significance to use in a future heritage designation by-law; and further,

That a recommendation to designate the property be considered by Heritage Markham after the preparation of the Statement of Significance and contact with the property owner.

13. Official Plan Amendment Application,

7739 9th Line Box Grove,

Proposed Zoning By-law Amendment to Facilitate a Future Severance and Building Lot (16.11)

File Number: PLAN 19 126535

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

A. Malik, Planner

Memorandum

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He advised that when considering a severance, it was desirable to retain a lot for the heritage house that allowed space for a future addition or amenities.

The Committee commented that the existing lot was similar in size to the neighbouring lots. Staff noted that the frontage for the heritage house lot would be created facing 14th Avenue and the width of the property would be similar to the other lots fronting on 14th Avenue.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham has no objection to the proposed By-law Amendment designed to facilitate the proposed severance of the subject property in accordance with the conceptual Site Plan prepared by Sean Toussi on June 27, 2019, and to legalize the site specific conditions of the existing heritage dwelling; and,

That Heritage Markham recommends that a Hold provision be placed on the Zoning Bylaw Amendment with a condition that the Hold provision can only be removed if the property is designated under Part IV of the <u>Ontario Heritage Act</u> and subject to a Heritage Conservation Easement agreement with the City.

14. Consideration of Markham Remembered Plaques for Economic/Industrial, Heritage Sites (16.11)

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

G. Duncan, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

Councillor McAlpine requested that this matter be placed on the agendafor discussion to consider the commemoration of Markham's economic/industrial history.

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning, addressed the Committee and noted that the current budget for Heritage Markham included the cost of two (2) plaques, however, if supported this work would have to be incorporated into staff's 2019/2020 work program and may take a number of months to complete.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham Committee requests staff to undertake the necessary research to prepare the materials for two City-sponsored Markham Remembered plaques for the former site of the Massey Ferguson Research Farm and Romandale Farms.

15. Site Plan Control Application,

28 Wales Avenue, Markham Village HCD (16.11)

File Number: SC 18 232302

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner

Memorandum

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo. He stated that consideration should be given to the precedent being set if the Committee supported an amendment to the condition of the Site Plan Agreement.

Ms. H. Cotterill, owner of 28 Wales Avenue, was in attendance and advised that she would prefer to treat the posts with a stain rather than paint them. In response to inquiries from the Committee, she stated that the posts were structural support posts and were 8"x8" in size. It was suggested that the existing posts could be retained with appropriate decorative elements added to them to reflect a more traditional approach.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham does not support the existing porch posts on the addition to the house at 28 Wales Avenue, and recommends that the design of the posts be based on historic Markham examples and finished with an appropriate solid colour paint or stain as specified in the owners Site Plan Agreement with the City and in accordance with the guidelines regarding painting contained in the Markham Village Heritage Conservation District Plan.

16. Committee of Adjustment Variance Application,28 Church Street, Markham Village HCDProposed Two Storey Addition (16.11)

File Number: A/92/19

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

P. Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner Justin Leung, Committee of Adjustment

Memorandum

Peter Wokral, Senior Heritage Planner, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo.

The applicant, Mr. Ken Wong, was in attendance.

The applicant's representative, Stefano DiGiulio of SDG Designs, was in attendance and advised of the efforts made to preserve the form and prominence of the heritage house. He also noted that the owners of the neighbouring property, 24 Church Street, provided a letter of support regarding the design and size of the proposed addition. The letter was provided to the Committee Clerk.

A deputation was made by James Therien, the owner of 32 Church Street, who expressed concern regarding the size and depth of the proposed addition.

The Committee commented that the proposed addition was not in keeping with the housing size for the heritage district and was not acceptable for the neighbourhood. Concern was expressed regarding the hard surface coverage and potential water run-off affecting the neighbouring lots.

The applicant was in attendance and requested details on what the Committee would deem acceptable. The Committee suggested building within the bylaw limits and speaking with Staff for their recommendations.

The Committee proposed an amendment to the Staff recommendation – that Heritage Markham recommends that the Applicant submit a revised proposal for Staff to review, and that the meeting with the Committee of Adjustment be deferred until a new design is submitted to Heritage Markham. Mr. DiGiulio agreed to contact the Committee of Adjustment and request a deferral.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham recommends that the Applicant submit a revised proposal for Staff to review, and that the meeting with the Committee of Adjustment be deferred until a new design is submitted to Heritage Markham.

17. Zoning By-Law Amendment Application, 9286 Kennedy Road, George Hunter House(16.11)

File Number: PLAN 19-256209

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memorandum

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning, addressed the Committee and summarized the details outlined in the memo regarding a temporary use by-law for a portable on the property.

Discussion ensued regarding the protection or maintenance of the existing heritage house to prevent further deterioration. Staff advised that the deteriorated at the rear (west side) portion could be removed as the owners had previously secured approval to remove it. If the addition was removed, the exposed wall would have to be made good to prevent water penetration.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham Committee has no comment on the zoning by-law amendment from a heritage perspective; and

That Heritage Markham Committee requests that the deteriorated rear portion of the house be removed and the exposed wall made good to be water tight and secure.

18. Information,

Proposed Changes to the Provincial Policy Statement, Cultural Heritage Policy (16.11) |

Extracts: R. Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning

Memorandum

Regan Hutcheson, Manager of Heritage Planning, addressed the Committee, summarizing the pertinent changes to heritage policies and definitions, and outlining how they may impact the Heritage Planning program in Markham.

Recommendation:

That Heritage Markham Committee receive the material on changes to the PPS as information.

CARRIED

Adjournment

The Heritage Markham Committee meeting adjourned at 10:40 PM.